



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 5/3/2021
Ald. M. Dimitrijevic District: 14
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #115112 CCF #201639

Property	2530 S. SUPERIOR ST.	Disch/Rising/Morgan Cottage
Owner/Applicant	Chris Konicek 10125 S 52nd St Franklin, WI 53132	
Proposal	Replace vinyl siding on house with LP Smartside in smooth finish	
Staff comments	<p>Circumstances here are unusual compared to prior discussions of the Smartside product. Staff must open with the fact that the HPC has always rejected this product in the past consistently and for many years in new construction of both houses and outbuildings. Concerns have been about durability and its mostly synthetic nature. While these remain valid concerns, the proposal before us is of different character than other ones. Staff is not aware of a scenario where this product has been proposed as replacement of siding on an existing building.</p> <p>There are several reasons to consider approving this in the present scenario that may be unique to this proposed Puddlers Cottage district, this house, or to the cost of quality lumber in 2021.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Existing siding is vinyl and failing.2. Underlying siding is asbestos-containing, and while reasonably intact, leaving it exposed is not ideal3. Repair of asbestos siding is expensive due to abatement costs on any shingles that need to be replaced and there is only one product on the market that can potentially be used to replace missing and damaged pieces (GAF Weatherside, a fiber-cement product). If it even matches the specific asbestos shingling used on the subject house is unknown.4. Smartside creates an improved appearance compared to vinyl siding5. Wood prices are exorbitant this year. Construction grade 2x4s are around the \$10 price point. Paint or stain grade lumber is several times that price point.6. Smooth Smartside is an improvement upon an in-kind replacement of present materials at a property and an improvement compared to repairs to existing materials. It should not be considered where these conditions do not apply.	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval	
Conditions		
Previous HPC action		
Previous Council action		