

City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

Meeting Minutes

CITIZEN ANTI-DISPLACEMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Ald. Milele A. Coggs, Ald. Jose G. Perez, Ald. Russell W.
Stamper II

Dalvery Blackwell, Shear Winston, Stella Love, Christopher
Piszczek, Stephanie Mercado, luscely Flores Villarreal, Steve
Adams, James Green, Bradley Thurman

Staff Assistant: Joanna Polanco, 414-286-2366 Fax: 286-3456, jpolan@milwaukee.gov

Legislative Liaison, Christopher Hillard, 286-2170, Christopher.Hillard@milwaukee.gov

Friday, October 9, 2020 10:00 AM Virtual Meeting

https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/558987997
You can also dial in using your phone (571) 317-3122
Access Code: 558-987-997

- 1. Call to Order at 10:09 AM
- 2. Roll Call.

Present 11 - Adams, Perez, Stamper, Blackwell, Love, Winston, Piszczek, Flores Villarreal, Mercado, Green and Thurman

Excused 1 - Coggs

3. Approval of the September 11, 2020 meeting minutes.

Minutes were not approve at this meeting, since quorum was NOT established.

4. Appearance by Legislative Reference Bureau - Christopher Hillard.

a timely manner as well.

Mr. Christopher Hillard works with The Legislative Reference Bureau with the City of Milwaukee. He has undergraduate degree in political science and a Master's Degree in Urban Planning from University of Wisconsin.

Prior to working for the City of Milwaukee, which he has been working for a year now, on the Legislative Reference Bureau, he actually was a fellow at, what is now, the Wisconsin Policy Forum.

his role here, is to assist committee on any research questions, obviously, the topic this body is dealing with is a very complex one that's very multi-faceted.

Since Mr. Hillard's primary responsibilities is to the Common Council, so their requests come first, but, he also will make sure that the requests of this committee are done in

Ms. Mercado asked Mr. Hillard, how far in advance do you need to hear from us in

order to have data. Mr. Hillard responded that no less than a week's notice will be sufficient, if not sooner if possible.

5. Election of the Co-Chair (based on Common Council file Number 200746).

There were nominations open to select the Co-Chair.

Ms. Flores Villarreal was nominated and voted unanimously to being co-Chair with Mr. Adams.

There were no objections.

6. Presentation by Department of City Development relative to the report "A Place in the Neighborhood".

Mr. Samuel Leichtling from Department of City Development (DCD) discussed a power point presentation.

Three authors created this committee, Aldermen, Perez, Stamper and Coggs.

They have asked the Department of City Development to also do whatever we can to provide the body with relevant input and updates throughout the process of your work on this committee.

Representative from the planning division, housing and neighborhood development team are also present.

DCD will continue to be attendees to the committee meetings, as requested to appear to offer their input, and also report any updates.

Ms. Kate Pawasarat, from the city budget offices also present, who has been heavily involved with data analysis around changes in assessment and city neighborhoods. Also, to ensure that these issues and topics discussed are part of the City budget deliberations.

The item on the agenda today, and the alders asked us to touch on is just some history on the

anti-displacement plan that the city created back in 2018.

In November of 2017, the Common Council directed DCD to develop an anti-displacement plan.

the authors who represent the three districts adjacent to downtown Milwaukee saw the development occurring downtown and wanted to make sure that the City of Milwaukee was well prepared to help residents stay in their home in their neighborhoods, as housing prices may be increasing, due to downtown development.

DCD was directed to prepare this anti displacement plan, during a period of three months to gather planning efforts; Started by, taking stock of, a lot of neighborhood meetings at the time, around, the transit oriented development plan, some of the neighborhood planning efforts.

Department believes that as development occurs, the city needs to be proactive and using whatever tools available to make sure that we're minimizing the potential that any existing residents or neighbors, or displace to wider their communities, in addition to a traditional development goals of building the tax base, and attracting new development, we also acknowledge that anti displacement work needs to, above all else, prioritize

equity.

Equity means that as we look at displacement is, acknowledging historic and systemic racism in, how those forces have shaped the current neighborhoods. Our wealth gaps and how our neighborhoods are segregated from a wealth and racial standpoint.

Prioritizes the opportunity of groups who've been disadvantaged through those past government actions to both benefit from and gain access to the wealth building that can occur during, because of downtown development, because of development in general. These are the two goals that guided our work.

Our transit oriented Development project, were formerly partnering with historic kicking bid, the Harbor District Walker's point, Park Neighborhood Association, Mk United was also ongoing which had many partners including the Greater Milwaukee Foundation, Greater Market Committee.

Many of the neighborhood groups are adjacent to downtown. All of them were planning around how to make sure that a compound development occurs, displacement is not occurring and existing neighborhood residents benefit. At the same time, there's been a tremendous work on landlord and tenant issues.

The Common Council asked us to look specifically at the areas around downtown Milwaukee areas in black on the map, generally, it's about, Keefe Avenue on the North, around Bay River works, five points area in the North 35th Street On the South, including the near west side, the River Valley, on the West South to Beecher Street.

To summarize some very high level findings; we focused on looking at data to develop kind of consistent definitions of what gentrification displacement mean, to be able to track those things by developing a set of indicators; be able to locate those trends in Milwaukee, to best target our strategies and looked at what other cities have done both to track and monitor gentrification and displacement but also to address it through policies and programs.

There is a difference between gentrification and displacement: Gentrification often happens, as new investment is coming and the way we at least track that locally at Milwaukee, for our planning purposes, if we looked at certain neighborhoods where you're seeing a decrease in the percent of residents of color while at the same time you're seeing higher income residents move in. Subsidies and some definition don't look at color, they use race, blind definitions. However, the Council lead given Milwaukee's history, the challenges with embedded institutional racism, we need to be very conscious of race through how we look at this topic.

Housing costs are increasing; low-income households are decreasing, in any area that that's happening we need to be especially concerned about making sure that any anti displacement strategies.

We looked at a lot of other data, also, but, wanted to keep it focused on those core indicators as we talked about where gentrification and displacement are happening.

So we looked at that for every single Census tract and neighborhood throughout that greater downtown area and before I get into the specific neighborhood by neighborhood analysis, I just wanted to share a couple of the things that came out of that.

Looking at the data in the greater downtown area, the population of people of color over the last 17 or 18 years since 2000 has been going up. The neighborhoods that were on that map, the population of people of color has been actually increasing. Median household incomes have been generally flat. The number of low-income households has been growing. As property values and rents had been also generally flat, when you look at inflation, although not true in every neighborhood.

We know there are exceptions, and we'll talk about those, and those are the neighborhoods that often draw the greatest attention on this topic.

But in general, across the larger area, those are the trends we're seeing.

So where are the areas where we were seen the trends that are much more associated with gentrification displacement. The map in front of you shows the census tracts and neighborhoods in orange.

Where, you saw those two trends that were happening at the same time.

And that's, you are seeing a decrease in the population of people of color and an increase in household incomes.

And the areas that was occurring over the past 17 or 18 years before we did the plan was Brewer's hill, southern, portion of Rob, King Drive River, west neighborhood.

As well as the past, the former past area and some of the Lower East side.

Those are the neighborhoods that we were seeing the trends most significantly associated with gentrification.

How about displacement? the difference here is that these are areas that we're seeing an increase in property values above the city averages.

At the same time, the number of low-income households was going down: River West, Brewer's Hill Neighborhood, Brownsville as well as, a part of Walker's point, there was also some neighborhoods in the Lindsey Heights, Johnson's park area, that we're showing those trends.

In general, I just want to acknowledge that some of that decrease in population there was caused by the fact that there was a lot of demolition of formerly foreclosed properties that were happening at the time.

And we weren't necessarily seen some of the same market rate development you are seeing in those other neighborhoods.

So those were the trends we saw at the neighborhood level, and then, again, the citywide or the Area wide Trends.

So what does that tell us?

We used that data, and we looked at kind of what cities around the country were doing to make a set of recommendations.

The Common Council came back to us, and said, We don't want this plan to just be about data and analysis, we want a set of actionable recommendations, that makes

sense for Milwaukee that we can implement, that address, the challenges with displacement, especially in the neighborhoods where we're seeing those trends.

So, we came up with a set of 19 recommendations that fall under seven different categories and general goals.

To stress the importance of continuing to engage with residents on this displacement related issues, whether it's through community meetings, or meetings like this.

we created this plan on a very short time horizon, so we wanted to acknowledge that the plan itself wasn't the end of the discussion and that we would continue to work with residents and the council members most impacted, to engage around these issues and make sure that we are implementing strategies that are actually having impacts and addressing the needs that have been identified by residents and neighborhoods and local businesses.

We made commitments to continue to monitor the local conditions.

the data I showed earlier from the plan was the most data that was most available in 2018, But we know that these are constant changing issues.

We have made commitments to monitor that data on an ongoing basis.

An overarching set of strategies to help existing homeowners retain their homes.

And the one that we've heard about the most, is, how do you help people who are already in the neighborhood who want to stay there, whether as homeowners or renters?

The concerns that we've heard the most loudly and wanted to prioritize ourselves is concerned some residents who have been in their homes a long time, and are concerned with rising taxes or repairs that are out of their price range.

And how do we, how do we allow them to remain in their homes and address those issues?

Now, at the same time, there are a lot of renters in, both it all those neighborhoods that are at risk of displacement many of them would like to stay, and many of them would even like to stay and become owners.

So we know, especially given that, the goal of equity, as described earlier, and knowing the disparities in home ownership, if property values are going to continue to rise, how do we make sure that we're doing everything in our power?

As the city and our partners to knock down any barriers that would prevent existing neighborhood renters from becoming owners? Opportunities that would come through rising values are for people to be owners and we know that.

There's also a lot of existing affordable housing in the neighborhoods that are most at risk of displacement.

We need to make sure that those opportunities remain and the tenants who are there are able to remain in their homes, and are not vulnerable to displacement.

We also want to prioritize affordable and mixed income housing in neighborhoods where prices are going up, which means it's not just about preserving existing housing.

How do we create more affordable housing in the neighborhoods that are, understandably very desirable, people want to live near downtown? And people want to live in neighborhoods that are walk able have lots of transit opportunities, strong local businesses.

And in addition to wanting to make sure that people who are already there can continue to stay there, we want to continue to provide opportunities, as new developments occurring, that some of that development is also accessible for people across a wide range of incomes.

Then, of course, we want to do, there's another broader strategies that we want to employ to help preserve what already exist, Neighborhood character, and Build community Wealth.

Recognizing that some of the neighborhoods that we're talking about that are showing signs of risk of displacement has been long term cultural homes of our city's black and Latino communities.

I'll talk a little bit about what we've done to implement these recommendations, but I did just want to pause very quickly to talk about something else the plant acknowledged, which is that the city can't do this alone.

A lot of these recommendations will take partnership from State and Federal partners, as well non-profit and neighborhood partners.

I talked about that first set of categories, those first set of recommendations being around engaging and educating residents who are at risk of displacement.

We worked with the three authors to put out a resource flyer.

Stuff we're talking about today.

I know is very like its policy specific.

But maybe it doesn't help the average homeowner or renter wants to stay in their home; so we work to create a resource guide that could be handed out whether it's door to door or at meetings, and that's something that's been available on our website.

We also completed our transit oriented development planning process. And the reason I bring that up is because it included all of the recommendations, the anti-displacement plan, and it was adopted by council, which means that all of these anti displacement recommendations actually now have the force of law as part of our city's comprehensive plan.

So, the council has directed us all city departments to work towards them.

Then, the other thing I just want to acknowledge is the other kind of implemented recommendation around continuing to build structure and capacity to talk about this issue with residents in many ways.

Member Winston asked about data. DCD continues to update the metrics and data analysis on an ongoing basis.

And, you know, you can go in and kind of click on the map, and move it around, like, any other kind of Google Map, and look, every single neighborhood in the city, what's been happening over the last five years, and then a property by property level over the last year.

We've also made a commitment to updating the anti-displacement indicators every year.

We continue to update this to show neighborhoods that are showing no signs of displacement and gentrification which on this map are represented in red.

One of the other main recommendations that we were asked to prioritize by the Common Council was to work on programs that would assist existing residents to stay in their homes.

The Council directed us to propose a framework for an anti displacement tax fund, based on a model that was done in Atlanta.

Also did tremendous amounts of research on how Atlanta implemented a similar model given the Wisconsin Constitution, the City of Milwaukee cannot use any of our own funds to help with tax forgiveness or tax reductions.

But we were able to, through partnership with MK United Raise Funds so that residents who live in the neighborhoods that have seen the highest tax increases over the past five years are able to be eligible for a program that will actually, in some ways freeze their taxes for the next five years.

This is a program that was launched last Fall. The neighborhoods were selected because they have seen tax increases or assessment increases that have been more than 10% above city averages over the past five years and also showing other risk factors of displacement.

The only way to undo Milwaukee's appearance as having one of the highest segregation taxes in the country is to allow to see increasing values in neighborhoods where homeowners are predominantly of color. The Mayor has directed our department to being proactive and using tax increment financing to create mixed income and affordable housing opportunities. I has been the strategy used for the last few years, to support some projects.

Council members also sponsored a pretty proactive policy that makes Milwaukee one of the first cities in the country to have adopted, that supports new affordable housing developments with tax increment financing, or other city assistance, up to 20% of those units in those buildings that are going to be prioritized for existing residents of the neighborhood that are there.

Three different developments that are currently in the development pipeline will have this policy, which means as they as these new high quality, brand new affordable housing opportunities are developed in neighborhoods that are at risk of displacement, existing residents are going to be the first in many of those units.

I wanted to just touch on a few other things that came out of the anti displacement

plan that we are moving forward, and I talked about preserving the cultural, community aspect to the neighborhood.

That doesn't just mean housing.

The city was a partner in Brew City Match, which has provided significant housing resources to neighborhoods, resources, small business assistance to some of the neighborhoods that we've been discussing.

And then also, we're currently looking at the city's industrial land analysis, the industrial and analysis, which will preserve some industrial spaces, and some of the neighborhoods that have been seen pressured.

As we look at cities across the country, one of the things we've been told is that's an area where Milwaukee is ahead of the game in preserving our industrial land. Finally, Mayor Barrett's 2021 Budget Proposal include programs to help existing renters become homeowners and programs to increase community control of land and permanent afford ability. It includes Mayor Barrett's proposed budget for next year includes a total of \$6.5 million for housing, and some of those line items potential and proposed line items in that budget directly aligned to those recommendations and anti-displacement plan.

That includes, at one point four million dollars, that will be specific for down payment assistance, one point one and a half million dollars that will support limited equity, co-ops and land trusts, which were another recommendation we heard come out of many, many neighborhood discussions around tools that people would like to see us utilize to preserve permanent afford ability and quality control of land.

A million dollars contribution to the Housing Trust Fund one point three million dollars contribution to our strong Homer's Loan Program, which is a program that provides rehabilitation loans to people who are existing, low-income residents to allow them to make the repairs to stay in their homes and retain home ownership.

A member asked if historic racism had been identified.

The Common Council adopted a resolution declaring racism, a public health crisis, that had some language around, some of the causes of institutional racism. Discussion regarding if there is a budget available for this cause, will be part of the 2021 budget hearings.

The City has committed to, as part of the 2021 proposed budget, creating a new office within the Department of Administration that would focus specifically on equity and inclusion issues; so, there will be a new director level position, if the budget is approved.

Ms. Prioletta said that, the city has allocated multiple dollars in investment, tax increment financing districts in recent years to create affordable housing, and to provide funds to homeowners to stay in their homes through the Rehabilitation loan programs. DCD can bring back a detailed report as to who are the recipients of those funds.

Ald. Perez said that as part of the reason this body exist, is because council members realized that many of the community leaders have established relationships with their community, that don't feel comfortable contacting government offices. Our

undocumented community is hesitant, and until those relationships are built, and we can create that trust, it's not going to happen.

Ald. Perez continue by saying that, the Council and the committee is open to any suggestions that people have through research, talking to neighbors, residents, whatever the case may be. If there is an opportunity to take a run at creating some policy, that will help, we will do everything in our power to make it happen. Therefore, we really lean on all of you as leaders and advocates in your community to help us make sure we are trying to reach everyone that we cannot, because it is impossible. He urged members to share resources because we have some organizations doing some great things.

Questions and concerns expressed by member Winston:

Has the City of Milwaukee identified and documented the mechanisms the City used historically and systematically, displaced people.

Has the City apologized for its contribution to historic and systematic racism and its displacement practices.

what meetings has the DCD hosted and how did you inform homeowners and residents. what about the young people who want to live to be long-term.

If the plan has the power of law, then are the consequences if it is not followed. Since anti-displacement if a priority how much money has been allocated to existing homeowners.

mentioned a possible inmediate solution to stop "Black tax", by removing fees to offset tax burdens; such as water bills, DNS fines, NIght Parking or any fee or fines cost based to those at risk of displacement.

Possible topics:

Description and utilization of TIF funds and how can they be best be leverage. How can the community research the ability to impact and leverage projects that do not need anything from the city.

How do projects meet zoning requirements.

What is the involvement with the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Members agree to meet bimonthly. Therefore, next meeting will be in December 4th at 10am.

7. Meeting adjourned at 11:36AM Joanna Polanco Staff Assistant

In the event that Common Council members who are not members of this committee attend this meeting, this meeting may also simultaneously constitute a meeting of the Common Council or any of the following committees: Community and Economic Development, Finance and Personnel, Judiciary and Legislation, Licenses, Public Safety and Health, Public Works, Zoning, Neighborhoods & Development, and/or Steering and Rules. Whether a simultaneous meeting is occurring depends on whether the presence of one or more of the Common Council member results in a quorum of the Common Council or any of the above committees, and, if there is a quorum of another committee, whether any agenda items listed above involve matters within that committee's realm of authority. In the event that a simultaneous meeting is occurring, no action other than information gathering will be taken at the simultaneous meeting.

Upon reasonable notice, efforts will be made to accommodate the needs of persons with disabilities through sign language interpreters or auxiliary aids. For additional information or to request this service, contact the City Clerk's Office ADA Coordinator at 286-2998, (FAX)286-3456, (TDD)286-2025 or by writing to the Coordinator at Room 205, City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street, Milwaukee, WI 53202.

Limited parking for persons attending meetings in City Hall is available at reduced rates (5 hour limit) at the Milwaukee Center on the southwest corner of East Kilbourn and North Water Street. Parking tickets must be validated in the first floor Information Booth in City Hall.

Persons engaged in lobbying as defined in s. 305-43-4 of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances are required to register with the City Clerk's Office License Division. Registered lobbyists appearing before a Common Council committee are required to identify themselves as such. More information is available at http://city.milwaukee.gov/Lobbying.