

City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Ald. Robert Bauman, CHAIR
Marion Clendenen-Acosta, Vice Chair
Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, Patricia Keating Kahn,
and Sally Peltz
Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
lelmer@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov
Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Monday, June 4, 2018 3:00 PM City Hall, Room 301-A

Meeting convened: 3:04 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, Peltz

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

1. <u>161667</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mothball certificate for 1134 W. Historic Mitchell Street, known as the Modjeska Theater, in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Modjeska Theater Project, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin and the Dept. of Neighborhood Services have no objection.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

2. 171814

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for multiple signs at 1013 N. Old World Third Street in the Old World Third Street Historic District for Scott Schaefer of Milwaukee Brat House LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this is retroactive approval relating to sign height and none of the

signs on the front or back of the building have COAs or Dept. of Neighborhood Services permits. On the front wall, that sign is basically compliant and he recommends approval as existing. The projecting signs both are in violation of sign code due to the low height and staff recommends denial. Staff feels the best solution is to remove the neon sign from the bracket and keep the painted sign and BOZA already granted permission for the painted sign even though it is below the standard height. BOZA approved despite objections from the departments of City Development, Neighborhood Services and Public Works. The neon sign could be located behind a window and he does not support having it added to the front facade in a different area. The pole sign should be denied as being excessive signage. The rear signage has zero visibility from the public right of way and staff has no objections. Staff recommendations are included in the staff report. The applicant would like to retain the neon sign, although he is not as attached to the pole sign. Karen Peugh - 117 W. Reservoir - she would encourage them to plant trees Ms. Peltz moved for approval with staff conditions, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

3. 180154

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a garage on the alley at 2019 N. Palmer Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District for Joseph and Elizabeth Sedita.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this is a return project from last fall, a complete re-design and he recommends approval. The lighting was worked out with the applicants. Structure will be clad with hardie plank with wood trim. Staff recommends approval with conditions contained in the report. The applicant is fine with those conditions.

Ms. Clendenen-Acosta moved approval with staff conditions, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisebrown.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

4. 180190

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of the front porch at 117 W. Reservoir Avenue in the Brewers Hill Historic District for Gary Lundberg and Karen Peugh.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said that the plan is to re-build the porch in a historic manner and

substantial rehab was done of the entire house in 2003. The front door will now face Reservoir rather than the side yard. Staff recommends approval, but further details are needed relating to the columns. Staff recommends approval with conditions. Applicants are fine with the conditions.

Ms. Peltz moved for approval with staff conditions, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

5. 180191

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for landscaping alterations, construction of fences, reconstruction of the east porch, and construction of garden structures at 3209 W. Wells Street, the George Schuster House, an individually designated historic property, for Rick and Laura Sue Mosier.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the project is an elebarate garden design with changes to the porch. The porch is not attached, it's a floating porch. Staff has no serious issues with the landscaping, some minor concerns with the fencing in front as the land is unusable due to security issues with the neighborhood as people cut across their property all the time. The fence will be 36" in height; the proposed dogwood tree might be disallowed due sight line issues. The pavers in the yard will be all lime stone and the fountain will match that. The gate will be steel and the fence will be aluminum. Staff has no objections to the reconstructed porch. The pergola is acceptable with some conditions relating to the details and feels the brackets are too complex while the posts are too simple. Staff recommends approval of the fence portion that are in the front line of the house shall run only with the current owner and shall expire upon sale. Ald. Bauman is concerned that this is not legal, but the owner does not object to this condition. Mr. Askin suggested working with staff relating to the design of the upper half.

Ms. Keating Kahn moved for approval with first 3 conditions listed in the staff report, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eiesenbrown.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

6. 180208

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a replacement one-car garage at 2118 E. Kenilworth Place in the North Point South Historic District for Amine Benbazza.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the application is to construct a one-car garage which is the same size as the former garage, but the applicant may decide to make it 4" bigger. Mr. Askin recommends approval with conditions, which is basically approval as proposed. Ms. Pieper Eisebrown moved for approval with conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

7. 180233

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of various signs at 2320 N. Lake Drive, St. Mary's Hospital, an individually designated historic property, for Medxcel on behalf of Columbia-St. Mary's and Ascension Wisconsin.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to replace two monument signs and to permanently remove other signs. HPC only has jurisidction over two signs only. The corner sign replaces an internally lit sign with a sign having better dimensions; the rear of the sign is also nicer than the currently existing sign. The sign is acceptable as proposed. Applicant is fine adding the logo and text to the proposed sign. The other sign is basically the same size and in the same spot; one condition relates to the lighting and recommends approval with conditions detailed in the report. Applicant is fine with the conditions.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for approval with conditions, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

8. 180239

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition to the garage at 1823 N. Palmer Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District for Stephen J. Bialk.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

RECESS: 3:45 P.M. RECONVENE: 4:01 P.M.

Mr. Tim Askin said two proposed additions are being added to an existing garage, which is living space that serves as an air bnb. The lath house wil be used as garden space and has wood slats, but there is no meaningful enclosure. The slats defuse the light and wind and the property is used for gardening and for weddings. The main

house is Italianate, very elaborate and has a large lot. It has become a destination for garden groups. The applicant is also proposing a connector space between the lath house and the carriage barn. Mr. Bialk said he bought the 3 city lots in 1985 and has been working on the property ever since. Lath houses function as shade houses and he'll use it as a focal point in the garden. The architect is Ryan Shortbridge, who also offered testimony. Staff got two new variations this morning, so the staff report is out of date. The buildings function as backdrops for the gardens and will be natural wood or stained. Mr. Askin thinks the lathe house is too flat and would like to see a recessed panel in the connector. There will also be a deck so someone can overlook the garden.

Ms. Peltz moved subject to staff approval of the details based on the latest set of drawings submitted at today's hearing, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown.

A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

9. 170834

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for removing a fence and building a new retaining wall at 2555 N. Summit Avenue along the Downer Avenue frontage in the North Point North Historic District for Lisa Lennihan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

10. 171911

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of rooftop HVAC equipment at 735 N. Water Street (AKA 733 -743), The First National Bank/First Wisconsin National Bank Building, an individually designated historic property, for Compass Properties and WageWorks.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

11. 180012

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof and gutters repairs to the former school building at 924 E. Clarke Street in the St. Casimir's Roman Catholic Church Complex Historic District for St. Casimir's Parish.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

12. 180016

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing portions of roofing with new slate and other roof repairs at 2518 N.

Terrace Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Larry Bonney.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

13. 180018

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a metal fence at 2649 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Sheryl Ellis.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

14. 180019

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of HVAC ventilation pipes on the north side of the house at 3317 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Jeffery Knox.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

15. 180027

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a fence at 2715 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Andrew Schramm.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

16. 180041

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for rooftop HVAC equipment at 3114 N. Sherman Boulevard (formerly 4246 W. Burleigh Street) in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Pakhar Singh.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

17. 180090

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of HVAC equipment on the alley side of 522 N. Water Street in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Nulala Nails.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

18. 180094

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs to the garage at 2682 N. Summit Avenue in the North Point North Historic

District for Sammis and Jean White.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

19. <u>180113</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing a wood fence with a metal fence at 743 N. 25th Street, the William J. Turner House, an individually designated historic property, for Sonja Posey.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

20. 180188

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for rebuilding a chimney at 952 N. 34th Street in the Concordia Historic District for Joel Schlachtenhaufen.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

21. 180223

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for refacing an existing box sign at 1730 S. 13th Street in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Jomela Butters, LLC on behalf of Ascension Seton Dental Clinic.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

22. 180225

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for permanently removing some signs and replacing other signs at 2607 N. Downer Avenue in the Downer Avenue Historic District for CVS.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

23. <u>180238</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of an A/C unit at 2104 E. Lafayette Place in the North Point South Historic District for Mary Beth Geraci.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

24. 180241

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the copper gutters with new copper gutters in the same style at 2239 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point South Historic District for Thomas F. & Suzanne C. Roepsch.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

25. 180246

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for re-roofing the house with cedar shingles to match the existing roof at 2014 E. Lafayette Place in the North Point South Historic District for Paul Vogelsang.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that

this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

26. <u>180250</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing an awning at the north entrance of 201-225 W. Vine Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District for the United Way.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

27. 180257

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the glass in the storm windows on the church building at 836 - 844 N. Broadway, (Old) St. Mary's Roman Catholic Church & Rectory, an individually designated historic property, for the Catholic Diocese of Milwaukee.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

28. 180260

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the garage at doors at 2145 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Appleton Rental Homes.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

29. 180278 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an awning and

a projecting sign at the rear of 1033 N. Old World Third Street in the Old World Third Street Historic District for Bobby Wiltgen of Oak Barrel Public House.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

30. 180284

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of new wood storm windows and replacement of gutters and downspouts at 2628 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Julie Penman and Jeffrey Bentoff.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

31. 180307

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two signs at 1210 North 10th Street, Brewery Block 4, in the Pabst Brewery Complex Historic District, for Vim & Vigor.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

32. 180328

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for tuckpointing and repairs to a retaining wall at 3022 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Christin Saint Pierre.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

33. 180335

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the in-kind replacement of the front stair railing of the office addition at 1046 N. 9th Street, the Trinity Lutheran Church Complex, an individually designated historic property, for Trinity Evangelical Lutheran Congregation.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Jarosz

Review and approval of the minutes from the April 2nd, May 7th and May 16th meetings.

Ms. Peltz moved, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

Updates and announcements.

Mr. Tim Askin said the state is running an online training on June 12th and members are encouraged to participate if they wish.

Meeting adjourned: 4:24 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.