



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Marion Clendenen-Acosta, CHAIR

Sally Peltz, VICE-CHAIR

*Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, and
Patricia Keating Kahn*

*Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
lelmer@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov*

*Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov*

Monday, March 4, 2019

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:08 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Peltz

Excused: 1 - Keating Kahn

1. [181629](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of windows at 2804 N. Grant Boulevard in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Roberthentry Davis of Even Life, Inc.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the appeal was denied and the Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development committee requested that HPC re-hear this matter. The proposal is to replace the windows with cottage sash windows. The original windows on the north side are probably original being one over one. Staff recommends one over one windows on the north and east side so the whole sides match. Staff recommends with conditional approval detailed in the staff report. Staff approved the concept of a fence, but not an actual fence, which isn't on the application.

Mr. Roberthentry Davis is fine with the conditions except with not permitting glass block windows; he would cover up those windows. Many of the neighbors have glass block windows and potential buyers like that with the lighting and the small screened window to permit air in.

Staff said that glass block windows for the applicant were approved on non-street-facing windows.

The Commission does not support glass-block windows visible from the public way.

Ms. Peltz would like to see penalties for homeowners that are not following the design guidelines. Staff does accept anonymous complaints relating to specific addresses.

Approve with staff conditions.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

2. [181443](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of solar panels on the roof at 2843 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Paul O'Brien.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the Dept. of Neighborhood Services issued a solar panel permit without referring it to HPC staff. The form included with the application does note that a COA must be obtained. Solar panels are allowed if they are not visible from the public right of way. Staff recommends approving the panels on the rear only.

Michael O'Brien - owner, his son is Paul, who lives there full-time. His installer told him all the proper forms had been submitted and a roof-mounted unit would be appropriate. Elizabeth Hittman - Milwaukee Shines - the issue will be clearer in the future that the applicant has to receive a letter from HPC. She does not see ground-mount as being economically feasible.

Becky - works for the installer

Approval of the rear panels only and require removal of the front panels.

Wis. Stats. 66.0401(1m)(c) of the state statute justifying the rationale. Nine in back are approvable and 5 are not approvable as an alternative system of comparable cost and efficiency and (b) does not significantly decrease its efficiency.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

3. [181635](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing non-wood French doors on the rear elevation at 204 W. Brown Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Robert Howard.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this is to revise a previously approved addition and the Brewer's Hill guidelines do not encourage this work. The door is visible from the public right of way. The doors do not yet exist.

Tom van Heijningen - 135 E. National Ave. - he is the contractor who is proposing a fiberglass door that looks like wood and will be painted. The owner wants an 84" tall door and the cost difference is \$2,000. This would be a high-end French door. This door will be on the second story.

The Commission already approved the French doors; just looking at the materials at this point.

Held to the call of the chair so a sample can be brought in.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following

vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

4. [181637](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for storefront modifications at 2636 N. Downer Avenue, in the Downer Avenue Historic District, for Wade Ritchie and F45.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to replace the storefront system matching the existing aluminum system with a granite base, move one entry door and remove one entry door. There will also be new signage and staff is fine with the signage. The recessed entry door will be removed and an entry door on the side will be installed. The Downer Ave. BID is opposed to this and feel it doesn't meet the guidelines. This type of entrance was done historically, but was uncommon. Work could proceed with the work as long as the recessed area isn't filled in. Staff recommends denial of the storefront entrance, hold on the other matters requested and refer signage to staff for approval.

Mike Griffhorn - 130 S. Water St - the current two occupants will only be one and the angled entryway allows for a ramp for the 4" height difference between the two occupancies.

All but the north two businesses in this strip retain their recessed doors.

Ald. Kovac said that the recessed doors have not been obliterated and there is a rhythm to them.

The owner could keep the north facade and eliminate the need for a ramp so he can submit this plan to staff for review.

Hold for revisions until the March 18th meeting.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

5. [181640](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of selected windows and related structural repairs at 2912 E. Bellevue Place, in the North Point North Historic District, for Samuel Radcliffe.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

The proposal is to replace rotting lentils over two window bay with stainless steel lentils. The applicant should match the existing product used on the property. The applicant will purchase wood Marvin storm windows. The only matter in question is the elastomeric coating for the stucco and the owner has accepted all staff conditions on the project.

Approve with staff conditions.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

6. [181571](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of an imitation Spanish tile metal roof at 2879 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Valerie and Roy Duncan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that the proposed roofing product is metal roofing and is meant to resemble terra cotta roofing. This roofing material does not have a flat profile, which staff would require. The roofing is not appropriate to the house style. Staff recommends denial.

Aaron Bagurdes - Over the Top Roofing - two blocks away there are spanish tiles on their homes and he is trying to blend into the neighborhood.

Valerie Duncan - homeowner - realtor told them that this property was not historical (and they specifically were looking for a non-historic home). She prefers the spanish tile style. The back-up proposal is a shingle roof. They will be painting the stucco and get a shingle roof to match. The city and state will approve Landmark, but not Landmark Pro. Prohibited colors are white and jet black.

Ms. Duncan will speak with staff about historic tax credits.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

7. [181641](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a solarium at 2879 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Valerie and Roy Duncan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim said the applicant would like to install a solarium on the back, second floor bumpout. Staff did some research on proposed designs. As currently designed, it is not harmonious with the house or the neighborhood. The owner seems willing to work with staff and staff requests that this be held and opine if a solarium is acceptable at this location. There would be a railing with stucco and it would have a shed roof. In principal, the Commission supports a shed roof, simple and clean design that doesn't go across the entire facade with a stucco knee wall. Details can be worked out with staff.

Hold to the call of the chair until the April 1st meeting.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following

vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

8. [181638](#) Resolution relating to the Temporary Historic Designation of the Milwaukee Journal Company Building at 333 West State Street in the 4th Ald. District.

Sponsors: Ald. Bauman and Ald. Murphy

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the application was submitted by Ald. Bauman and Ald. Murphy as the property is currently for sale. A lot of development is occurring in this area. Ms. Hatala went through the history of the newspaper, which razed a number of structures in 1923/24 to construct its building at its current location. The designer was Frank D. Chase, Inc., out of the Chicago area, who specialized in industrial buildings and particularly in newspaper buildings. Not much has changed except the windows. Expansions were done after World War II due to advertising revenue increases. In 1962 a new addition was added to the east and south and no attempt was made to match the existing building. Ms. Hatala says this building meets the following historic criteria: s. 320-21(3) e-1, e-3, e-5 and e-9. Ms. Hatala also included the annex and the parking lot in her historic report. The parking lot was included so a building could not be constructed that would dwarf the building. Ms. Hatala would have to create the language to clarify what is included in the designation. The tax key encompasses the entire block except Major Goolsby.

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to open up the public hearing. No one wished to speak.

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to close the public hearing.

Mr. Bauman moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, for temporary designation based on e-1, e-3, e-5 and e-9. There were no objections.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

9. [181652](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of four horse chestnut trees on the grounds of the Marcus Center for the Performing Arts (929 N. Water St.) in the 4th Ald. District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that the proposal is to remove 4 of 36 trees due to rot and other damage. Horse chestnut trees have only been used in designed landscapes and are not generally out in the wild. The bark exfoliates on older specimens and exposes the orange shade underneath. Staff does not have the expertise to review tree health. Tree 37 has a hollow area; tree 38 has an unusual angle.

Tree 26 has large cracks. Tree 50 also has some cracks.

Staff recommends that the trees be replanted by the end of 2020. The arborist report

was dated January 31st of this year. Richard Hecht, Marcus Center, said all of the trees are original

Fred Hoppe - Hoppe Tree Service - he assessed all 36 trees and identified these 4 trees as being potential risks. Per Mr. Hoppe:

Tree 26 - half of the canopy is dead and there are 2 big splits in the trunk and is along the pathway and has a bench underneath it.

Tree 37 - has a large cavity in the center.

Tree 38 - has a large defect along the entire trunk stopping at the main union

Tree 50 - this tree is actively failing and has large spiral cracks around the trunk

Paul Mathews - Marcus Center - safety is a concern as there will be thousands of children crossing those grounds through June to access the building.

Hoppe was hired to look at how to best re-use the wood. Mr. Hecht said they have been treating and cabling the trees for years.

Mr. Mathews said that the public doesn't use the grove itself, but are in front or on the sides of the grove. The fence is up to prevent children from cutting through the grove.

Ms. Peltz and Ald. Bauman were concerned because these trees didn't become unhealthy overnight.

Dave Sivyer -Forestry Services Manager - he looked at the four trees and he agrees most of the trees are in fair condition. He agrees that the four do have significant structural problems. Tree 50 has structural cracks in the trunk and half of the crown is dead so there is no way to cable it to secure it. There are some things that can be done to secure the trees, such as using rods in the trunk.

Tree 38 has significant damage and has very little value.

It's a judgement call to seek to prolong the life or remove and plant a new tree. In an urban area, 50 years isn't unreasonable with the living conditions they have endured.

They have reached quite a mature state based upon the site. He would suggest a more thorough examination be done of these trees. Two of the four trees could be salvaged.

Tree 26 and the curved tree don't have a lot to salvage. The trees could be made safer.

Jennifer Current - 1843 N 2nd St. - there are protocols in place for Milwaukee County to deal with dying/deceased plants in planned landscapes. A preservation plan and treatment approach should be created.

Mr. Hoppe doesn't think the mitigation efforts would make them any safer; they were just planted too closely.

Barbara Evel - 4019 N. Bartlett Ave. - the right thing to do is to maintain these trees and treat them as sacred. She also fears the existing trees will be harmed in the removal of the four trees. Honey locust trees don't create shade, like these trees do.

Mr. Mathews asked that this decision be delayed until April 1st.

Charlie Keenan - 2769 N. Booth St. - urban beekeeper- replacing 4 trees with different trees will affect the bees. This would be a potential loss of pollinating habitat.

This matter will be scheduled for April 1st.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

10. [181647](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing two signs at 1701 N. Humboldt Boulevard in the Brady Street Historic District for Mac Shack (Ashraf Mustafa).

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

11. [181650](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for two signs at 323 - 327 E. Wisconsin Avenue, in the East Side Commercial Historic District, for East Town Kitchen and Bar (Wisconsin & Milwaukee Hotel LLC)

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

12. [181651](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a wall sign at 624 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Smoker's Haze and Vape (Fahad Farooqui).

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

13. [181661](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a wood fence at 3175 - 3177 N Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for Sylvia Acevedo.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

14. [181664](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of multiple signs at 2567 N Downer Avenue, in the Downer Avenue Historic District, for Optix and NAI MLG Commercial.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

15. [181673](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a detached wooden deck at 2837 N Grant Boulevard, in the Grant Boulevard Historic District, for Donald Merritt.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Keating Kahn

16. **Review and approval of the minutes from the February 4th meeting.**

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

18. **Discussion relating to Cream of the Cream Cities nominations and program.**

Application form not on the city website yet, so Ms. Hatala will check on that. Only one commissioner nominated one building; she has not heard from the other commissioners. Please submit any nominations as a background search needs to be done. Ms. Peltz will forward an article on 37 buildings and Mr. Jarosz has a meeting on Wednesday and he will submit some buildings.

17. **Election of a Vice Chair**

Mr. Jarosz nominated Ms. Peltz, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. Ms. Peltz was honored to accept.

19. Updates and announcements.

The Wisconsin Association of Historic Preservation Commissions is meeting on April 12th in Oshkosh and there is no registration fee. The whole conference is aimed at commissioners.

There is also a meeting on April 11th on Wisconsin historic tax credits that Mr. Jarosz spoke on.

Meeting adjourned: 6:24 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer

Staff Assistant