



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/12/2020
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #115035 CCF #200664

Property 1239 E. BRADY ST.

Owner/Applicant Scott Schaefer Consortium ae
WurstBar 2022 E North Avenue #300
Milwaukee, WI 53202

Proposal Remodeling of the street facades along Arlington and Brady. On the ground floor of the Brady side, replace traditional storefront-type windows with folding overhead doors within the same openings. On the second floor, expand loggia into a full-width balcony and replace 36" wood door with a 4-panels of full light aluminum storefront doors and more extensive railings.

Along Arlington, remove two windows and their bulkheads. Install new bi-fold aluminum windows in existing openings and add a third window. On the second floor, replace three windows with the same aluminum folding window system and add safety railings.

Staff comments The present building was constructed in 2010. The proposal adds a significant amount of metal to what was designed to be primarily wood infill building.

The concept creating operable windows on the ground floor in the locations shown is unobjectionable. However, as shown, it defies the standard commercial storefront paradigm that the building was intended to interpret. The windows on the ground floor could be done in paired wood casement windows with a horizontal muntin to maintain the storefront window look.

The second floor is more problematic. The existing loggia design of the Brady elevation could be improved upon, but this is not the way to go about it. A full-width balcony is a conceivable alteration, but the railing and doors proposed are unacceptable. Traditional residential style fenestration is needed and expansion into a full-width balcony would need a knee wall surround rather than an open railing on this type of building. The second floor of the Arlington elevation should not be changed. Double hung windows are part of the character of this building type and the addition of railings borrows from a Mediterranean Revival style. This conflicts with this building which has its stylistic origins in the Queen Anne and Craftsman styles.

The Commission has held extremely firm on not allowing a garage door appearance on any buildings unless they have a strongly documented history of primary automotive use. The applicant's sample of this product on a neighboring property is not relevant, as that project was never approved by DNS or HPC and has a pending violation for construction without a permit and construction without a COA.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Denial or HOLD for revisions

Conditions

Previous HPC action Original construction approved in December 2009.

Previous Council action