

City of Milwaukee

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

PATRICIA KEATING KAHN, CHAIR Anna-Marie Opgenorth, Vice Chair Ald. Robert Bauman, Marion Clendenen-Acosta, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Blair Williams Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456, lelmer@milwaukee.gov HPC Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, chatal@milwaukee.gov Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679, dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov

Tuesday, September 13, 2016	3:00 PM	City Hall, Room 301-B
Tuesday, September 13, 2016	3:00 PM	City Hall, Room 301-E

Meeting convened: 3:02 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 2 - Williams, Opgenorth

1. Review and approval of the minutes from the last meeting.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown moved, seconded by *Mr.* Jarosz, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

2. <u>160524</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the slate roof and installation of an asphalt shingle roof at 3011 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Thomas Matthews.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said that the owner asked that this be held as he is in the process of buying the property and needs more time.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Opgenorth, and Williams

3. <u>160525</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for remodeling the front porch at 959 North 34th Street in the Concordia Historic District for Jeff Waldorf.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said that this project involves work on the porch. There is currently a stone porch with wood posts and a bay at the front. This type of porch was very popular for a time with no roof over the rounded end of the porch. The porch deck and cement columns are in poor condition. A full front porch was built after 1910 and a bay added probably at the same time. One of the concerns of staff is extending the roof and possibly altering an existing window. The homeowner also wants to remove an existing window on the second floor, although it is not known from which era the window is from. Staff recommends approval with conditions.

Jeff Waldorf - owner of the property - the window casing is post-World War II and he thinks the window was added in the 1960s based upon the framing and casing. The one fluted column is slowly being destroyed. There never was a roof over this portion of the porch. There are no footers on the column, which is why it is sinking. He will re-use the lannon stone exterior.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

- Aye: 5 Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn
- **No:** 0
- Excused: 2 Opgenorth, and Williams

4. 160539 Resolution relating to the permanent historic designation of the South Second Street Historic District in the 12th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hata noted that there are documents in the file both in support and opposed. The HPC interns did a fair amount of work on this item. Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown noted that she is on the board of the Walker's Point Association, but she does not own any property in the district. Ald. Bauman questioned as to why the proposed district didn't cover a larger area. Ald. Perez, the nominator, could not attend this meeting. Ms. Hatala said that between Oregon and the alley a number of buildings were demolished in 1965. The parking lot is part of the same tax key, which is why it's included in the district. Reports on each property are included in the file. Ms. Hatala went briefly through the history of each building in the proposed district. Since the national designation, only one building has been lost and is currently an empty lot.

This area was Walker's Point and development was helped by a nearby railroad depot and the confluence of the rivers. Staff recommends approval of the designation as it meets e-1 and e-5. By 1876 most of the buildings were solid masonry with long-term owners with uses changing from service and retail to light manufacturing. In recent decades, it's become the entertainment district for the LGBTQ community with historians becoming interested in this area again. The area has very good examples of a variety of styles used in commercial buildings. Supporters:

Lori Gensch - 16000 Skycliff Dr. in Brookfield - she owns a number of properties in the proposed district; approximately half of the properties. The district is very compact and we are stewards of these fine buildings and they need to be preserved. Dawn McCarthy - Milwaukee Preservation Alliance - feels the district meets the criteria of the ordinance and that designation would protect the investment of all owners in the district.

Opponents:

Jason Albrecht, Mark Zimmerman and Doug Barnes - opposed, but didn't wish to

speak

Ann Parks - 219 S. 2nd St. - this is the only owner-occupied property in the district owned by herself and her husband. She feels it would be too burdensome to run all renovations through this body and both she and her husband work full-time. Michael Spooner - owner of 235-237 S. 2nd. St. - lives in Mequon - 10156 Sheridan Dr. - questions why just this one block is being designated. He didn't receive a notice as the notice went to his old address.

Michael Lueder - Foley & Lardner - represents the Pittsburgh Ave., LLC, which owns 133 W. Pittsburgh (200 S. 2nd St - the 3 Larkin buildings and the parking lot) - the notice was deficient as no study report was included. His client is proposing development on this street and the buildings weren't included in the federal designation as they were deemed "non contributory" and the surface parking lots offer no historical value. There is precedence for designating only part of parcels of historic. He asks that the parking lot designation be denied and the Sperry building be removed from the district.

Ald. Bauman moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Jarosz. There were no objections.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Opgenorth, and Williams

5. <u>160570</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear porch railing and garage repairs at 948 North 34th Street in the Concordia Historic District for Philip Perry.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said the property has been under renovation by Mr. Perry since 2011 and the work has been proceeding, but the front porch is now completed. Skylights were added when the re-roofing was done and the commission denied those skylights. Mr. Perry wants to re-build a porch and complete work on the garage. The porch will mirror the front porch and the garage will preserve the framing and clad over the second opening, so there is only one opening to the garage. He will add wood windows to the garage and have a tip-up door if affordable, with tongue-in-groove siding, which mimics the work of some of the older coach houses. He'll also install wood windows and cedar siding on the upper story of the garage and a water cap so the garage will look period-appropriate. He will choose a door based upon the cost. Staff recommends approval, and giving Mr. Perry the option to choose a door based upon cost.

Phil Perry -- 938 N. 34th St. - owner - the better option will probably be be-fold doors as tip-up doors are too expensive. He'll be restoring the original windows and replacing broken panes. The lower portion siding will be what staff wants and he'll do cedar siding for the upper story. His woodworking shop will be moved into the garage.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Opgenorth, and Williams

6. <u>160571</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for various renovations to the house at 2214 North Terrace Avenue in the North Point South Historic District for Art and Rhonda Downey.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said that this is said to be the oldest house on Terrace Avenue and was built between 1860 and 1865 and, after being sold in 1902, additions were added. More additions and changes were made in 1915, which included adding a "lake room" among other changes. The house was converted into a duplex in 1949 and a 3-car garage was constructed. The owners want to take care of some long-deferred maintenance issues and convert it back to a single-family. Molding and columns have water and weather damage and gutters are also in need of rehabilitation. There will be 4 exterior drains, which will be copper. The windows also need repair as well as the brick exterior. Various repair work will be done throughout the house with French doors added to the second floor and some windows with an added railing. The garage was added last week - it will be re-roofed and more period-appropriate doors added. Staff recommends approval for the bulk of the work, but not for the use of metal clad windows, the painting of cream city brick and the gentlest pressure washing required. Any leaded glass transoms, if still existing, would need to be retained.

Brian Sheive - Lakeside Development Company - developer working with the architect and owners.

Jim Dorr - Living Space Design Build -

Art and Rhonda Downey - owners - just purchased the house in May of this year. No significant improvements have been made since the late 1940s or early 1950s - it was leaking in 3 locations and the basement is very scary. They are eager to make this house a gem again. They want a consistent look to the east side elevation in terms of the windows, but they won't all be wood. The paint is lead-based paint and is bright red. The quote to take it back to brick is significantly more than painting it and the house has been added to four times, so not sure what the brick will even look like. They will not be using the paint that Ms. Hatala objects to. The owners are fine keeping the windows plain on the east elevation, rather than using transom windows that are divided and appear fake. There is no leaded glass in the transoms. If the owner can find a photograph with divided light, Ms. Hatala can review that and decided if they can be permitted.

The owner needs to be cognizant of what the state historic office requires for tax credits.

Mr. Jarosz moves for approval, with proper consideration for the simple metal rail on the second floor, painting done in collaboration with the state and the transom windows not be divided, seconded by Ald. Bauman.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

- Aye: 5 Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn
- **No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Opgenorth, and Williams

7. <u>160567</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new parking structure on the Wgema Campus (Former Concordia College Campus) at 3215 West State Street in the Concordia Historic District for the Forest County Potawatomi Community c/o Wgema Leasing.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said that this project was part of a detailed plan development that was approved over five years ago. The proposal is to construct a parking structure, which was already approved by the City Plan Commission and it was approved at Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development Committee this morning. The parking structure will have one level at grade and one below grade and will have 118 spaces. The perimeter will have aluminum fencing and be accessed off 32nd and 33rd streets. It will have simple fenestration which mirrors the fenestration on another building on the site. A landscaping plan was also submitted which is quite extensive. Staff recommends approval. Alison Nemec - Quorum Architects Chris Hall - Quorum Architects - there will be lights at every column, so 4-5 lights that will have minimal light spillage.

Tom Devine - lives at 31st and Wisconsin

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Opgenorth, and Williams

8. Updates and announcements.

Ms. Hatala said there are no updates or announcements.

9. The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

a. <u>160556</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of heating and cooling units on the rooftop at 614 North Broadway in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Roger Kriete.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

- Aye: 5 Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
- **No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth

b. <u>160557</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new driveway, rear walk and stoop at 2913 North Lake Drive in the North Lake Drive Historic District for Jean Hausmann and Teri Kolb.

<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

- **Excused:** 2 Williams, and Opgenorth
- c. <u>160560</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new furnace and venting at 4420 North 25th Street in the Garden Homes Historic District for Kimberly Ely.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

- **Excused:** 2 Williams, and Opgenorth
- d. <u>160561</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new air conditioning condenser to replace an old one in the rear of 3011 West State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Thomas Matthews.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

- **Excused:** 2 Williams, and Opgenorth
- e. <u>160562</u> Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of an air duct at 4001 South 6th Street, in the Town of Lake Water Tower, for the City of Milwaukee.
 - <u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR

				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that ution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
f.	<u>160566</u>	face a	at the	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new sign e Sanford Kane House at 1841 North Prospect Avenue, an ly designated historic property, for Zachary Dean.
		<u>Spons</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that ution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
g.	<u>160568</u>	of the repair	win ring v	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for restoring all dows, installing storm doors, rebuilding rear porch/stoop, wood gate across driveway at 832 N. 29th Street in the a Historic District for Brian Holman.
		<u>Spons</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that ution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
h.	<u>160563</u>		17 E	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new signage ast Brady Street in the Brady Street Historic District for effers.
		<u>Spons</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that ution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth

i.	<u>160564</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing new wood double hung windows and new corbel at 1013 N. Old World Third Street in the Old World Third Street Historic District for Michelle and Michael Schaefer.	
		Sponsors: THE CHAIR	
		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:	
		Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn	
		No: 0	
	Ех	cused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth	
j.	<u>160579</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for stucco repair, wood trim repair and repointing brick at 2210 North Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Jagpal Waraich.	
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR	
		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:	
		Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn	
		No: 0	
	Ex	cused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth	
k.	<u>160580</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new signage at 500 North Water Street in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Button Block Holdings LLC.	
		Sponsors: THE CHAIR	
		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:	
		Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn	
		No: 0	
	Ех	cused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth	
L.	<u>160639</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repaving the driveways with brick pavers and re-installing original shutters at 2107 East Kenilworth Place in the North Point South Historic District for Redentor & Gloria Galang.	
		<u>Sponsors:</u> THE CHAIR	

		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:		
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
m.	<u>160640</u>	replac High S	eme Scho	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a ent fire escape at 2525 N. Sherman Boulevard (Washington ool) in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for the e Public Schools.
		<u>Sponso</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that Ition be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
n.	<u>160559</u>	rear co	back	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reroofing the n house at 3014 W. McKinley Boulevard in the Cold Spring pric District for Stephanie Powe.
		<u>Sponso</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
				vas made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that ition be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth
ο.	<u>160565</u>	siding	and	n relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new cedar I trim at 110 W. Brown Street in the Brewers Hill Historic Dan Current.
		<u>Sponso</u>	ors:	THE CHAIR
		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:		
		Aye:	5 -	Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn
		No:	0	
		Excused:	2 -	Williams, and Opgenorth

р.	160661	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing driveway and garage floor with new concrete at 2674 North Summit Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for David Klehm and Carol Kraft.	
		Sponsors: THE CHAIR A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:	
		Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn	
		No: 0	
	Exc	cused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth	
q.	<u>160662</u>	Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement HVAC equipment at 2207 East Ivanhoe Place in the North Point South Historic District for Roger Quindel.	
		Sponsors: THE CHAIR	
		A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, th this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote	
		Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn	
		No: 0	

Excused: 2 - Williams, and Opgenorth

Meeting adjourned: 5:20 P.M. Linda M. Elmer Staff Assistant This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.