

City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Marion Clendenen-Acosta, CHAIR
Sally Peltz, VICE-CHAIR

Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, and
Patricia Keating Kahn
Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
Ielmer@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov
Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Monday, October 14, 2019

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:03 P.M.

Present: 4 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Peltz

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn

1. 190672

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for painting a mural on the masonry wall facing S. 12th Street at 1202 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Mauricio Ramirez and East Side Management, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said that the mural was painted on the masonry building, which is in a historic district. Neither HPC nor the BID approved this mural. The painting may actually damage the masonry and the entire first floor wall was painted. Staff recommended a demountable mural to preserve the masonry as well as being able to move it and have plans for future maintenance. Staff recommends denial as this is a significant change to the building itself. Staff also recommends that the city create guidelines relating to murals. The windows were also painted over and staff recommends restoring the second story windows in exchange for permitting the mural as the building has been neglected and has code violations and there are numerous vinyl windows. Ald. Bauman said that if the person is able to replace flaking paint than how can the HPC mandate the painting? Staff feels that the mural destroys the decorative brick.

Ald. Perez said that this wall is often targeted for graffiti and has been painted for a very long time.

Shlomo Shertok - Owner - he won't do anything with the second floor unless the city provides the money.

Mauricio Ramirez - artist - he wouldn't paint over untouched brick, but this brick wall has been coated over numerous times due to graffiti. He thinks Mitchell Street should

be beautiful, not an eyesore. He primed it with a vapor permeable primar prior to painting, so air can move in and out. He approached the owner this summer and painted the mural in July.

The district was made historic about 40 years ago and the owner bought this building approximately 15 years ago. The BID does support the mural.

Ald. Perez has no objection to the mural as it was already painted and the mural will not be a target for taggers. He encourages murals and there are lots of young Latino artists are coming together.

Ms. Hatala thinks murals should be addressed in the HPC Bylaws. Murals have risen and decreased over time.

Mr. Jarosz suggested hold over for a month to see how the business community feels about this mural. Seconded by Ms. Peltz.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

Roll call taken at 4:11 P.M.

Present: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, Peltz

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz

2. 190492

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two new signs over the transom at 1044 N. Old World Third Street, in the Old World Third Street Historic District, for Jake Dehne.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said this was discussed at a prior meeting and asked the applicant to revise the sign. The signage will be over the entry. There is a lucent transom with three pieces. A frame will be set in front of the transom, which will have bars to hold the two proposed signs. The applicant redesigned the sign with push-through letters and will be in front of the transom. Staff recommends approval with the bars more regular and affixed to the outside.

Rob Knauth - National Sign and Design -- the two strips cover the two mullions that divide the window into three pieces. He also tried to equally balance the two signs. There is no frame; that is molding on the transom.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

City of Milwaukee

No: 0

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

3. 190465

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repaving of the driveway with permeable pavers at 2822 E. Belleview Place, in the North Point North Historic District, for Michael Hosale.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Held at the request of the applicant as his contractor could not be present.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Keating Kahn

4. 190466

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repaving of the driveway with permeable pavers at 2604 N. Lake Drive, in the North Point North Historic District, for Michael Hosale.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Held at the request of the applicant as his contractor could not be present.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Keating Kahn

5. 190712

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a deck at 932 E. Brady Street, in the Brady Street Historic District, for Nongluk Buranabunyut of Thai-Namite.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the planters will be incorporated into the new patio and the barrels will be replaced with concrete square planters. A raised deck will be built, due to damaged, uneven, sloping concrete in the proposed deck area. The new deck will be the height of the entry step and the landing at the handicapped ramp will be cut into to allow access to the deck, which will be 7" high. The new deck will cover up the bulkhead below the windows. No detail was provided on the handrail. The proposed

deck material is a combination of wood and plastic. Staff recommends approval of the design, but require decay-resistant natural material.

Colleen Thompson - designer - the material was chosen as it is partially organic; it is plastic so it will not change color over time and will blend with the existing building color. She feels the material is very durable and easily cleaned. This material costs double what wood would cost.

Nongluk Buranabunyut - owner of the restaurant. The handicap ramp isn't real wood and she sees this product as being better.

Trex may or may not have been approved for the ramp; one COA said Trex and a later COA didn't even mention the material to be used, said Ms. Hatala.

Approve the design, but not the material, with staff conditions listed in the report.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

Roll call taken at 3:14 P.M.

Present: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, Peltz

Excused: 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

6. 190763

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a wood privacy fence at 3031 N. Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for Lakeia Jones.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This item was taken up out of order at 3:10 P.M.

Lakeia Jones - owner

Atty. Timothy Baldwin - present for the owner

Irma Jones -

Travis Fell - lives at the address

Ald. Khalif Rainey - local alderman

Ms. Jones said she met with historic commission staff many times and would like the fence as it was approved the first time.

The old COA expired in 2012 and is no longer valid. The original permit, which was issued by the Dept. of Neighborhood Services, also has expired. The HPC staff received more than one complaint and the City Clerk said this technical matter of the height and the construction issues should be resolved prior to HPC hearing this matter.

The chair would like the city clerk to provide something in writing as to how the Commission can move forward with this. They will receive something in writing.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

October 14, 2019

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

7. 190767

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a wood privacy fence at 3047 N. Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for Lakeia Jones.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This item was held at the request of the city and was discussed as part of file 190763.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

8. 190849

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for re-siding and corner boards at 2017 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point South Historic District, for James and Maura Otzko.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said this came as a result of a citizen complaint on ongoing work. The building is a duplex and has a side entrance for the second unit. The upper story boards were replaced with Hardie Plank and the mitered corners were covered. The house is in the Garrison Colonial style, of which mitered corners are a major feature. Staff recommends denial due to the Hardie Plank, conversion of mitered corners to corner boards and wider exposure than the original.

Maura Otzko - they live full-time in Florida and didn't realize they were in a historic district as the condition report of property said it wasn't in a historic district. James Otzko said they were making a number of improvements and the exterior wood was in bad condition. The city inspectors never told them they shouldn't have done the work. The work wasn't intentional. A complaint was what led them to realize the house was in a historic district. They are asking for approval. The second story windows are also replacement windows while the first-floor windows are leaded glass. Hardie board has been allowed in other cities in historic districts and it is on the second floor.

Commissioners recommend that the owners sue the seller.

The Commission approved withholding of DNS fines pending the outcome of the lawsuit.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

9. 190893

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of front and back patios and the conceptual approval of rear porch rehabilitation at 2017 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point South Historic District, for James and Maura Otzko.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the stakes are posititioned where the owners want to install a patio or terrace, 21" in height. A similar wall was approved at a nearby address which matched the house in materials. This applicant wants to have a seat wall installed on a back patio as well as enlarge the existing back balcony on the second floor which would overhang the drive and change the exterior lighting. The upper portion of the chimney was also replaced with red brick. Staff has recommendations in its report relating to all the requested items. The front patio will extend one foot beyond the bumpout so the patio footprint is equal to the bumpout. The rear porch will not extend beyond the driveway. Staff generally wanted the Commission to approve the size and the applicant can work with staff.

David Lucas - owns the house to the west - 2225 and 2227 E. Woodstock - the house on the other side of the driveway. With the extended porch, it will become a carport and he has windows on that side of the house and he thinks that will be too close to his house. He's also concerned about potential porch noise.

Mrs. Otzko said it won't be used as a carport as the post in the middle of the driveway won't be removed and they will be living on the second story, so it will not be a party balcony.

Staff recommended approval for some enlargement of the second floor porch, but they need to work with the staff and what needs to come before the Commission should. Staff can approve the above projects except for the balcony.

Pat Venalley - 2131 E. Lafayette - south of their property. Work with staff except for the size of the rear porch.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

10. 190890

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of damaged neon and the installation of new hand painted signage at 2900 S. Kinnickinnic Avenue, at the William C. Kneisler Tavern Historic Property, for Allison Meinhardt.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said that staff does not oppose modifying the sign as it is post-1980. The same sign face would be used with the neon being removed and affix hand-painted, wood letters. The applicant would like either a flat sign above the entry or an awning sign or a window sign. This sign is a temporary sign and might be changed in the future. Staff recommends approval. She will be proposing different

signage as, up until a few days ago, she thought she had retain the sign. The Commission is fine with her removing the post-1980s sign and doing something completely different. Staff is fine approving the sign as long as it meets the zoning code dimensions.

John Ebersoll - nominated the building as a historic landmark.

Approved with the option to remove the existing sign and work with staff.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

11. 190891

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for material and design changes to a new building at 511 N. Broadway in the East Side Commercial Historic District, for J. Jeffers and Co.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said this proposal was approved by the Commission, but there are now a few modifications. The basic design is the same, but there are changes to the metal panel color, the brick veneer changed to stone veneer for the east and south elevations and shadow box detail removed and replaced with spandrel glass and louver level changes.

Tim Olas - Engberg Anderson architect - the masonry will be replaced with stone and it will harmonize better with the Mackie building. It will have the same motifs and details, but in stone rather than masonry. A limestone will be used to match the Mackie building. Spandrel glass will be used to minimize car headlights in the parking area. The glass is painted to give it a shadow box effect. The corner is also being changed to make it cooler and draw more attention to the lobby. The mechanicals will be one unit on the roof. The corner will have glazing on the upper levels so there will be minimal transition from office to parking. Staff recommends approval.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

12. 190892

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for walkway reconstruction and landscaping at 2571 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, for Heather Brendelson.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the applicant wants to address the hard landscape, overgrown landscape and weather problems with the house. Most of the hardscape will be changed to poured concrete and some grass will be replaced with grass. Overgrown plants will be removed. The cream city brick patio will be using a Uni-lock system,

which is permeable, in an appropriate color and a dry well will channel water to the front landscape beds to alleviate some of the water issues on this property.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

13. <u>190830</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation

of a blade sign at 1037 W. McKinley Avenue, in the Pabst Brewery

Historic District, for NO Studios.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

14. 190848 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for general rehabilitation of the porches and various required repairs at 945 N. 31st

Street, in the Concordia Historic District, for Michelle Glover.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

15. <u>190852</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation

of a non-illuminated wall sign and painting a portion of the ground floor façade at 630 N. Broadway (a part of 301 E. Wisconsin Avenue), in the

East Side Commercial Historic District, for Levine Law Offices.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

16. 190853

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing roofing and gutters at 4401-07 N. 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District, for Janet Mays and Jay Ripp (Balance Investments LLC).

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

17. 190879

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for various landscaping at 2017 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point South Historic District, for James and Maura Otzko.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

18. <u>190923</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reroofing, new gutters and chimney flashing at 2204 N. Hubbard Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District for AG Real Estate Holdings LLC, Adam Gollatz.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

19. 190928

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reroofing, new gutters and chimney tuckpoint and flashing at 2823-25 N. Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Sammie Jean Todd.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

20. 190929

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of new HVAC equipment at the ground level and on the rear section of the roof at 1234 N. Prospect Avenue, in the First Ward Triangle Historic District, for Shoreline Realty.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

21. 190930

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of three concentric vents, concealed with shrubs, on the north side of the home at 2543 N. 47th Street in the 47th Street Bungalow Historic District for Bryan Kwapil.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

22. 190960

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two 2" PVC ventilation pipes 20' above grade at 1216 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Historic Mitchell Street Historic District, for Ralph Wankowski of D&R Contracting.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

23. 190973

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of signage at 317 W. National Avenue, in the Walkers Point Historic District, for Layde & Parra.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

24. Review and approval of the minutes from the September 9th meeting.

Ms. Peltz moved, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

25. Approval of the 2020 schedule of meetings.

Ms. Peltz moved, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta, for approval of the 2020 calendar. There were no objections.

26. Commission Review of the application for a plaque for 3010 N. Summit Avenue, the Carl B. Rix House, in the 3rd Aldermanic District for John Stilp.

Ms. Carlen Hatala said that the nominator is the owner. The house was constructed in 1908 for Carl B. Rix, who was active in the bar association and died at the age of 85 in his office. He owned the house for 56 years. Other prominent people also lived here and the house was a rental for awhile. Staff recommends approval based on the former owners and the style of architecture.

Ms. Keating Kahn moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, for granting of the plaque. There were no objections.

This was

27. Updates and announcements.

The next meeting will be a long one. There will be a state conference in Lake Geneva. Mr. Askin will be attending a meeting in Miami next month, along with Ms. Peltz and Mr. Jarosz.

Meeting adjourned: 5:43 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.

City of Milwaukee