

# City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

# **Meeting Minutes**

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Marion Clendenen-Acosta, CHAIR
Sally Peltz, VICE-CHAIR

Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, and
Patricia Keating Kahn
Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
Ielmer@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov
Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Monday, May 6, 2019 3:00 PM City Hall, Room 301-B

Amended 5/6/19 -- Item #10 was added (file 181467)

Please be apprised that less than 24 hours notice is being given for this file because it is impractical to give the 24 hours' notice.

Meeting convened: 3:04 P.M.

Present: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, Peltz

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz

1. 181641

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a solarium at 2879 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Valerie and Roy Duncan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the request is to add a solarium on the second floor above the bump-out. The drawings are now complete and staff feels this is generally acceptable. The sliding doors, per the architect, need to be included as part of the plan. Roy Duncan - the roof had been leaking.

The Commissioners had no issue with the sliding door.

Approved striking condition #3.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **2.** 181789

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing an ATM at 1039 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for Thomas J. Hart & Mitchell Street State Bank.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the owner is proposing to replace the current ATM with a larger ATM that is accessible to persons with disabilities. This location would require demolition of the building's stone and trim. Mr. Askin had 2-3 other possibile locations that would be more amenable to the history of the building. Staff recommends denial and, at least, a better design of the ATM.

Thomas Hart - They are required to make it ADA-compliant in order to replace it. They want the machine in a high-traffic area for security reasons. The machine has been the target for successful fraud and was shut down over Labor Day due to this. Greg Schumacher - architect. No matter where it is put, unless in the same place, it will alter the facade. He is willing to remove and retain the stone so it can be replaced if the ATM is no longer needed.

Ald. Perez is also uncomfortable moving the ATM to a less access (less secure) area. This is the first he's heard of cutting and retaining the stone. He would support with the caveat of salvaging and storing the existing stonework. That proposed corner is the safest location, even safer than a locked lobby for an ATM.

If the plan is approved, Mr. Askin would like a better design for this location.

Ms. Keating Kahn moved to hold until the next meeting and applicant works with Mr.

Askin to create a better design. Ms. Peltz seconded. Opposed by Ald. Bauman.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 1 - Bauman

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **3**. <u>181839</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a dormer addition and changes to windows and doors at 217 W. Reservoir Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Jamison Klinkner.

# **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this a proposal to add windows, slider doors on the rear of the addition The east elevation is generally approvable as long as there is more space between the windows and they are wood. The Commision has never approved slider doors. The proposed addition violates a couple of guidelines in the district. Staff recommends denial of this addition.

Jamison Klinkner - homeowner - he provided photos of 7 homes in the neighborhood with shed-style dormers. He did talk to Carlen a few years ago about a shed-style dormer. He can live without the slider doors and is changing them to out-push French doors. His architect is the former owner of the house.

Ald. Bauman does not support this as it fundamentally changes the character of the house.

The owner had checked out other possibilities with an architect, but that didn't work out for kids or parents on separate floors.

Staff recommends going off the back for an addition.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **4**. 181893

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing a basement window with glass block on the Center Street elevation at 2703 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Sherman Park Lutheran Church.

#### Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the window was replaced with a glass block window in 2014 and this COA request is a result of a neighbor complaint. Staff recommends denial. Tom Proffitt - president of the congregation - this was done 5 years ago and no-one seemed to care.

Pastor David Totsky

Per Mr. Askin, this church is also part of the national register district. Per Ms. Hatala, there had been previous COAs, even applied for within the past year.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **5**. 190029

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of the chimney at 934 N. 29th Street, in the Concordia District, for Barry Weber and Jamie Ohland.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin recommended approval as the chimney isn't particularly visible or have many features as long as the roofline and material are matched.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **6.** 190026

Resolution relating to a retroactive Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a freestanding shed at the property at 214 E. Vine Street, in the Brewer's Hill District, for Nathalie Gatto.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the shed was erected late last year or early this year using Smartside paneling. The low-slope roof also does not comply with construction guidelines. Staff recommends denial.

Nathalie Gatto - owner - in the spring, summer and fall it can't be seen from the street due to the foliage. The house has no basement (only a crawlspace) and only has 1,200 square feet. Tenants live in the house.

Stephanie Murphy - spouse of Ms. Gatto. They are willing to replace the siding with clapboards and corner boards.

They are willing to change out the siding, but staff does not support the existing door or window

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

**Excused:** 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

## **7.** <u>190027</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new siding, trim, fascia boards, and related repairs done with treated, engineered wood at the property at 214 E. Vine Street, in the Brewers Hill District, for Nathalie Gatto.

# **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the siding isn't in bad enough condition to replace.

Ms. Gatto said the entire back needs to be replaced as there is no roof overhang. She is willing to submit something new.

Mr. Tim Askin said clear pine is fine.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

#### **8.** 190041

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to a previously approved storefront design at 814 - 816 W. Historic Mitchell Street in the Mitchell Historic District for Hector Salinas.

#### Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This item was taken up first on the agenda due to a translator being present. The applicant had obtained a COA, but did not follow it in construction. The recess doorway and windows differ radically from what was granted by the Commission. Staff recommends denial and recommends the entry be recessed and the woodwork over the storefront and apartment entry as shown by the COA.

Mr. Salinas said he wanted the door recessed, but the city wants another four feet level from the door for the handicapped. He also didn't want to cut up a big beam across the front of the building.

Nathael Martinez - with the city's commercial corridor team, they reimburse once work is done up to code and he told the owner he needs to get HPC approval or make the modifications

Denied as the owner did not follow the plans approved by the Commission.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

**9**. 190045

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for constructing a conical metal canopy and associated landscape alterations at 1709 - 1715 N. Arlington Place in in the Brady Street Historic District for Hi Hat Real Estate, LLC.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that a patio canopy is proposed, which does not conform to Brady Street guidelines. The material is not compatible with the district nor is the shape of the cone and it is highly visible on Terrace. The material is agriculture in nature, which is nowhere else in the district and there is only one other conical structure in the district, which is on the main building. Staff recommends denial.

Leslie Montamuro - owner of Hi Hat - she bought the grain bin top. This could be taken down every fall; be up for three months.

Dan Beyer - architect - he thinks this will be fun and unique. When the owner combined the parcel with her property, that brought this specific parcel into the historic area. This parcel of land did not contribute significantly in 1990 at the time of designation (it was a parking lot).

Ms. Keating Kahn finds it funky and fun. This would be right on the property line. It is visible along Brady St.

Staff did not realize that the drawing is not accurate in terms of what it looks like. Held so that more information could be provided.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

**10**. 181467

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for modifying a block retaining wall at 2229 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point South Historic District for the Wisconsin Corporation of Seventh Day Adventists.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This was erected without a COA, appealed to ZND, and now is before HPC again. Mr. Askin worked out the details to his satisfaction regarding sandstone materials on the wall. They will replace the cap and the end conditions.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Jarosz

## The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

11.	<u>181908</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for emergency demolition of the garage at the property at 832 N. 29th Street, in the Concordia Historic District, for Deonna Chambers.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
12.	<u>181880</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a rooftop solar installation at 814 W. Wisconsin Avenue, the Milwaukee Public Library and Museum (Central Library), an individually designated historic property, for the City of Milwaukee.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
13.	<u>190002</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing roofing and gutters and performing repairs to woodwork at 2544 N. 47th Street in the 47th Street Bungalow Historic District for Joseph and Devin Hanson.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
14.	<u>190024</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for filling in a window and general repointing at 2125 N. Lake Drive in the North Point South Historic District for the Matthew G. Helmerich Living Trust.  Sponsors: THE CHAIR
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
15.	<u>190025</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior repairs at 2706 - 2708 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Brent Januszewski.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
16.	<u>190030</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new exterior monument sign at 944 North 33rd Street,

COMMISSION		
		wihin the Wgema Campus in the Concordia District, for the Forest County Potawatomi .
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
17.	<u>190050</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a radon abatement system on the rear wall at 2765 N. Grant Boulevard in the Grant Boulevard Historic District for Betty J Nicholas-Braxton.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
18.	<u>190053</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rebuilding of the masonry on the front and side porches at the property at 3102 W. McKinley Boulevard, in the Cold Spring Park Historic District, for John and Marilyn Byrd.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
19.	190092	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for retaining wall and fence alterations at 2333 S. 6th Street, the St. Josephat Basilica, an individually designated historic property, for the Franciscan Fathers Minor Conventuals of St. Josaphat Church.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
20.	<u>190110</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an exterior rooftop deck and related railings at 1037 West McKinley Avenue, in the Pabst Brewing District, for JonJa Holdings, LLC.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
21.	190113	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing kitchen vent equipment at 1111 N. Old World 3rd Street, in the Old World 3rd Street Historic District, for Tino Bates.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR
22.	<u>190118</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for re-installing the original windows in their original openings and reproducing the matching trim at 125 E. Lloyd Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Jose Maz.
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

- 23. Review and approval of the minutes from the April 1st meeting.
- 24. Vote on Cream of the Cream City recipients.

This matter was taken up before item #9.

Buildings/individuals being considered:

Gloriodos's at 1016-1022 E. Brady

Button Block - 500 N. Water St.

Milwaukee County Historical Society - 910 N. Old World Third St.

F. Mayer Boot & Shoe Company Building

Coakley Brothers Water Tower Building

River Place Lofts and Docks Building (Pfister & Vogel Tannery Complex)

Blommer Ice Cream Company Building

David Uihlein

Members voted and passed their vote sheets along to Ms. Hatala.

- 25. Commission Review of the application for a plaque for 839 North 11th Street, the locally designated Schultz/Seeboth Duplex, now occupied as the A. Chudnow & Sons Historical Museum in the 4th Ald. District.
- 26. Certified Local Government Review of the National Register Nomination for the House at 2463 North Palmer Street, Jones-Hill House, in the 6th Ald. District.
- 27. Updates and announcements.

Meeting adjourned: 5:16 P.M. due to a loss of quorum.

Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.