

# **City of Milwaukee**

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

## **Meeting Minutes**

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MATT JAROSZ, CHAIR
Ald. Robert Bauman, Vice Chair
Marion Clendenen-Acosta, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and
Patricia Keating Kahn
Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
Ielmer@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov
Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov
Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Monday, December 11, 2017

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-A

Meeting convened: 3:01 P.M.

**1.** 161667

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mothball certificate for 1134 W. Historic Mitchell Street, known as the Modjeska Theater, in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Modjeska Theater Project, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. John Kesselman - Mequon - said the first priority was to stabilize the sidewalk with a shoring system. They have bids on all the proposed work for the building. They have done about \$14,000 in masonry work to secure everything and they have talked to two banks about financing. They are looking at using it as a theater as well as for events. He is estimating they'll be beginning construction in spring.

Mike Manning - Dept. of Neighborhood Services - the department has no objections at this point. They still need to get permits yet, both from DNS and DPW.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved to extend the COA for 6 months. Seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

2. 170868 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a complete landscape design including a driveway realignment, sports patio with

basketball court, new plantings, and elimination of the circle drive at 3252 N. Lake Drive in the North Lake Drive Estates Historic District for Rick & Maggie Barrett.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this was heard last month and there were just some window and finish issues as well as the sports patio. The landscaping was submitted and staff did not object to the proposed plantings. The homeowner began work after being told not to begin work until a landscape plan was approved by the Commission. Staff does note that there have been significant athletic activities in the front lawn beginning in the 1940s with a pool. The neighbor next to the patio has no objections as long as there is no permanent lighting. There are some zoning codes relating to the length of the driveway as well as the number of parking spaces. Staff supports the sports patio with conditions.

Atty. Elizabeth Shimek - present for the owner

Chris Miracle - landscape designer

Approve, with conditions and that this not set a precedent for other properties, by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. Seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

#### 3. Request for a historic plaque for 2774 N. Grant Blvd.

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the house was built in 1931 on Grant Blvd, which has both national and local historic designation. Staff says this does meet historic criteria and recommends approval of the application.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta, for approval of the plaque. There were no objections.

#### **4**. 171026

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the fire-damaged carriage house (garage) at 3037 W. Kilbourn Avenue in the Concordia Historic District for Brian D. Miracle.

## **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this is a proposal to demolish a fire-damaged garage. Two garages were damaged and the one on the left will be repaired while this one is beyond saving. The garage will be replaced by a garage from the HPC model design catalog. Staff recommends approval with conditions.

Brian Miracle - 3037 W. Kilbourn - damage was done by the WE Energies transformer. Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for approval with conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

#### **5**. 171087

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the majority of windows and siding at 2012 N. Palmer Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District for Larry Roffers.

#### Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the owners since 1982 have not been kind to this building, except the current owner, who is proposing to replace all windows with wood windows and he has uncovered some windows under the siding. He will be replicating trim from a nearby house as this house has no original trim remaining except for one window in the peak.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for approval with conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

#### **6.** <u>171146</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reconfiguring the second storefront from the north at 2650 N. Downer Avenue in the Downer Avenue Historic District for Eric Resch of Stone Creek Coffee.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said Stone Creek Coffee has expanded its business plans and are now incorporating a second storefront into its plans. The work will include a new entry door. A 3-piece window was installed prior to HPC approval, while staff recommended a 2-pane window in that area. Ms. Clendenen-Acosta has no objections to the 3-pane window.

Ms. Clendenen-Acosta likes the design as proposed.

Ms. Clendenen-Acosta moved for approval as submitted with the 3-pane window, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

7. 171150 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an illuminated

rooftop sign, a monument sign, and several wall-mounted signs at 735 N. Water Street (AKA 733 -743), The First National Bank/First Wisconsin National Bank Building, an individually designated historic property, for Compass Properties.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this is a complex sign request including a rooftop sign, a monument sign of painted aluminum and stone and two color signs along the riverwalk and one wall sign on Water Street. The building was completed in 1914. Staff is generally recommending approval with design considerations left up to the Commissioners. The rooftop sign will be illuminated which can be all blue, all orange, all white or a combination of the three colors Staff recommends approval of the signs with conditions listed. Ms. Hatala noted that rooftop signs are not commonly proposed for historic buildings, but it has been done before. Ms. Clendenen-Acosta thought white was more glaring at night while orange and blue seemed softer and more subtle. She would also support having the height of the rooftop sign be reviewed by staff. Staff would also like a motion that all rooftop signs come before the Commission. Sheldon Opperman - works for the property owner - they had looked at different options for placement of the rooftop sign. It is primarily visible from the north face. Mike Kinsella - Poblocki Sign Company - the proposed colors are orange, blue, orange for the words with a small white border.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for approval of all signs as proposed and for the rooftop sign with colors orange or blue with white border and all proposed rooftop signs need to come before the Commission, with the height be approved by the staff, seconded by Ms Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

#### **8.** 171151

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements and alterations related to a hotel conversion of 817 - 819 N. Marshall Street, the Charles Koeffler House, an individually designated historic property, for C J Taxman Interests, Inc.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this office building, which was a former duplex, will be converted to a boutique hotel. There are minor proposed exterior changes. One entry door will be sealed. A landscape plan was also submitted, which staff supports. The columns and railings will be considered at a later date. A privacy fence is also being proposed as well as a rear deck, wheelchair lift and an HVAC building in the rear. There will also be new signs in the rear. The front porch needs extensive work and has been poorly patched over time and the owner proposes to use a limestone paver.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved to approve with staff conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion

Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

Roll call taken at 4:00 P.M.

Present: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 2 - Jarosz, VACANCY

### **9**. <u>171152</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for extending the existing rooftop deck toward Brady Street at 1311 E. Brady Street in the Brady Street Historic District for Jo-Cat's Inc.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to extend the existing rooftop deck by 16"-18" for an extra 140 extra square feet. Staff supports the lower level design, but does not support a blank wall on the upper level.

Staff recommends historically accurate windows on the upper level, which do not need to be operable but need to simulate double-hung windows.

Dan Beyer - architect

Lorenzo Cataldo - son of the owner - the whole project started as a way to enclose the area and deal with the snow. The wall is solid for patron safety as well as a very high railing on the deck.

Ald. Nik Kovac - he doesn't like the blank wall and supports the windows Staff recommends synthetic double hung windows on the upper floor.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for 1-3 double-hung windows with historically appropriate trim and to work with staff on the final decision, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Jarosz, and VACANCY

#### **10.** 171154

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the 1899 parish house addition and construction of a new tower addition consisting of event space and apartments at 833 W. Wisconsin Avenue, St. James Episcopal Church, an individually designated historic property, for J. Jeffers & Co.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the church dates to 1868 and following an 1872 fire, the interior was rebuilt. The parish house was attached in 1899. The interior was re-done in 1914 and has remained unchanged since. The parish house is basically a 1962-theme office building. The proposal is to demolish an entire wing. It is surrounded by other national registered historic buildings. The parish house would be demolished and a new building constructed in its place.

Staff researched other churches with attached parish halls and this building is unique in terms of its age and the fact that the parish house is attached.

The applicant is proposing the building as a backdrop to the church and will not detract from it.

Mr. Askin read both the demolition and addition guidelines for the building. The proposed building details are not specific enough in terms of materials being used and the building does not match the gothic lines of the church. Staff recommends holding all portions of the application and the owner work with staff for either the January or February meeting.

The new building will include event space and apartments and the existing trusses will be repurposed and used in the new building.

Josh Jeffers - 225 E. Michigan - owner - working on this since last May and they are using historic tax credits and see this as an adaptive re-use. Proportionally this building has a lot of asbestos so it is very cost-prohibitive. By building this new addition they will be able to subsidize the rest of the work and preserve the church, which is visible from Wisconsin Avenue, while the parish house is not. The intention is to have this building blend into the background. They are trying to get this approved prior to December 31 so it can be on the list of projects approved for tax credits. Mark Ernst - the church is no longer operating and the congregation was prepared to demolish the church.

John Henessey - represents the St. James Court historic apartments, next to the church - he thinks Josh and his company are the right people to do this project and he supports demolition of the parish house to generate the investment to preserve the church.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbronw moved hold pending more information, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Jarosz, and VACANCY

#### **11.** 171155

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a seven-story building on the vacant lot at 511 N. Broadway in the East Side Commercial Historic District for J. Jeffers & Co.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said there was a fire and damaged 5 buildings, which were demolished and replaced by surface parking. The proposed building has 7 stories and is set back from the historic Mackie building. The proposed building, per staff, is not unique and does not add to the historic fabric of the block or the district. There are also too many

different window types and staff recommends holding this application to address concerns and obtain more details on the proposed materials.

Josh Jeffers - 225 E. Michigan - he also owns the Mackie building and other buildings in the area. He's been talking in excess of 3 years about putting something on this site. This would be a \$32 million building. Engberg Anderson is the 3rd firm they have worked with and he loves this design. He wanted a building which would also allow the Mackie Building to be seen and fit within the neighborhood. The contract with Uihlein Properties expires on January 6th.

Timothy Wallis - Engberg Anderson architects - he understands the concern about the windows, but the corner window is very unique and it works with the Mackie building. David Uihlein - 322 E. Michigan St. - he owns 9 parcels in this area, one of which he wants to sell to Mr. Jeffers for this project. He likes the proposed design and contemporary facade. He thinks the window geometry is appropriate to the Mackie building.

Ms. Keating Kahn has previously seen this design and also loves it. Ald. Bauman also saw it previously.

There will also be courtyards with apartments on floors 5-7, retail on the first floor and office uses on the other floors (or may be residential use).

The application does not have complete drawings.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown would like more information and feels the Engberg Anderson is capable of so much more.

Ms. Clendenen-Acosta thinks the datum lines with the Mackie building are fine and agrees with many aspects of this project, but more data is needed.

Ald. Bauman moved to approve the footprint of the building with details to follow later, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. There were no objections.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Jarosz, and VACANCY

Roll call taken at approximately 5:00 P.M.

Present: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, VACANCY

#### **12**. 171156

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for porch repairs at 818 E. Brady Street in the Brady Street Historic District for Jeno Cataldo.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the proposal is to replace the deck, skirting and railing on the lower level. A complaint was filed when a PVC railing was used to replace a metal railing. Before staff could view the location, the railing was replaced by a wood railing, but of inferior workmanship. The deck and skirting are approved by staff, but the railing is not. Staff recommends replacement of the hand rails within 60 days and post caps

installed on the rails and within a year completely rebuild the railing to a historic design in a workmanlike manner.

Lynn Kuester - president of the Brady Street Association - wants to ensure Mr. Cataldo is not neglecting his residential property.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved for approval with conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No**: 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

## The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

**13.** 171137

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repair and replacement of gutters and downspouts on the south and west sides of the building at 1145 W. Wisconsin Avenue, Gesu Church, an individually designated historic property, for Gesu Parish Inc.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No:** 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

**14**. 171234

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of a rear second story jump porch and repair of the former opening at 832 N. 29th Street, in the Concordia Historic District, for Brian Holman.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No:** 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

**15**. 171260

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a wall sign and projecting sign on the Water Street elevation and a canopy sign on the rear elevation at 524 N. Water Street, in the East Side Commercial

Historic District, for Corey Smith.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

**No:** 0

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, Bauman, and VACANCY

## Review and approval of the minutes from the November 6th meeting.

Ms. Pieper Eseinbrown moved, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

## Updates and announcements.

There were no announcements.

Meeting adjourned: 5:26 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.