

# **City of Milwaukee**

200 E. Wells Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

# Meeting Minutes HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MATTHEW JAROSZ CHAIR
Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Vice-Chair
Randy Bryant, Ald. Robert Bauman, Brad Hoeschen, Allyson
Nemec, and Blair Williams
Staff Assistant, Chris Lee, 286-2232, Fax: 286-3456,
clee@milwaukee.gov
HPC Planners: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov; Paul Jakubovich, 286-5712,
pjakub@milwaukee.gov

Monday, March 11, 2013

3:00 PM

Room 301-B, Third Floor, City Hall

#### Meeting convened at 3:02 p.m.

Present: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Williams, Hoeschen

Excused: 2 - Bauman, Bryant

# Individuals also present:

Carlen Hatala, Historic Preservation Commission Staff Planner Paul Jakubovich, Historic Preservation Commission Staff Planner

- 1. Roll Call.
- 2. Approval of the Previous Minutes of February 11, 2013.

Mr. Hoeschen moved approval, seconded by Ms. Nemec, of the minutes of February 11, 2013. There were no objections.

3. 121398 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mothball certificate for roofing work at 2640 N. 1st Street, the Henry L. Palmer Lodge/Love Tabernacle, a locally-designated building, for Love

Tabernacle, agent Clara Atwater.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview of the application for a mothball certificate. The commission decided to hold the matter at last month's meeting for the applicant to provide more comprehensive plans for work on the exterior of the building. Plans have been provided by the applicant to address the flat roof, painting, chimney tuck pointing, broken sashes, missing downspouts, and missing balusters. All work is to be completed by April 1, 2014. If granted a mothball certificate the City would remove an existing raze order on the building, suspend any fines or citations on exterior items to be worked on, and establish a longer timeframe for the repairs. The timeframe requested is realistic, and staff recommends acceptance to primarily remove the raze

order.

Ms. Nemec moved for a public hearing, seconded by Mr. Hoeschen. There were no objections.

Individuals from the public appearing: Touissaint Harris, applicant and representative of Love Tabernacle Ron Roberts, Department of Neighborhood Services (DNS)

Mr. Harris said that he has worked with Mr. Roberts and Mr. Jakubovich to come up with a realistic timeframe for the repair work, is positive that the work will be completed by April 1, 2014, and will have fundraisers to raise funds for the repairs. Additional time is being requested to raise funds for items that were not originally considered such as the downspouts, gutters, and chimney. The Love Tabernacle has conducted fundraisers since 1989 between one to three months, held annual events every year, received donations, has people volunteering, and will hold a meeting to determine the amount of funds needed. He added that he is positive about the fundraisers and donations as many people are aware of the organization's operations.

Mr. Roberts gave a few comments. He has worked with Mr. Harris to designate the building after issuance of a condemnation order. A mothball certificate will give DNS assurance on repairs to the exterior of the building. Work on the interior would then proceed in phases with attention paid to details and not based on a rush to get back into the building. Other things have not been discussed but will be determined. A recent exterior walkthrough did not occur as scheduled due to inclement weather. DNS has confidence based on the plans provided. If granted a mothball certificate, a condemnation inspector would dismiss the raze order and refer the building to a commercial inspector, who does annual fire and maintenance inspections. No orders would be issued, but monitoring of the repairs according to the plans of Mr. Harris will be done as a means of review.

Mr. Williams inquired as to the ability of the City to step in and perform work on a neglected historic building with costs that can be assessed back to the property?

Mr. Jakubovich replied that the City can repair exteriors to historic buildings and have done this especially for those buildings with roofs or parts of roofs missing. The Milwaukee Code of Ordinances concerning the Commission allows for this to occur regarding designated buildings where there hasn't been compliance.

Ms. Nemec moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Hoeschen. There were no objections.

Ms. Nemec moved approval, seconded by Mr. Williams, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mothball certificate for roofing work at 2640 N. 1st Street. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Allyson Nemec, seconded by Blair Williams, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 -Bryant, and Bauman

121399 Resolution relating to a certificate of appropriateness for the installation of solar panels on the roof at 929 N. 33rd Street in the Concordia Historic District for Tom and Amy Fritz.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the installation of solar panels at 929 N. 33rd St. The panels were installed on the house without issuance of a building permit and COA, which were an oversight of the contractor. At the last meeting, there were questions about the state statute that applies to the installation of solar panels on residences. The Commission can review these installations. The preference is for a consultation with Commission staff before the design process of such panels and for installations of panels to not occur at the front of buildings. The State Historical Society was asked to weigh in, but it does not have the authority to review this matter due to there being no direct federal subsidy. The Office of Environmental Sustainability (OES) has agreed to work with Commission staff. There will be a possible small seminar educating contractors and installers of the solar equipment, permitting process, COA process if historically designated buildings are involved, and preferable areas of a property for such installations. For this particular case, Commission staff recommends acceptance as the solar collectors are not the real thick collectors. Future COAs of this nature will be reviewed by staff on a case by case basis. Staff approvals are possible for COAs of this nature if they've met the requirement for semi visibility. More visible solar panel proposals will be brought to the Commission for review.

Tom Fritz, property owner, appeared and gave comments. Over the years he and his wife have been interested and installed high efficiency and alternative energy systems. The decision to install solar panels was done due to its recent affordability. In the past they've obtained COAs from the Commission for exterior modifications to their home, such as alterations to two attic windows in 1990 and replacement of asphalt shingles on the roof in 2004. They were misinformed and told that nothing was needed to address the installation of the solar panels on their home.

Mr. Williams questioned the permitting and COA processes for solar panel installations going forward.

Mr. Jakubovich replied that DNS and OES are working on a new and reasonable procedure that will expedite the process resulting in a combined building and electrical permit. Plan examiners will be able to see from records if a property is historically designated and requires a COA for exterior modifications.

Mr. Williams said that the Commission may be able to influence and restrict solar panel installations going forward if the costs and efficiency of the installations are not significantly impacted, but it would be complicated for the Commission to deem such installations inappropriate.

Mr. Jakubovich concurred with Mr. Williams based on out of pocket costs of homeowners. He added that the situation would be completely different if federal dollars are involved.

Ms. Nemec inquired as to the life expectancy of the solar panels and restoration of the home at the time the panels would be removed.

Chuck Smith, Current Electric and installing contractor on the panels, appeared and responded. His company has installed solar panels on buildings and historic properties in the City and throughout Wisconsin since the last four years. The solar panels for this home have a guaranteed output of 25 years and should last 50 years.

Mr. Hoeschen asked if the state statute needs to be applied if this particular installation was granted with a COA by the Commission?

Mary Schanning, Assistant City Attorney, appeared and said that the Commission would be required to apply the state statute only in cases where the Commission places any restrictions on such installations. She added that a COA will be required at the time when the solar panels are removed from this house.

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Mr. Hoeschen, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of solar panels on the roof at 929 N. 33rd St. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Brad Hoeschen, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

#### **5**. 121479

Resolution relating to the historic designation of the Holy Mt. Carmel Missionary Baptist Church at 2127 W. Garfield Avenue, in the 15th Aldermanic District.

#### **Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala gave a presentation and overview of the staff study report regarding the area, significance, congregation, church history, and architect of the Holy Mount Carmel Missionary Baptist Church. The nomination was submitted to recognize the first woman pastor of the church, heart symbol at the front of the church, the church's thriving young congregation, and architectural design of the church.

Details of the Ms. Hatala's overview can be found in the staff study report within the file

On behalf of staff, Ms. Hatala recommended not to designate the church as a historic site based on the church not meeting any of the criteria of the historic preservation ordinance. The applicant was mailed a copy of the staff report and told of staff's opinion to not recommend approval. Perhaps there could be alternative recognition for the church other than historic designation.

Mr. Jakubovich said that the church could possibly be recognized by a plaquing program of the Commission.

Mr. Hoeschen moved for a public hearing, seconded by Ms. Nemec. There were no objections.

Ms. Nemec moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Hoeschen. There were no objections.

Mr. Hoeschen moved to deny historic designation of the Holy Mount Carmel Missionary Baptist Church at 2127 W. Garfield Avenue based on the church not meeting any of the criteria of the historic preservation ordinance. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Brad Hoeschen, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

Holy Mt. Carmel Missionary Baptist Church located at 2127 W.

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

121479 Substitute resolution denying permanent historic designation of the

Garfield Avenue, in the 15th Aldermanic District.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Brad Hoeschen, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

**6.** 121635 Resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 537-541 W. Clark Street, Pabst Tavern, a/k/a Metropolitan Hall in the

6th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended to remove individual designation from this building, which was condemned and completely razed following two

disastrous fires.

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to the termination of historic designation for 537-541 W. Clark Street, Pabst Tavern a/k/a Metropolitan Hall. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

<u>121635</u> Substitute resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 537-541 W. Clarke Street, Pabst Tavern, a/k/a Metropolitan Hall, in

the 6th Aldermanic District.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED TO to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

**7.** 121636

Resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 1131 N. 13th Street, former William Sieglaff Duplex in the 4th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended to remove individual designation from this building, which was condemned and completely razed following massive structural failures.

Ms. Nemec moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to the termination of historic designation for 1131 N. 13th St., former William Sieglaff Duplex. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Allyson Nemec, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

121636

Substitute resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 1131 N. 13th Street, former William Sieglaff Duplex, in the 4th Aldermanic District.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Allyson Nemec, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED TO to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

**8.** 121637

Resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 2863 N. 1st Street, former Daniel Richards House in the 6th Aldermanic

Page 6

City of Milwaukee

District.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended to remove individual designation from the building, which was completely razed following a disastrous fire.

Mr. Hoeschen moved approval, seconded by Ms. Nemec, to the termination of historic designation for 2863 N. 1st Street, former Daniel Richards House. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Brad Hoeschen, seconded by Allyson Nemec, that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

121637

Substitute resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 2863 N. 1st Street, former Daniel Richards House, in the 6th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Brad Hoeschen, seconded by Allyson Nemec, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED TO to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

**9**. 121638

Resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 427 W. Juneau Avenue, former Gipfel Brewery in the 4th Aldermanic District.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended to remove individual designation from the building, which was completely razed following its slow deterioration after being moved to a temporary holding site.

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, to the termination of historic designation for 427 W. Juneau Avenue, former Gipfel Brewery. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

Substitute resolution relating to the termination of historic designation for 427 W. Juneau Avenue, former Gipfel Brewery, in the 4th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AND ASSIGNED TO to the ZONING, NEIGHBORHOODS & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

# 10. Discussion of the Cream of the Cream City Awards.

Mr. Jakubovich suggested that the new Hilton Garden Hotel on Broadway be the location for the awards with its atrium space on the first floor and second level gallery. He added that the suggested date for the awards would be either May 8 or 15, 2013.

Ms. Hatala said that the the application deadline date is online and that voting by the Commission should occur at its next meeting.

Mr. Williams moved that the Cream of the Cream City Awards be set for May 15, 2013 at 5:30 p.m. at the Hilton Garden Hotel. Ms. Nemec seconded. There were no objections.

## 11. Announcements and Updates.

There were no annoucements or updates.

# 12. The Following Files Represent Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of the staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness. There were no objections.

a. 121498 Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of sidewall venting for a new furnace at 2759 N. Sherman Blvd. in the Sherman Blvd. Historic District for Darlene Blattner.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown,

that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

**b.** 121499

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration of art glass casement windows on rear elevation over garage at 2360 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Leni Siker.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

c. 121515

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of venting for a new furnace at 3233 E. Kenwood Blvd. in the North Point North Historic District for Milwaukee County.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

d. 121562

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of an exterior condensing unit for central air conditioning at 2709 E. Belleview Place in the North Point North Historic District for Ryan Olsta.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No:** 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

e. <u>121574</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair and replacement of the roofing system, gutters, rebuilding of a parapet wall, removal of non-original dormers, repair/replacement of trim on eaves, installation of flat roof coverings, removal of deteriorated rear porch and removal of a fire escape at 3005 W. Kilbourn Avenue in the Concordia Historic District for LaZanda Moore and the Department of Neighborhood Services.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

f. 121584

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the tear-off of an asphalt shingle roof and the installation of new dimensional shingle roof and spot repair of existing stucco where necessary at 3002 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Patrick Kennelly.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Ave: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

g. <u>121640</u>

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of sidewall kitchen venting at 2878 N. Sherman Blvd. in the Sherman Blvd. Historic District for Art Dahlberg and Karen Johnson.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Jarosz, Pieper Eisenbrown, Williams, and Hoeschen

**No**: 0

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

Meeting adjourned at 4:25 p.m. Chris Lee, Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar.

City of Milwaukee Page 11