# **City of Milwaukee**



200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

# **Meeting Minutes**

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Ald. Robert Bauman, CHAIR Marion Clendenen-Acosta, Vice Chair Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, Patricia Keating Kahn, and Sally Peltz Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456, lelmer@milwaukee.gov Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, chatal@milwaukee.gov Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712, tim.askin@milwaukee.gov Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679, dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Tuesday, September 4, 2018

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Amended 8/29/18 -- A staff-approved COA (180720) was moved to the October agenda.

Meeting convened: 3:01 P.M.

Present: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, Peltz

- Excused: 1 Pieper Eisenbrown
- 1.
   180657
   Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of multiple signs at 1109 1111 N. Old World 3rd Street, in the Old World 3rd Historic District, for 1231 Tino Bates and Truth Lounge.

# <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said this sign replaces another sign and was installed without obtaining a COA. He recommends approval of the decals, but the projecting sign needs to have some texture.

Tino Bates - there are a number of signs on Old World Third that have vinyl decal and they just did the same type of previous signage. He would like to keep the sign as it is.

*Mr.* Askin said all the signs in the district will receive similar treatment. *Ms.* Hatala said the sign is not the same as the former sign and it has a different bracket.

Approve with staff recommendations.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

2. <u>180667</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for landscape and architectural lighting in the front yard at 2685 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for David Kudlata and Miles Underwood.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said a new landscaping has been proposed for the front yard. The general landscape plans were already approved by staff, this application is just for the lighting, which includes a lamp post, 8 flood lights and 2 path lights. The Commission has approved lighting in the Concordia district as well as in North Point North in this block, with restrictions. The Commission did approve path lights on the side of a house with limited visibility. Staff recommends denying the lamp post, limit the lumens of the flood lights to 400 lumens and approval of three path lights. Peter Kudlata - Flagstone Landscaping. He would like to retain the tree lighting. David Kudlata - he is disabled and needs the light to access the house. Keith Johnson - he lives a half block away - the block is very, very dark and across the street the trees are up lighted. They have done great work on the house. Mr. Jarosz moved to approve the foundation lights, the path lights with 400 lumens or less and the tree uplights be removed. Approve 5 up lights at the foundation, remove 3 tree up lights. No vote was taken on this motion and more discussion took place. Approve with lower lumens on the foundation and the trees and the path lights are approved, with staff approval required, conditioned upon the applicant's disability and railings on one side of the stairs at a minimum.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

**3.** <u>180671</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of four Solatubes at 2581 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, for Susan LaBudde.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said that the Solatubes were installed without a COA. Ms. LaBudde provided additional information for the file at the table Three Solatubes are visible from the public right of way; the one on the rear slope of the roof is not. A clear skylight on the rear would not be practical as the other buildings are higher. The other three front Solatubes alter the roofline, which is prohibited by the design guidelines for the district.

Susan LaBudde - 2581 N. Terrace Ave. - owner of the 1971 condo and didn't realize it was in an historic district. Only the apartment building to the west looks down on her property. She doesn't think they're a material change to the roofline and thinks they're comparable to roof vents and pipes. She has letters in support from all the surrounding neighbors. They are not visible from her sidewalk, but are from across the street. The house has big windows to let in light and nature and this is not a large house and was constructed in 1971. This is a mid-century, modern building, which

there are no other ones in the district.

Staff recommends approval of the one in the rear and denial of the other three. Keith Johnson - corner of Belleview, owner of Brighter Concepts and installs Solatubes.

Approve consistent with staff recommendations.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

4. <u>180679</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a monument sign at 2648 N. Hackett Avenue, the Kenwood Masonic Temple, an individually designated historic property, for Church in the City.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the church is requesting a monument sign. The top of the first floor balacony building is six feet 8 inches high. The sign will be brushed aluminum plates with faux brick and 31 square feet of design area. If both sides are parallel it will meet the sign codes, if a "V" shape is done, then it may or may not comply. Staff recommends approval subject to synthetic brick being replaced with wood posts. Applicant is fine with the staff recommendations. Move approval with staff recommendation with parellel wood posts. Mr. Jarosz moved to hold until drawings could be submitted Joel Pieper - 324 N. Pinecrest St. - the sign will be smaller than was shown in the mock-up. The faux brick was done to match the church and keep the cost down, but will go with the painted wood column.

Mr. Jarosz moved to deny, seconded by Ms. Peltz.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

# **5**. <u>180680</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a four-car garage, construction of a one-car garage, construction of a three-car parking slab, and a construction of a retaining wall at 1820 N. 1st Street, in the Brewer's Hill Historic District, for Donald Barnes.

### <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said this is an 8-unit apartment building. The demolition permit was issued as it had a raze order. Staff is requesting retroactive approval of the demolition and a new, one-car garage is being proposed. Staff believes the general design is acceptable as proposed. There are 3 gravel parking spaces and those will be

concrete, per the owner. The retaining wall material is acceptable to staff. Staff's only condition was to make the concreting paving and all wood be smooth and free of knots. The applicant has no objections to either condition. Donald Barnes - owner - would like to use smart siding, but that has been denied many times by the Commission. Ryan Shortridge - architect Approve with the caveat to approve the garage door with staff and staff recommendations in the report.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

# 6. <u>180681</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a replacement two-level rear porch at 2217 - 2219 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Kevin Perkins and Ronald Kelly.

# <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said this was at the Commission 2-3 months ago and they now have a new design. The applicants would like to build a smaller porch and would use the porch in the book as the example. They would copy the design from another house in the area.

Staff recommends approval with conditions listed in the report. Applicants not present.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

7. <u>180687</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a two-car garage 2045 N. 2nd Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Dale and Renata Bunger.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said the applicant is proposing a garage, which will be slightly wider than the house. The garage will be a 2-car garage, 1.5 stories with an appropriate design. Staff report recommends approval with conditions.

Renata Bunger - owner - this is a necessity, not a luxury due to the number of car break-ins

Aprove with conditons detailed in the staff report.

#### A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that

#### this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

8. <u>180688</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for applying the Rhinoshield coating product to the house at 1830 N. 2nd Street, in Brewers Hill Historic District, for Daniel and Margaret Olson.

## Sponsors: THE CHAIR

*Mr. Tim Askin said if the applicants didn't show, they would be withdrawing their application and he asked that this application be held. The Commission moved to hold with no objection. An e-mail requesting withdrawal of the application was received by staff after the hearing.* 

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

# **9**. <u>180689</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for shortening a rear chimney at 1669 S. 5th Street, the St. Anthony School, the former Notre Dame High School, which is part of the parcel addressed as 524 W. Historic Mitchell Street, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for the St. Stanislaus Congregation.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

*Mr.* Tim Askin said that 90% of the project has been approved by staff and technically this qualifies as a partial demolition. The chimney would extend only two feet above the parapet. The Commission approved shortened chimneys for two schools. Staff recommends to shortening to one foot above the highest point (roughly 6 feet above the parapet)

Abbe George Baird - lives in the rectory - he has no objections to staff recommendations.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

 10.
 <u>180615</u>
 Substitute resolution relating to expanding the boundaries of the North

 Point North Historic District to include a portion of the property addressed

as 2320 North Lake Drive, located along the west side of North Terrace Avenue and south of the property located at 2411 North Terrace Avenue, in the 3rd Aldermanic District.

<u>Sponsors:</u> Ald. Kovac

*Ms.* Carlen Hatala said the annexation land has a lot of history behind it. This land recently was part of Columbia St. Mary's, although not always. There will be three lots with an open space buffer. There are no members of the audience who oppose the designation.

Ald. Nik Kovac - per the city attorney and the city clerk, area can be designated, it doesn't need to be a lot.

Ms. Hatala provided a description, which is contained in the staff report. The southwest quarter of section 15 area was set aside by the city for benevolent associations. The southeast quarter of section 15 was residential. This area was used for residential homes initially and then Columbia St. Mary's purchased the properties for its expansion and demolished the house and garage on one of the properties in 1963. In 2005, CSM agreed that the property would become part of the historic district and be subject to HPC review (a draft of this agreement was found, but not a final version yet). This will add to the continuity of the historic district.

Staff recommends approval as meets s. 320-21-3 e-8

*Ms.* Keating Kahn moved to convene into a public hearing. There were no objections. Ald. Kovac is here in support. The owner has no objection.

Barbara Elsner - 1800 N. Prospect Ave. - nominator - St. Mary's turned that land into a parking lot.

A number of members of the audience present in support but did not wish to speak. Mike Lilek - the neighborhood worked for three years with the hospital and CSM was a great partner.

*Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn, to close the public hearing. There were no objections.* 

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

# The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

11.180664Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the<br/>primary entrance door on the west elevation of the ground floor of 2728 -<br/>2730 W. Burnham Street, in the American System Built Homes Historic<br/>District, for Lorne Rae

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

**Excused:** 2 - VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

12.180666Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for landscaping<br/>the front yard at 2685 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic<br/>District for David Kudlata and Miles Underwood.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

- **Excused:** 1 Pieper Eisenbrown
- 13.180682Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reconstruction<br/>of the chimney at 2544 N. 47th Street, in the North 47th Street Bungalow<br/>Historic District, for Joseph M. Hanson.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

- **Excused:** 1 Pieper Eisenbrown
- 14.180685Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a sidewalk<br/>café at 1003 1007 N. Old World 3rd Street, in the Old World 3rd Historic<br/>District, for Bobby Wiltgen of Whos On Third.
  - Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

- Excused: 1 Pieper Eisenbrown
- **15.** <u>180686</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rebuilding

16.

17.

18.

of the front porch at 1921 North 2nd Street, in the Brewers Hill Historic District, for Midwest Commercial Funding. THE CHAIR Sponsors: A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz No: 0 Excused: 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown 180691 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for masonry repairs at 729 - 737 W. Historic Mitchell Street in the Mitchell Historic District for Hae Jae Kim of A1 Beauty. THE CHAIR Sponsors: A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz No: 0 Excused: 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown 180693 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a wood fence at 2646 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Tim Nelson. THE CHAIR Sponsors: A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote: Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz No: 0 Excused: 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown 180695 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing roofing and gutters on the house and carriage house at 1830 N. 2nd Street, in Brewers Hill Historic District, for Daniel and Margaret Olson. THE CHAIR Sponsors: A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

**19.** <u>180708</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs to the fire damage to the office addition at 1046 N. 9th Street, the Trinity Lutheran Church Complex, an individually designated historic property, for Trinity Evangelical Lutheran Congregation.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

 20.
 180712
 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the post-fire rehabilitation of the house at 3011 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Carl Quindel of Strong Blocks Milwaukee II LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 1 - Pieper Eisenbrown

**21.** <u>180718</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for rebuilding the north wall of the garage in matching brick at 2145 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Appleton Rental Homes.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

- Aye: 5 Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz
- **No:** 0
- Excused: 1 Pieper Eisenbrown

# 22. Review and approval of the minutes from the August 6th meeting.

*Ms.* Peltz moved, seconded by *Mr.* Jarosz, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

# 23. Updates and announcements.

Another reminder from HPC staff about the conference in October.

Meeting adjourned: 4:39 P.M. Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.