

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 3/1/2021 Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #115080 CCF #201355

Property 2505 N. WAHL AV. North Point North

Owner/ApplicantNEWMARKET LLCNEWMARKET LLC2505 N Wahl Ave2505 N Wahl Ave

MILWAUKEE WI 53211 MILWAUKEE WI 53211

Proposal Replace quarry tile porch decking and lannon stone pathway pavers with bluestone. A

ceramic tile is offered as an alternate for the decking.

Staff comments The overall proposal presents several dilemmas. The first is that it is unknown what the

original porch material was. Quarry tile is possible, concrete, limestone, or flagstone are more likely. While the original plans exist at the Wisconsin Architectural Archives, that collection remains inaccessible to all people. In a text search of the Journal and Sentinel archives online, staff could find no mention of bluestone or "blue stone" as a landscaping material before 1935 (Journal Apr 26), specifically as used locally in 1941 (Journal, Sept 28, Mequon), or as an exterior building material until 1953 (Journal, May 31). Staff concurs that

the guarry tile has failed to an adequate degree to justify replacement.

A garage was constructed facing Bradford in 1982 and added two green asphalt driveways. The present owners have sensibly done away with the colored asphalt in favor of concrete.

The lannon stone pavers on the Wahl front here are unusual and may or may not be original. There are no known examples of Fitzhugh Scott using bluestone in Milwaukee County and signs of original landscaping at his properties are rare. Nonetheless, the Commission has generally accepted bluestone as a paving material only, regardless of age of property.

Relevant Guidelines are as follows

- A. 4. Porches, Trim and Ornamentation
- a. Retain porches and steps visible from the public right-of-way that are historically and architecturally appropriate to the building.
- c. Repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Avoid using replacement materials that do not accurately reproduce the appearance of the original material.

B Guidelines for Streetscapes

- 1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.
- 2. Use traditional landscaping, fencing, signage and street lighting that is compatible with the character and period of the district. Avoid introducing landscape features, fencing, street lighting or signage that are inappropriate to the character of the district.

Recommendation Recommend denial on bluestone for porch. Staff is neutral on the dark tile.

Staff is neutral on bluestone paving.

Conditions