



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Marion Clendenen-Acosta, CHAIR

Sally Peltz, VICE-CHAIR

*Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, and
Patricia Keating Kahn*

*Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
lelmer@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov*

*Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov*

Monday, April 1, 2019

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:08 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 1 - Peltz

1. [181641](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a solarium at 2879 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Valerie and Roy Duncan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Recess: 6:15-6:25 P.M.

Mr. Tim Askin said that the applicants want to know if they can continue on or if it will be denied

Hold to the call of the chair as applicant not present..

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

2. [181789](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing an ATM at 1039 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for Thomas J. Hart & Mitchell Street State Bank.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This matter was held as applicant not present and no one from the public present on this matter either.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Peltz

3. [181796](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a fireplace vent on the east wall at 114 W. Lloyd Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Amanda Betts.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to add a paintable, metal chimney. The vent is proposed that is as far as possible from the neighbor, but that is only about 5 feet. A chimney on the roof might be preferable, but staff has no recommendation. Amanda Betts - the neighbor has a vent to the side similar to what she is requesting. She is installing the smallest unit available.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

4. [181790](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for mothball status, replacement of selected windows, and various repairs at 2804 - 2810 W. Kilbourn Avenue, in the Concordia Historic District, for S2M2 Real Estate.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said some windows were replaced with vinyl windows and little work has been done since 2009 when there was a bank foreclosure. Roof repairs, mechanicals need full replacement and extensive work needs to be done. Staff recommends mothballing for one year due to the scope of needed work. There are leaded casement windows at the corners. The applicant did provide a proposed work schedule. There would be the standard 6-month intervals for review.

The owner (Sam Stairs) said that plans are moving ahead and with city approvals and permits work can begin. Financing is through his own funds. He didn't realize vinyl windows weren't allowed - the Dept. of Neighborhood Services told him he needed to install windows due to security concerns.

Mr. Jarosz moved for 6 months to mothball and review in 3 months to check on progress.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

5. [181793](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of three projecting signs at 1030 - 1034 - 1040 N. Vel Phillips Avenue, the Turner Hall, an individually designated historic property, for the Milwaukee Turners.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to erect 3 projecting signs, a round sign at the main entrance and a hanging sign (24 foot by 22 foot vertical sign). This building is comparable historically to City Hall and has the highest national historic designation. To meet zoning code, the projecting sign will need to be shrunk a little bit and staff would like to see it raised slightly so it doesn't block decorative brick details. The round sign is acceptable as proposed.

The large, vertical sign does not meet the guidelines for the property as it is too long, obstructing decorative designs on the building. A new location was submitted this morning, but he still feels the sign is too long. Staff would actually prefer the sign on a pole on the ground.

Mike Kinsella - Poblocki Sign Company - he prefers the new proposed location and thinks the size does fit with the size of the building. With Fiserv, there's just a lot of visual stimulation in the neighborhood it needs to be large enough to be seen and shrinking the sign will shrink the letters quite a bit. All of the letters are open faced with individual LED bulbs. Mr. Kinsella is fine with moving the little sign up so it doesn't block the building decorative piece.

Mr. Jarosz doesn't object to the size or the exposed bulbs. He would like to see an accurate drawing, though. He wants care taken with the architectural features. He would like have the top of the sign hit the top of the curve of the window at its highest point.

Mr. Kinsella will revise their drawings.

Grant, with Mr. Askin approving the smaller sign and how it projects and a very accurate drawing of the vertical sign.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

6. [181795](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a rooftop addition and other modifications for converting to residential use, the property at 1945 N. Bartlett Avenue, the Milwaukee Fire Department's Firehouse Ladder Company No. 5, an individually designated historic property, for Lincoln and Lilith Fowler.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr Tim Askin said the intern helped a lot with this report. These are new owners and new architects. The applicant is proposing to replace all the windows as they are not savable and are proposing Marvin Ultimate double-hung with most of the windows. The plan is to switch the door and window in front so they are reversed. There will be three new windows on the street side. A new rooftop addition is being proposed which would be slightly lower than a full floor, with a deck and penthouse. Exterior mechanicals will be on the roof and not street-visible. Staff has a lot of conditions.

Lilith and Lincoln Fowler - 2969 N. Marietta - they have been thinking about this building for 20 years. The primary issue is light and interior design has been based on maximizing natural light.

Staff recommends approval with conditions, striking conditions 3 and 5. The fence will be refined with what the owners want to do (and not visible from the street). The windows on the south elevation being aluminum clad are fine with the Commission. Other windows (including a new one on the 2nd floor) will be wood.

Mr. Jarosz thinks the design is good and pretty sensitive.

Applicant does not object to the remaining conditions.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

7. [181800](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation and a five-story rooftop addition at 600 - 602 - 606 - 610 N. Broadway in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Joca Properties.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the building is being converted to a hotel and a 3-story addition is the current proposal (downsized from 5 stories). The changes proposed to the historical building are sensitive and there are no remaining historic windows and the existing windows would not be approved by this body. The current entry design is a quality design that is appropriate to the building. The addition has no precedence in this historic district. The addition would be a change to the roofline that is visible from the public right of way. The addition is sensitive to the building, but still remains an anomaly. The three stories will result in permanent shadows for the roof deck of the building next door. Staff recommends hold for a maximum of one story or deny it. John Vetter - 161 S. 1st St. - architect - this would be 45-unit hotel. There is a Kinn hotel in Bayview (8 units, boutique hotel). Each level has its own kitchen and is designed to mimic a home.

Charles Bailey - - Shorewood - the property is under contract presently.

Mr. Vetter said it's important the precedent that is being set. It's a tired street, but it's one of the nearly intact blocks and set a good precedent for development to revitalize an area. The plan does retain columns and floor slabs; they will be putting existing floors back. Parking will be valet.

Don Arenson - neighbor opposed to the plan. He has lived downtown since the late 1970s or 1980s and owned this building at one time. It's an additional 30 foot wall next to his building. He doesn't think it's the right thing for the area. The buildings need attention, but things are happening and he thinks this is compromising the integrity of his building.

Mr. Jarosz noted that the Third Ward does have its own design guidelines and does try

to be a little more edgy and artistic. They also compare building height to adjacent buildings and try for a range of 70%-130%. He would like to hear from adjacent property owners about their concerns. He is frustrated that the block has sat for years not being developed.

Ms. Hatala said the city has been losing Italianate buildings and these buildings are more fragile than the Scottish temple to support additional floors.

Held to get some more details and talk to the neighbors.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

8. [181570](#)

Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the Marcus Center for the Performing Arts at 929 North Water Street in the 4th Ald. District

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This matter was taken up first on the agenda.

Ms. Hatala said the original proposal was to have three buildings (veterans building, art museum and a performing arts building) and the project dates back to 1944 and was organized by several women's organizations following World War II. The impetus was to honor the fallen dead and create an arts venue. This was designed as a civic project with no profit motive. Insufficient funds were raised to cover three buildings, so Mayor Maier was a proponent of constructing the performing arts center where it is today as many buildings in the area were removed as part of urban renewal. Many political and private factions were involved in the decision, but the city was adamant about the current site. Harry Weese was selected as the architect by a board created by the War Memorial Board, who considered 24 individuals. The building has stylized columnades, which create a sense of light and shadow, protusion and recession with symmetry on three sides of the building, and is in the brutalism style. In the 1960s, any city of any size wanted to have a performing arts center and construction began in June 1966. Final construction costs totaled \$12 million. There was one protest as it was seen as serving the wealthy, rather than the poor and the minority, as it was promoted as a civic and community asset. The building changes include: LED lights to illuminate the building, the replacement of the original stone, and the addition of glass on the front lobby. The second part of the design is the grove of trees to mirror the building. The horse chestnut trees have now matured. The fountain is to anchor the corner and was designed by Harry Weese. The trees were designed by Dan Kiley, a major founder in the modernist movement in parks. The Green Tree Garden Club paid for the 75 trees. The landscaping was generally done with donated funds. The trees provide movement to the solid building. The designation includes the building and the grounds. There is also a boat landing and walkway along the river. The building cannot be separated from the grounds and the site.

Staff recommends designation based upon e-1, e-5, e-6 and e-9. A number of other buildings in the city have been altered since being constructed, but they were still deemed worthy of historic designation in order to preserve them.

Ald. Bauman moved, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to open the public hearing. There were no objections. The Chair noted there were 12 individuals who signed in as

in favor, but who did not wish to speak.

Supporters:

Jennifer Current - 1843 N. 2nd St. - nominator - the building and trees were designed to mirror each other. The Tuileries Garden in France was able to replace trees over several hundred years and preserve the design intent. The trees are a cultural treasure and can exist with a state-of-the-art performing arts center.

Mark Debrauske - 2955 S. Wentworth Ave. - nominator - The building and trees are an innovative and collaborative design done by world-class designers. The tree design is very specific; the trees can be cut down, but must be replaced.

Larry Spike Bandy - 3957 N. 62nd St. - Milwaukee doesn't really preserve its commercial architecture. Kiley's landscapes harken back to the time when people strolled through landscapes just for the purpose of strolling. The trees in France have been replaced several times, but they retain the same design. This site will be a great benefit to our children and our grandchildren.

George Wagner - 3300 N. Newhall St. - agrees with the first 3 speakers, but wanted to add that chairs should be in the grove replacing the benches

Mary Webster Levitt - lives in Mequon - Milwaukee has many new downtown residents and we cannot eliminate this wonderful grove of trees. It is charming and a pocket park.

Whitney Gould - 2633 N. Stowell Ave. - former architecture critic at the Journal Sentinel, agrees with the previous speakers and she likes the contrast of the building and the grounds. She believes the trees can be retained and the Marcus Center can still be updated. We should value our sense of history and sense of place.

Joyce Keene - 1909 N. 2nd St. - she lives in Brewers Hill and the city did eventually recognize that historic homes had to be preserved to give a neighborhood character and make it a special place. She wants the Marcus Center to be successful. The tree design is timeless.

Dawn McCarthy - Milwaukee Preservation Alliance - the building continues to be important despite the updates as do the trees. The alterations can be reversed and none of them disqualify this building for designation.

Opponents:

The Chair noted that 11 individuals signed in as opposed, but did not wish to speak.

Jim Shields - architect - argues that the building has to meet the 6 criteria listed under "e" solely and this building does not due to the modifications over the years. The open colonnades were moved and the Italian Travertine stone was removed. The stone was showing signs of failure within 20 years. The Peck pavilion he sees as being non-contributing to the building and site and the same for the cement benches added in 1989. In 1994, a beige limestone was used to clad the building. He is concerned that replacing the exterior cladding basically makes this building no longer able to be designated as well as the closed colonnades and the replacement of the front colonnade with a glass entryway. Vogel Hall and the kids' theatre changed the look of the building on the west side.

John Vogel - doctorate in American history and historic consultant. The PAC trees are not listed in a book detailing the works of Dan Kiley and the same is for the PAC architecture of Harry Weese. The Marcus Center is also not cited in the "Atlas of Brutalist Architecture". The building is no longer a Harry Weese building and should not be designated by the HPC.

Shania Ali - TruSkool - this is an arts center intended to embrace the future and not be a monument to the past. It brings people together from all walks of life. The grove is nice to walk through, but not an inviting place to stay for a number of reasons.

Brian Peters - works at Independence First - 540 S. 1st St. - here to talk about the accessibility of the building itself and the building does have accessibility problems.

He is not opposed to preserving the history of the building, but we need better access.

Shanon Najique - Islamic Resource Center - they have used the Marcus Center for many programs over the years and she has never thought of the building as being anything more than conducive to the arts. It does not appear to be historic. The grove is not accessible to children in wheelchairs; wheelchairs easily tip over in gravel and the trees are a hindrance.

Ms. Hatala did mention that Harry Weese won an award in 1970, prior to any of the alternations.

Ald. Bauman moved, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn, to close the public hearing. There were no objections.

Designation based on e-1, e-5, e-6 and e-9

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE . This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Peltz

Roll call taken at 5:30 P.M.

Present: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 2 - Bauman, Peltz

9. [181652](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of four horse chestnut trees on the grounds of the Marcus Center for the Performing Arts (929 N. Water St.) in the 4th Ald. District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said little has changed from last month. Staff cannot recommend removal of these trees at this time without a comprehensive landscape/maintenance plan being presented to this body.

Frederick Hoppe - Hoppe Tree Service - there is liability for failure to provide sufficient care for the trees.

Tree 26 - has dead branches over 26% of the crown. The tree is also completely separated.

Tree 37 - 30% of the root flare and trunk circumference are gone. The whole load of the tree is on the defect.

Tree 38 - was cabled at one point and that cable has now failed. A decay column exists in the entire trunk.

Tree 50 - largest of the 4 diseased trees and is actively failing with large vertical cracks in its trunk.

Paul Matthews - this was laid over at mutual request. Our insurance company and legal counsel have advised that these trees are a potential public hazard, which is why the fence is up. The trees are not surviving as they were planted too close together.

The plan is to replace the trees with honey locust trees, which are a better urban tree. Richard Hecht - New Berlin - they have a long-standing landscaping plan over the years with different companies.

Mr. Matthews said that the public has had input into the plan for the new proposed building. The four diseased trees will be cut and the best thing for the remaining trees is to leave the root ball in the ground.

Mr. Askin recommended conditional approval with replacing the four trees with the same trees by spring 2020.

Frederick Hoppe said there is potential damage to the other trees' root balls if those four root balls are removed.

Mr. Hecht said they are trying to mitigate the liability in the meantime and the permanent designation will affect their plans.

Grant conditionally with replanting with the same species by spring 2020 following best arboreal practices and availability. Any additional damaged trees resulting from the removal of any of the four trees will be replaced in kind as well. Moved by Ms.

Keating Kahn, seconded by Mr. Jarosz.

Speakers from the public:

Babette Grunau - would oppose removing them unless they can be replaced with chestnuts

Barbara Aho - when you take down large trees you use large equipment and that will damage the roots and kill the remaining trees. The work has to be done by a team that wants to save the trees, not get rid of them. The roots are all intertwined.

Spike Bandy - common sense says those trees must come down, but people have to be interested in saving the remaining trees.

Jennifer Current - there is a protocol in place with a potential permanent historic designation

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

10. [181633](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the primary garage door and one side door at Fire Engine House No. 35, an individually designated historic property in the Bungalow Style Firehouses Multiple Historic Designation for Janelle Meyer-Brown of Evenement.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ann, matt

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

11. [181813](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for re-roofing, new gutters, and related repairs at the house at 2879 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Valerie and Roy Duncan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

12. [181838](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for masonry repairs to the property at 1879 N. Cambridge Avenue, the George Knowles, Jr. House, an individually designated historic property, for Susan Ellman.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

13. [181842](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement railings at 2217 - 2219 N. Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for Kevin Perkins and Ronald Kelly.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

14. [181851](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an illuminated sign at 807 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for Charlotte Nasef of Damascus Gate.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - VACANCY, Bauman, and Peltz

15. Review and approval of the minutes from the March 4th and March 18th meetings.

*Ms. Keating Kahn moved, seconded by Mr. Jarosz, for approval of both minutes.
There were no objections.*

16. Updates and announcements.

April 11th is Mr. Jartoz's conference and April 12th is the conference in Oshkosh.

Meeting adjourned: 8:01 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer

Staff Assistant

*This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research
Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.*