City of Milwaukee



1.

2.

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

| Monday, January 10, 2022 | 3:00 PM | City Hall, Room 301-A |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| | joster@milwaukee.gov | |
| | Legislative Liaison, Jeff Osterman, 286-2262, | |
| | tim.askin@milwaukee.gov | |
| | Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712, | |
| | chatal@milwaukee.gov | |
| | Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, | |
| | lelmer@milwaukee.gov | |
| | Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456, | |
| | Matt Jarosz, Nicholas Hans Robinson and Sally Peltz | |
| | Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Rafael Garcia, | |
| | Patricia Keating Kahn, CHAIR | |

This is also a virtual meeting. Those wishing to view the proceedings are able to do so via the City Channel - Channel 25 on Spectrum Cable or on the Internet at https://city.milwaukee.gov/cityclerk/CityChannel

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Robinson Excused: 2 - Bauman, Garcia 201523 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of selected windows or mothball status at 2602 N. Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Bunny Booker. THE CHAIR Sponsors: Mr. Tim Askin said he is recommending a 6-month extension. A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson No: 0 Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia 210779 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for chimney reconstruction, and dormer re-cladding at 2640 N. Lake Drive, in North Point North Historic District, for Russell and Dorothy Case. THE CHAIR Sponsors:

Mr. Tim Askin said a neighbor noticed a roof repair contractor sign and asked if a COA had been filed. There are two issues - chimney joints are too thick and back

dormer cladding was textured Smartside. Mr. Case said the contractor ground the joints, rather than chiseled out by hand. No Smartside has been approved nor any textured material by this Commission. Staff recommends approval of the roof shingling, but denial of the chimney tuck pointing and shingling. Mr. Case said the mortar joints were like that when he purchased the house and prior work had been done before his house purchase. The joints were wide to begin with. The contractor just ground the loose joints and re-tuck pointed. There was a concrete cap prior. The dormer was shingles and the work needed to be done to be waterproof. The siding is a wood product. Chris Weaver - Rescue my Roof -Deny the tuck pointing and dormer siding A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

3. <u>211263</u> Resolution relating to a retroactive Certificate of Appropriateness for staining brick at 2422 N Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for David Griffin.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Jacqueline Drayer said the stain significantly changes the color of the home. Applicant should meet with a conservateur on how to remove this stain. Staff recommends denial and meet with a conservateur.

Owner - he put stain on the brick to retain the texture and to allow the brick to breathe. The house is a dark brown. He lives there and stained the house himself. He is willing to use a different stain.

Devin - son of the owner - owner didn't even know the house was historic; it wasn't malicious.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

4. <u>211310</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for retroactive approval of a storage shed addition at 224 E. Vine Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Glenn Givens.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Jacqueline Dryer said the shed is visible from the public right of way and the shed does not mirror the features of the house. Staff recommends denial. Mr. Givens - homeowner - these are 2 separate lots, which he owns both. Damage to the carriage house resulted in his having to move his files and he built this shed to store his files. He attached it to the carriage barn. It is not an addition. It is only 4.5 feet deep. The big problem is it's connected to the carriage barn. He needs some months to go and detach it and build a wall to separate the two. Deny and work with staff.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

5. <u>210613</u>

Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the William Spence House Number 2 at 2279 N. Summit Avenue in the 3rd Ald. District

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the commission can hold a public hearing and make a recommendation or hold this in anticipation of expanding the existing district. Atty. Tom Gartner - present for the owner - if held, they will do nothing with the houses and these houses should be included with that discussion. Water pipes ruptured as Milwaukee Water Works didn't turn off the water, as requested and ultimately the two homes will need to be demolished. Owner has agreed to extension of the temporary designation. The owners have secured the buildings and are maintaining the lawns. Andrew Holentunder - neighbor - concerned about squatters and individuals hanging around the property.

Dawn McCarthy - each house will be researched about expanding the district Held with the anticipation that DNS and HPC staff and owner's counsel will review the interior of the properties, extension of the temporary designation and all exterior work to be done with proper COA approval.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

6. <u>210617</u> Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the William Spence House Number 1 at 2275 N. Summit Avenue in the 3rd Ald. District

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the commission can hold a public hearing and make a recommendation or hold this in anticipation of expanding the existing district. Atty. Tom Gartner - present for the owner - if held, they will do nothing with the houses and these houses should be included with that discussion. Water pipes ruptured as Milwaukee Water Works didn't turn off the water, as requested and ultimately the two homes will need to be demolished. Owner has agreed to extension of the temporary designation. The owners have secured the buildings and are maintaining the lawns. Andrew Holentunder - neighbor - concerned about squatters and individuals hanging around the property.

Dawn McCarthy - each house will be researched about expanding the district Held with the anticipation that DNS and HPC staff and owner's counsel will review the interior of the properties, extension of the temporary designation and all exterior work to be done with proper COA approval.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

7. <u>211237</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for foundation excavation, basement window replacement, and other work at 2605 N. Summit Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, for James Stearns.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms Jacqueline Drayer said only the basement glass block windows are before HPC as the other requested work has been approved. Ms. Drayer recommends denial even if windows not visible from the street.

James and Agnes Stearns - owner - windows are not seen from the street or by the neighbors; they are only visible to themselves. Security bars, as recommended by staff, are also not historic and they did not approve the bars.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

8. 211393 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for general rehabilitation and an addition to the property at 1534 - 1542 N. Farwell Avenue, the Paul Weise Building, an individually designated historic property, for TFG Milwaukee IV LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this was designated in the past five years and the plan is to convert the building to apartments. The metal awning in front is from 1990. Staff has very few concerns. There are a few recommendations in the report. Dan Beyer - architect - they are willing to work with Tim on the canopy. They LOVE the idea of the glass canopy. They would like to see if the existing steel canopy is under the current one. Max Dahl - online - with the owner's group Tim is okay with a glass-top canopy.

Mr. Jarosz encouraged the owner to do a sample mock-up of the tuck pointing and work with staff to retain the unique look of this building. Grant, with attention paid to tuck pointing and work with staff on that, and with staff

recommendations, by Matt, seconded by Sally. Staff can approve the final COA.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

9. <u>211397</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs to the cornice at 135 W. Wells Street, the Germania Building, an individually designated historic property, for Germania Historic LLC and Cardinal Capital.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the top cornice line needs repairs and he has no objections except the standard masonry conditions and patching mortar should be installed over the anchors for re-installing loose pieces. Conditions are listed in his report. Jack Reichl - owner - looking forward to this. Grant, with recommendations.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

10.211398Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing and
redesigning the front entry at 135 W. Wells Street, the Germania
Building, an individually designated historic property, for Germania
Historic LLC and Cardinal Capital.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the front entry has been abused over the years and this is at least the third entry system. The owners are going to try to replicate an earlier entry with a modern interpretation of the original. Staff recommends approval as drawn. Matt moved to deny and make it more historic by working with staff. No second. Hold for one month to work with staff to make it more historic.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

11. <u>211403</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the addition to the Gymnasium (Tthigwe) Building, reconstruction of the historic north façade, and overall repairs at 3138 W. Kilbourn Avenue, in the Concordia Historic District, for the Forest County Potawatomi Community.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said there is some surviving material from the north wall. Staff noted that the demolition does not meet the criteria, but there is no architectural significance to the 1950s pool. They will salvage what brick they can from the pool. Staff finds at least 4 of the 6 demolition criteria have been met and the Commission can approve the demolition if they wish. The only significant issue with the drawings is not knowing what windows survive on the north elevation and what would be done with those windows. Staff recommends approval of the demo, working with window details with staff and standard masonry conditions. Chris Hau - architect - The owners are working on native plantings. Alyson Nemec - architect - no objection to any of Tim's Ann Devitt - neighbor - what are the future plans?

Pat Beck - neighbor - what is their definition of "landscaping"

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

12.211389Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for restaurant
HVAC equipment at 322 W. State Street, in the Old World Third Street
Historic District, for Dehne Brothers.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia

13. <u>211394</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repair to trim and fascia at 3244. W McKinley Boulevard, in the Cold Spring Park Historic District, for Kandie Smith.

| | | <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR |
|-----|---------------|--|
| | | A motion was made by Matt Jarosz seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: |
| | | Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson |
| | | No: 0 |
| | | Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia |
| 14. | <u>211414</u> | Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for HVAC equipment at 2721 N. Lake Drive, in the North Lake Drive Historic District, for Ann Jacobs and Bradly Brunson. |
| | | <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR |
| | | A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: |
| | | Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson |
| | | No: 0 |
| | | Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia |
| 15. | <u>211428</u> | Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a wall sign at 720 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for Gurmukh and Harminder Singh. |
| | | <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR |
| | | A motion was made by Matt Jarosz seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: |
| | | Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson |
| | | No: 0 |
| | | Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia |
| 16. | <u>211429</u> | Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a signage at 1039 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for First Federal Bank. |
| | | <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR |
| | | A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Nicholas Hans Robinson, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: |
| | | Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, and Robinson |
| | | No: 0 |
| | | Excused: 2 - Bauman, and Garcia |

17. Review and approval of the minutes from the last meeting.

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

18. Election of a Vice Chair.

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, to hold until next month

19. Updates and announcements.

There were none.

Meeting adjourned: 5:39 P.M. Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.