



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MARION CLENDENEN-ACOSTA, CHAIR

Patricia Keating Kahn, Vice Chair

Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Anna-Marie Opgenorth,

Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Blair Williams

Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,

lelmer@milwaukee.gov

HPC Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, chatal@milwaukee.gov

HPC Planner: Dean Doerrfeld, 286-5712,

ddoerr@milwaukee.gov

Tuesday, September 15, 2015

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:39 P.M.

Present: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Williams, Opgenorth, Keating Kahn

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta

1. Introduction of Dean Doerrfeld, new HPC staff member.

Mr. Doerrfeld worked in Maryland and consulted for the U.S. Dept. of Defense prior to accepting this position.

2. Review and approval of the minutes from the last meeting.

Mr. Jarosz moved, seconded by Ms. Opgenorth, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

3. [140672](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mothball certificate for portions of the Henry Palmer Lodge/Love Tabernacle, an individually designated structure at 2640 N. 1st Street.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Toussaint Harris came to the table - he ordered 11 ballisters, which resulted in damage to the foundation when the new ballisters were installed.

Mr. Ron Roberts, Dept. of Neighborhood Services, said they are pleased with the progress of the work, but would like to get a schedule of proposed work for the next six months and have that provided to the Dept. of Neighborhood Services.

The work is more extensive than the applicant first thought. The building is monitored monthly by the Department.

Mr. Williams moved for approval of continuation of the certificate, seconded by Mr. Jarosz. There were no objections. A friendly amendment was added to incorporate the list of proposed projects for the next six months.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

4. [150476](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a below grade garage at 2105 E. Lafayette Place in the North Point South Historic District for David Quadracci.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

The Commission, from the previous meeting, wanted to be provided with more detail on the retaining wall materials. The architects are here for the project and brought product samples. The Commission was concerned about the thinness of the proposed product. Mr. Williams thinks that as the materials change, that it's appropriate to review materials on a case-by-case basis, although material similar to this was rejected for a property on Terrace Ave.

Richard Chair and Brian Widderman - Deep River Partners

Ald. Bauman suggested getting limestone from foundations of destroyed homes in the city. The architects liked the warranty provided by a new product and feared that the limestone may not be able to handle the surge experienced by a retaining wall. The architects had considered poured concrete, but didn't think it would look good with a historic home. The architects preferred the engineered block, which the Commission doesn't support.

Held to revisit the retaining wall material.

A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

5. [150477](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new house at 2115 E. Lafayette Place in the North Point South Historic District for David Quadracci.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala provided a revised view of the proposed changes. Applicant proposes metal clad wood windows, which the Commission typically opposes.

Richard Chair and Brian Widderman - Deep River Partners - architects

The Commission reviewed the proposed windows product by product. The applicant brought more window samples as well as he met with Ms. Hatala and Mr. Jarosz with window samples. The proposed windows are the highest quality windows that the applicant can get on the market. This building is a new building, not a historic house, although it is in an historic district. The warranty on the windows is 30 years. Mr. Jarosz hopes that this product will last long-term. Mr. Williams said that Marvin

windows are top of the market, so the quality expectations should be met.

Ms. Opgenorth moved, seconded by Mr. Williams, for approval of the windows.

As regards the roof, the applicant is proposing synthetic materials, rather than slate.

Ms. Hatala visited a fire engine company with these materials that were used in 1998 and it has issues of cupping and rolling. A test case from 1999 resulted in discoloration and cupping of individual pieces. The applicant is proposing a plastic product for the roof.

Mr. Williams noted that the slate isn't the only required product - the applicant has cheaper options that can be used, but the plastic materials have shown failure on different buildings. The product carries a lifetime warranty and the company is well-known, per the architect.

Mr. Jarosz also thought the feds would also support just using a good-quality slate roof, rather than a plastic slate roof. Mr. Jarosz would prefer not to fake people out with plastic shingles and just use asphalt. The architect really likes the plastic slate. Mr. Jarosz is also concerned with how it will wear and change in terms of color. Mr. Williams is inclined to approve the plastic slate roof.

David Qudracci - 2105 E. Lafayette - he will move into the new house so if the roof product isn't a good one, he'll be the one to suffer with it. With his former house he had a lot of problems with an asphalt roof. Ald. Bauman doesn't support the use of plastic slate as he thinks that, if approved, no-one will ever install a new slate roof. Mr. Doerrfeld didn't support the use of plastic slate and noted that these roofs do require maintenance.

Mr. Williams isn't opposed because the average person won't be able to tell this isn't real slate. He doesn't think the durability of the product falls under jurisdiction of the Commission.

Mr. Williams moved for approval of the plastic slate roof, there were no seconds.

Mr. Williams moved for approval of the material under the condition it not be intended to simulate slate. There were no seconds.

Ms. Opgenorth moved to table this issue, seconded by Mr. Williams. There were no objections.

Mr. Williams moved, seconded by Mr. Jarosz, to approve the revised elevations as submitted. There were no objections.

The Commission reviewed the proposed cast stone product that would be used for sills and on the walls of the house.

Mr. Williams moved approval of the cast stone product, seconded by Mr. Jarosz, for new construction. There were no objections.

Ms. Hatala again stressed preserving or moving the wrought iron fence.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Jarosz, Bauman, Williams, Opgenorth, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

6. [150582](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reinstallation of the Bay View Historical Society's Plaque at the Pryor Avenue Iron well, an individually-designated historic site, at 1710 E. Pryor Avenue for the Milwaukee Water Works.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said the structure was restored to its appearance when the well head was first constructed in 1918 or 1919. An alternative is to install a plaque on the pavers

around the well or on the door of the well head.

Objectors:

Donna Pogliano - provided a written statement, attached to the file.

John Pogliano is reading Ms. Pogliano's statement due to public speaking stress faced by his mother.

Ron Winkler - Bay View Historical Society

Ald. Bauman moved to hold. There were no seconds.

Mr. Williams supported putting the plaque on the grass area.

Laura Daniels - Milwaukee Water Works

Ald. Zielinski supports putting the plaque on the door with a non-penetrating adhesive.

Ald. Bauman moved for the plaque on a door with a non-penetrating adhesive. There were no seconds.

Ms. Pogliano would be okay putting it flush with the concrete or in the grass, but it would also have to be flush or approval gotten for something above ground.

Mr. Williams moved to hold for a month so the two parties can meet, seconded by Ms. Opgenorth. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Anna-Marie Opgenorth, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

7. [150580](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration of the North Point Water Tower, an individually designated Historic Structure, at 2288 North Lake Drive for the Milwaukee Water Works.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala said that an interior and exterior inspection of the North Point Water Tower was done on September 22, 2014. A list of work was created that needs to be done. The city has done some work to mitigate the damage that was a safety hazard. Overall the water tower is in satisfactory condition, although the decorative finials need extensive work. Construction will begin in the spring of 2016. Staff recommends approval.

John Stryker - exp - architect - the repainting of the roof will be done in 2016, as the painting by itself is over \$200,000.

Mike Cross - Dept. of Public Works - only partial funding was approved and additional funding will be requested for 2016 (the painting portion)

Mr. Williams moved, seconded by Ms. Opgenorth, for approval. There were no objections. .

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Anna-Marie Opgenorth, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

8. [150587](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a rear addition at 827-829 E. Brady Street in the Brady Street Historic District for Pepperoni Cannoli LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This property was re-built extensively in 1916 and is currently owned by the city, although the applicants are in the process of purchasing the property. Currently before the Commission is a concrete block area off of the alley; the area is not of historical significance and is not of quality materials. It will be replaced with new open porches for apartments at the rear. A new spiral, exterior staircase will be of metal. Staff recommends approval of the demolition and the construction of the porches and staircase with a few conditions specified in the staff report relating to materials and the light fixture.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Anna-Marie Opgenorth, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

9. [150581](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration of the windows, the demolition of a greenhouse and the construction of a new connector at Albrecht Hall and the library at the former Concordia College Campus, now known as the Wgema Campus, at 3138 W. Kilbourn Avenue in the Concordia Historic District for the Forest County Potawatomi Community.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Doerrfeld went through the proposed changes, which involve removal of current in-fill in the windows. The arched windows will be repaired and the green house removed. The doors on the portico will be retained and the transom restored and retained. On the east elevation a central window will be removed and replaced with a door due to emergency egress requirements. The current aluminum windows will be replaced with wood windows. The library was constructed in 1941 and the transom over the door will be retained. The stairs will be restored to their original appearance. The new connector will be two stories in height and will house the interior access with an elevator. Staff recommends approval of the old connector between the two structures and the new construction is compatible and houses required mechanicals and keeps the historic structure intact. The stair replacement is also compatible. Staff does not support metal-clad wood windows or simulated divided light windows in the library. Staff also asks that details on the roof and stairs be provided at a later time.

Minimal area of the property is visible from the public right of way.

Alison Nemec - 3112 W. Highland Blvd. - architect

Ms. Nemec provided a sheet with an overview of the property and pictures of specific buildings, which is contained in the file.

The applicants provided window samples of what is being proposed to use in Albrecht and in the library. Ms. Nemec has been using this type of window for 30 years and is not aware of any issues with poor quality. A concern with these wood

windows is that there is asbestos in the caulk, resulting in a hazardous situation when working with these windows.

John Kramer - Crossey Historic Advisors in Chicago - the National Park Service will review the windows as well. Simulated divided light windows are not unusual in National Park Service buildings.

Ms. Nemec noted that these changes will also be subject to tribal review.

An all-wood window might require larger window frames, so that was a concern.

RECESS: 5:57 P.M.

RECONVENE: 6:01 P.M.

Mr. Williams said it's important that these buildings are basically not visible from the public right of way. Mr. Williams has no issues with the metal windows as they do meet National Park Service standards in this instance.

The Commission had no issue with the new connector.

Mr. Doerrfeld is concerned about any precedent that would be set with metal clad windows.

Mr. Williams moved for approval of Marvin windows for the institutional use with extremely limited public visibility and when a required increased wood window size is required if replaced and if proof is provided that the windows cannot feasibly be removed and repaired as determined by staff and the architect for both buildings, seconded by Ald. Bauman. There were no objections.

Charles Offermeier, architect, said that with the asbestos the windows must be re-built, which won't be a long-lasting as the Marvin windows or be as energy-efficient, which is very important to the Potawatomi community.

Staff will review what windows are salvagable and will come before the Commission on this issue if the two parties cannot reconcile.

All other requested items were approved. Only the windows had conditions set on them.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by ALD. BAUMAN, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

10. [150583](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration and addition to Building 23 (former First German Methodist Church and Forst Keller Restaurant) at 1037 W. Juneau Avenue in the Pabst Brewery Historic District for Blue Ribbon Redevelopment Fund V, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Doerrfeld said that this is for a Certificate for building 23 at the former Pabst brewery. The work will be done on the former church. A two-story addition will be added at the rear of the building and none of the building ornamentation will be covered by the addition. Two openings will be cut in the back wall to allow access to the addition. The angle and pier buttresses are both heavily damaged and will be repaired. The masonry will be cleaned and restored. The new addition will house many of the mechanicals and ancillary functions and house the elevators and a modern staircase. The lower portion will be masonry and the second story brick. There will also be a new patio area off of the addition. One concern Mr. Doerrfeld had was alignment of the addition with the existing building. HPC staff also needs to get details on the replacement of the front door. There was a question about the

enclosure for the trash containers as it is highly visible to both vehicle and pedestrian traffic and has a very industrial look to it, as well as its placement near a buttress. The staff recommends moving it to the rear and providing different screening. Staff recommends approval with conditions as outlined in the staff report with approval to be administered by staff.

Michael Kelly - Blue Ribbon Development

Jason Raiten - Engberg Anderson - there are not a lot of other places to put the trash containers, which will be roll-away, so a truck will not be menacing the buttresses.

Mark Ernst - Enberg Anderson

Mr. Jarosz questioned the joint between the church and the new addition and cautioned that the glass cannot hit the buttress and that it is set back 6" or more.

Mr. Jarosz moved, incorporating comments regarding the trash receptacles and concern about the joint and with staff conditions, seconded by Mr. Williams. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Blair Williams, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

11. Updates and announcements.

There is a Wisconsin historic preservation conference in October.

12. The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

- a. [150521](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for additional fencing at 2691 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Selima and Scott Hargadon.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- b. [150522](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for various repairs including rebuilding the chimney, pouring new concrete driveway, re-decking the front porch, repointing masonry at front porch of 2675 North Summit Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Thomas and Anne Reed.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this

Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- c. [150579](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration and re-installation of the door at 3385 N. Sherman Blvd. in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Alvin Anderson.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- d. [150590](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new wood storms and screens at 2913 N. Lake Drive Unit #2 in the North Lake Drive Historic District for Teri Kolb.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- e. [150591](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new signage and awnings at 634 W. Historic Mitchell Street in the Mitchell Street Historic District for Sharon Huddy, agent for the Women's Care Center.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- f. [150592](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs, painting and re-stuccoing of the house at 2589 N. Lake Drive in the

North Point North Historic District for Jeffrey Loss and Dawn McCarthy.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

g. [150593](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new furnace and central air conditioning unit at 2370 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Robert Perchik.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

h. [150594](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for reroofing the house at 2251 N. Lake Drive in the North Point South Historic District for Madhu and Lisa Sadagopan.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

i. [150595](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new sign faces on the existing sign and awning at 624 N. Water Street in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Hakan Sen and Berat islami.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- j. [150621](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a tent sign for the Schuster Mansion, an individually designated property, at 3209 W. Wells Street for Laura Sue Mosier.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- k. [150622](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new front walk and planters at 2604 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Diane Dziengel, and Michael and Cindy Hosale.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

- L. [150659](#) Resolution relating to a certificate of appropriateness for the new HVAC installation for third floor alterations at 931 N. 33rd Street in the Concordia Historic District for Marc and Jessica Benzakein.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Opgenorth, Williams, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Clendenen-Acosta

Meeting adjourned: 6:43 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer

Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.

