



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ALLYSON NEMEC, CHAIR

Matt Jarosz, Vice-Chair

Patricia Balon, Randy Bryant, Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann

Pieper Eisenbrown and Blair Williams

Staff Assistant, Chris Lee, 286-2232, Fax: 286-3456,

clee@milwaukee.gov

HPC Planners: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, *chatal@milwaukee.gov*;

Paul Jakubovich, 286-5712, *pjakub@milwaukee.gov*

Monday, June 11, 2012

3:00 PM

Room 301-B, City Hall

Meeting convened at 3:07 p.m.

1. Roll Call.

Present: 6 - Nemec, Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, Williams

Excused: 1 - Bauman

Individuals also present:

Carlen Hatala, Historic Preservation Commission Planner

Paul Jakubovich, Historic Preservation Commission Planner

2. Review and Approval of the Previous Minutes of May 8, 2012.

Ms. Balon moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of the previous minutes of May 8, 2012. There were no objections.

3. Presentation on the Economics of Historic Preservation and the City of Milwaukee.

Individual appearing:

Donovan Rypkema

Mr. Rypkema gave commentary and shared with the commission tools to help the City of Milwaukee be at the cutting edge of preservation. At the international level, a concept called the Historic Urban Landscape has been framed as a formal United Nations concept. The basis for urban landscape is to manage a landscape that changes and evolves over time. The concept is to think this way and recognize that cities are not fixed in place and are inherently going to change. The trick is to manage this change over time to keep the historic character and components of a city.

Mr. Rypkema said that horizontal integration of preservation within city policy is another tool. Municipal departments should question the role of historic preservation in its policies and make preservation an ongoing fundamental component in its decision

making. This tool may help resolve issues between preservation interests and municipal interests.

Mr. Rypkema said that successful cities must be comprised of five broad components: density, public transportation, small business incubation, affordable housing, and historic preservation. A balanced approach must occur with these five components, and one component must not be obtained at the expense of the rest. An argument to integrate preservation must occur for a whole range of issues.

Mr. Rypkema said that there are no effective tools to address randomness in a historic area, which may people do not like. The only tool that can address randomness is historic districting, but it may not be the right tool to use. No tools have been invented to influence how a place is changed over time. Sometimes places have no architectural characteristics or design guidelines. Some places have approached conversationalist districts as a tool.

Mr. Rypkema said that preservation should not be an end in itself but be a vehicle for other ends. Many times, cities fall into the trap of either picking preservation against economic development and vice versa. Municipalities should instead promote economic development through preservation.

Mr. Williams asked what should be valued and how to avoid economics as the driving force of preserving or not preserving a building?

Mr. Donovan replied that the reason why a building is important is going to vary and must be looked at building by building. He added that asking what is economically feasible cannot be drawn into a narrow perspective. Instead, there must be a larger question to determine if a structure can be an incremental part of a larger development rather than be just a standalone.

Ms. Nemec asked what are ways to get to a desired level of integrating preservation?

Mr. Rypkema responded that the best way is for a comprehensive, horizontal plan to integrate preservation as a policy standard.

Mr. Jarosz said that the Commission comes too late on an issue oftentimes, is viewed as the bad guy, and is misunderstood. He asked how preservation boards and politicians can work together?

Mr. Rypkema answered that the best example is when preservation is institutionalized from the top. He added that people should be made aware that the majority of proposals are approved by the commission.

Mr. Rypkema said that ways to have greatest impact on value for historic districts are: approachable staff prior to commission meetings, clear written guidelines, firm and consistent commission decisions, ongoing outreach education, and strong nonprofit advocacy.

Mr. Bryant asked how preservation can be used as a marketing tool and bring dollars to a city?

Mr. Rypkema said that a city should have a well educated work force to attract companies to locate to the city. Also, preservation should be a part of the city

character. Heritage resources should be used, and the private sector can occupy historic buildings not used by a city. A city can be preemptive and protect its historic properties to avoid mistakes of other cities.

Mr. Jakubovich inquired how bureaucrats can get on board with preservation.

Mr. Rypkema said that preservation should come from the elected officials, who should make a policy approach to first ponder about utilizing historic resources before moving on to other options.

4. [120207](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new front porch at 1030 E. Brady Street in the East Brady Street Historic District for Gambo LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave a summary on the proposal for removal of an existing wood stoop from the front of the coffee house and installation of a new wood, covered front porch in its place. The house is a late 19th Century structure with the front yard used as outdoor dining. The temporary and current front porch has rails that are sagging. The new porch projects out about seven feet and will be a simple shed roofed style. The applicant has agreed to alter plans to eliminate four newel posts and install stiffer hand rails.

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended approval with the changes.

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Mr. Jarosz, of the Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new front porch at 1030 E. Brady Street in the East Brady Street Historic District for Gambo LLC. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Balon, Jarosz, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Bauman

5. [120222](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at 2405 E. Wyoming Place in the North Point South Historic District for Frederick Vogel IV and Megan W. Holbrook.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich said that the proposal is to build an addition to the rear of the Smith House. The addition will be smaller in scale, similar to a 2 ½ car garage, be 1 ½ stories, and be parallel to the side of the house. A one story, flat roofed parapet connector will connect the addition to the house, and it will be recessed from the façade. The far south side of the addition will have bay windows while the other windows will be double hung windows. The bricks of the addition and parapet will match the house. The side setback from the street is not met and will require Board of Zoning Appeals. Positive significant changes to the proposal has been done.

Mr. Jakubovich recommended approval with the condition that further exploration of the

brick be done to match it closer to the house's surface.

Mr. Bryant said that the far south window of the addition should be a box window and not a bay window to match the house.

Mr. Jarosz said that the weakest point is the parapet connector. He said there should be thought given to adding a second level to the parapet and a basement window.

Mr. Williams said lifting the parapet will block and break up the line of windows on the second story of the house. He added that symmetry has been established.

Mr. Bryant moved approval, seconded by Mr. Jarosz, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at 2405 E. Wyoming Place in the North Point South Historic District for Frederick Vogel IV and Megan W. Holbrook based on staff recommendation with the condition that the applicant work with staff to change the south window from a bay window to a box window and to explore selection of the brick. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Matt Jarosz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Balon, Jarosz, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Bauman

6. [120248](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovation/restoration of the Iron Block Building at 205 E. Wisconsin Avenue in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Dr. Thomas G. Manos.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the exterior renovations and restoration of the Iron Block building. The Iron Block building has new owners who are undertaking renovation inside and outside of the building. The building was one of a few all cast iron façade buildings to exist in the country. Renovated three decades ago, it needs renovation again. The building is actually two buildings. The main 1861 cast iron building was added with an 1897 all cream city press brick building. The original and deteriorated cornice on the buildings will be reconstructed and replaced. The south elevation is mostly a blank wall and will not have much renovation done. Rusted iron plates will be taken off, sand blasted, repainted, and placed back. Immediate priming will be done underneath the plates.

*Individual appearing and representing the applicant:
Mark Dempsky, Dental Associates*

Mr. Dempsky said that all of the rusted iron plates will be sandblasted, primed, and cleaned by this fall. He added that replacement of the cornice will be done afterwards.

Mr. Jakubovich said the brick should be cleaned and left in its natural state to call attention to the fact that the buildings are separate in design. The project must pass the National Register at the federal level. The north elevation will have a re-built cornice, new keystones, and column flourishes that had been missing. The west

elevation will have a new balustrade, entrance, and keystones on arches. New signage on the Wisconsin Avenue façade is part of the submittal. The storefronts will not be changed at this time but will be changed to their appearances in the 1960s in the future.

Mr. Dempsy said the signage will be "Dental Associates Iron Block." Changes to the storefronts will be brought forward soon. The desire is for modern offices inside. Window sills will be repaired and wood floors will be saved as much as possible. The renovation will create sixty jobs.

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended approval.

Mr. Jarosz said that this renovation should be documented and publicized as much as possible.

Mr. Bryant moved approval, seconded by Mr. Williams, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovation and restoration of the Iron Block Building at 205 E. Wisconsin Avenue in the East Side Commercial Historic District for Dr. Thomas G. Manos. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Blair Williams, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Balon, Jarosz, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 1 - Bauman

7. [120067](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new windows in buildings 20 and 21 at 1203-1215 N. 10th Street in the Pabst Brewery Historic District for Ted Matkow, agent for Brewery House LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Nemec recused herself and passed the gavel to Mr. Jarosz.

Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the proposal for new windows at the location. The commission reviewed the proposal at the last meeting. Original plan was for two wood windows, one wood door, metal windows for the rest of the building, and squared off round tops on windows. A new plan would consist of wood windows on the first two floors, aluminum windows for the upper levels, and 39 windows squared off at the top. In 1900, some windows on the top floor were louvered and did not have plates to square off. Also, the remaining windows were open and glazed at the tops. Louver windows may not have been original and be practical for a hotel operation at this building.

Mr. Jakubovich said that staff was not comfortable with the proposal. One issue is the zebra effect of using different materials, which would appear and weather differently. Another problem is inconsistency if like with like materials concerning replacements were not used. Staff does not find issue with metal windows on the secondary levels.

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended for wood windows on the street facing elevations and metal windows on the secondary levels.

Mr. Bryant left the commission.

Mr. Williams said that the approval from State Historical Society and Federal Park Service of the proposal as submitted indicates that the windows may not be viewed as being a significant historical feature. He added that the imposition of stricter standards by this commission would be arbitrary or capricious.

*Individuals appearing and representing the applicant:
Ben Marshall, Gormon and Company Inc.
Ted Matkom, Brewery House LLC
Michael Meavis, Brewery House LLC*

Ms. Balon asked if any materials were already purchased for the project?

Mr. Marshall replied that no materials were purchased yet. He added that the reason for the metal panels were due to the current metal panels that are on the building.

Mr. Matkom said that he would like the committee to vote on the original proposal for all metal windows.

Mr. Meavis, on behalf Mr. Marshall, said that they would accept a compromise for wood windows on the first two levels and metal windows everywhere else.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown said that there was a deadlocked vote on the compromise at the last meeting. She said that the new metal windows would have the same profiles as the originals.

Mr. Williams moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for new wood windows on the first two floors, metal windows on the upper floors, and infilling of rounded window tops with metal panels. (Prevailed 2 1 2)

A motion was made by Blair Williams, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 2 - Pieper Eisenbrown, and Williams

No: 1 - Balon

Excused: 2 - Bryant, and Bauman

Abstain: 2 - Jarosz, and Nemec

8. [120254](#)

Resoluting relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 3 car garage at 2810 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Tiffany Greer.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich said that the proposal is for a new three car garage, 28 feet by 22 feet, on the northwest corner lot of the Victorian House.

Ms. Nemec said that the commissioners have had an opportunity to look at the proposal and staff report. She said that staff has recommended approval and a motion can be made.

Mr. Jarosz moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new three car garage at 2810 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Tiffany Greer. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

9. Announcements and Updates.

10. The Following Files Represent Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Mr. Jarosz moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of the staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness. There were no objections.

- a.** [120181](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new roof at 2400 N. Lincoln Memorial Drive, Bradford Beach Bath House for Milwaukee County.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- b.** [120182](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a installation of a propane tank and fencing around it at 2400 N. Lincoln Memorial Drive, Bradford Beach Bath House for Milwaukee County.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- c.** [120183](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new roof at 816 E. Brady Street for Pamela Sable.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be **ADOPTED**. This motion **PREVAILED** by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- d. [120184](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior repairs at 3229 W. McKinley Blvd. for the City of Milwaukee.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be **ADOPTED**. This motion **PREVAILED** by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- e. [120185](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a fence at 3431 N. Sherman Blvd. for Mark Johnson.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be **ADOPTED**. This motion **PREVAILED** by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- f. [120200](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a fence at 2104 N. 1st Street. for Jean Dow.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be **ADOPTED**. This motion **PREVAILED** by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- g. [120205](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of temporary signage at 611 N. Broadway for the First Hospitality Group.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- h. [120206](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of central air conditioning unit at 2533 N. Wahl Avenue for Jeffrey Kasch.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- i. [120208](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new service walk and drive at 3209 W. Wells Street for Rick and Laura Sue Mosier.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- j. [120226](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof work at 301 E. Wisconsin Avenue in the East Side Commercial Historic District for MBI Properties, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

- k. [120249](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for soffit and fascia repairs at 935 N. 31st Street for Martha Brown.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be **ADOPTED**. This motion **PREVAILED** by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Balon, Jarosz, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Bryant, Bauman, and Williams

Meeting adjourned at 4:58 p.m.

Chris Lee, Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.