

# City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

## **Meeting Minutes**

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Sally Peltz, CHAIR

Ald. Robert Bauman, VICE-CHAIR

Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, Patricia Keating Kahn, and Marion Clendenen-Acosta

Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456, lelmer@milwaukee.gov

Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, chatal@milwaukee.gov

Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712, tim.askin@milwaukee.gov

Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679, dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Monday, February 10, 2020

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:07 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Peltz

Excused: 1 - Keating Kahn

1. 191329

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new two-story mixed-use building at 1697 N. Marshall Street, in the Brady Street Historic District, for Beach House LLC.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Grant with conditions in the staff report.

Mr. Tim Askin said this is a vacant site on Brady Street due to a fire 20 years ago. Applicant is proposing a two-story mixed-use building with a minimal outdoor parking space and the apartment entrance off of Marshall. There are four approval criteria reviewed by staff. The siting is generally acceptable to staff and the curb cut has been minimized in regards to placement of garbage carts. He would like to see more space between the second-floor windows and the balcony railing could have more detail to add visual interest. The roofline and details conform to Brady Street. Staff recommends approval with conditions detailed in the staff report. The plans are pretty much what staff expected and asked for over the preceding two months. Yves LaPierre, Dept. of City Development, said there was a neighborhood meeting on January 13th and the reception was positive to the building and the Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development Committee approved this on Feb. 4th pending approval by this body.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following

vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

## **2**. <u>191429</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a dormer addition and window relocation at 2518 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, for Larry Bonney.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that the project is to do a kitchen remodel and add a bathroom on the second floor. Three windows on the ground floor will be affected and a new dormer added, which will be hardly visible from the street and will be an exact copy of an existing dormer. The slate from the roof will be salvaged and a membrane roof will be on the new dormer (which the current dormer has). Staff requests that a sill be retained and recess the brick infill for the one stand-alone window. It seems to meet the guidelines for alterations and additions. The staff report does detail a few conditions

John Van Rooy - the architect - they do have existing brick that matches in the garage. The architect is fine with leaving the sill in.

Approve, with staff conditions.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### **3**. 191498

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two projecting signs at 144 E. Wells Street, the Pabst Theater, an individually designated property, for Pabst Theater Foundation.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that the proposal is to erect two large, vertical marque blade signs, 7 feet deep and 27 feet tall. There was a large blade sign in the late 1920s and was removed in 1975 or 1976. The signs are large box, an homage to the original sign, but staff doesn't support the signs. There will be scrolling lights and details. Mr. Askin said the opera house signage was minimal, which this is not. Ald. Bauman noted that the Chicago opera has a huge sign on its wall announcing forthcoming attractions. Mike Kinsella - Elevated Identity, contractor - it would have open face channel letters as Turner Hall and Riverside have. The P-A-B-S-T lights would scroll through the letters. The scrolling and chasing lights can be turned off or slowed down if it becomes an issue.

Ald. Bauman has no objection to the two proposed signs. Staff doesn't feel a sign of this type is appropriate to a building of this type.

Mr. Jarosz sees that this type of lighting is restricted to artistic venues.

Ald. Bauman moved for approval with no conditions.

Jason Gerrill - Pabst Theater Group - they didn't want a garish sign.

Ald. Bauman thought that theatres had garish signs.

Mr. Jarosz seconded without amending.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### **4**. 191517

Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the Bryan and Mary Coughlin House at 5027 W. North Avenue in the 15th Ald. District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the nomination was submitted by the property owner, Thad Nation. This was originally a 50-acre site owned by Bryan Coughlin and this was probably the residential property for the 50 acres. In 1891, a rapid transit line was established by Captain Pabst and his cohorts from downtown to Wauwatosa, which led to rapid development in this area. Mr. Coughlin also built other residential buildings on the 50-acre parcel, but a number of those have been demolished. The house, at the time, was in the Town of Wauwatosa; the city annexed the land in 1910 and Mr. Coughlin became a concerete contractor from 1911 to 1922.

In 1945, Jerrold Peever and his wife Jeanette bought the house and he ran his perfume business out of the first floor and the second floor was used as a residence. Mr. Peever eventually married Loretta Coughlin, the single daughter of Bryan Coughlin. The property began changing owners in 1979.

Ms. Hatala said the building is a well preserved Classic Queen Anne house and retains many of its architectural details. The garage was built by William Coughlin in 1911. Staff recommends designation based upon e-5, embodiment of the distinguishing characterics of an architectural type or specimen and e-9, its unique location which represens an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community or the city.

Thad Nation - owner of the property since 2007

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

## **5**. 191520

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for mothball status at 2804 - 2810 W. Kilbourn Avenue, in the Concordia Historic District, for Sam Stair of S2M2 Real Estate.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Held at the request of the applicant.

This Resolution was HELD IN COMMITTEE

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### **6**. 191521

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the roof at 1218 E. Brady Street, in the Brady Street Historic District, for Pat Suminski.

#### Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said there are two proposals; one the applicant would like and the other staff would prefer. All of the photos are from the 1950s, although the building was built in 1913; there is no information on the roof materials. There has been metal tile in the front roof area since 1950 and the rest of the roof is asphalt shingle. There is a plain chimney, which staff is fine with its removal.

Proposal 1 is Landmark shingle with a reddish brown color for the entire roof. Staff is fine with the materials and color.

Proposal 2 is the Landmark shingles for the rear areas and new metal tile in the front in the red tones that best coordinate with the asphalt shingle.

Staff recommends allowing chimney removal and proposal 2 with the option of using the metal tile for the entire roof.

The metal tile is on the roof's front facade.

Chris Wichgers - contractor - the metal tiles are three times the cost of the shingles. Mr. Jarosz moved for approval of proposal 2, with tile on the front slope, and shingle on the rest of the roof.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### **7**. 191534

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a new house at 2387 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, for Tim Gokhman of At Terrace, LLC.

#### Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that this is the second proposed house, the middle lot, for three lots purchased from Columbia St. Mary's hospital on former hospital property. The house has metal components with wood accents and a front gable. There will be a two-car garage behind the house with a wood deck in back. The house will be a mixture of medium gray and dark gray brick; there will be a green roof with solar panels and a sun room. Staff recommends approval with conditions detailed in the staff report. The recessed corner porch is uncommon in the neighborhood, but not unprecedented. The massing is in character with the neighborhood and roofs and projections are placed to avoid a monolithic appearance. Staff is concerned about the stained wood, which is better than the initally proposed plain wood. Staff would like more horizontal divisions in the first floor windows to break them up more.

Jason Korb - Korb & Associates - the solar panels will not be visible from the street and they are dark in color. The owner would prefer not to have horizontal divisions in the front windows.

Tim Gokhman - owner - the goal was to have a classic form with modern elements. The front windows were mullioned in the past as they were unable to make large windows. The windows are the only exception that he asks.

Mr. Jarosz was fine without the horizontal lines on the front windows, as was Ms. Clendenen-Acosta and Ald. Bauman.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No. 0

VACANCY, and Keating Kahn Excused: 2 -

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

# 191492

8.

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the upper sash of four windows at 2821 E. Belleview Place, in the North Point North Historic District, for Katz Properties.

THE CHAIR Sponsors:

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### 9. 191493

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of awnings at 1015 N. 9th Street, St. Benedict the Moor Roman Catholic Church, an individually designated property, for the St. Benedict Priory.

THE CHAIR Sponsors:

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5-Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

0 No:

Excused: 2 -VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### 10. 191621

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for erecting a

fence at 2876 N. Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Amy Christensen.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

**11.** <u>191624</u> Resolution relating to a Ce

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two wall signs at 1044 N. Old World Third Street, in the Old World Third Sreet Historic District, for Jake Dehne.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

12. 191648 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacing a fence, repointing, and repairing the roof at 2933 W McKinley Boulevard, in the Cold Spring Park Historic District, for Marcus & Cheryl Switzer.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

13. 191650 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a winter entry awning at 235 E. Michigan Street, in the East Side Commercial Historic District, for Historic Milwaukee, Inc.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 -VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

#### 14. Review and approval of the minutes from the January 6th meeting.

Mr.Jarosz moved, seconded by Ald. Bauman, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

#### Updates and announcements. 15.

Mr. Askin would like to have the murals subcommittee meet prior to the March HPC meeting so that item can be on the March agenda.

Meeting adjourned: 4:43 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.