Millennial Task Force research on policy, programs, etc.

* Note: this is a working document of resources, studies, and articles related to: brain drain in Milwaukee, Millennial trends and preferences, City of Milwaukee current programs and policies, and peer city/state models. Document last updated: 5/29/2020

Brain Drain in Milwaukee and Wisconsin

US Census Data: "Metro-by-Metro by Age 2011-2015"

- On average, more Millennials migrate to Milwaukee metro region than leave each year. Overall, Milwaukee:
 - o Net gained 655 20-24-year-olds
 - o Net gained 659 25-29-year-olds
 - o Net gained 54 30-34-year-olds
 - o Net gained 205 35-39-year-olds
- Milwaukee net gains people from Chicago, especially Millennials. Milwaukee:
 - o Net gained 1,139 18-19 year-olds
 - o Net gained 510 20-24-year-olds
 - o Net gained 136 25-29-year-olds
 - o Net gained 152 30-34-year-olds
 - o Net gained 163 35-39-year-olds
- However, overall 18-19 year olds was largest group to leave Milwaukee metro area
 - o Milwaukee net lost 2,412 18-19 year olds
 - o More than half (1,352) migrated to Dane County (Madison), suggesting many Gen Z people go to college at UW-Madison suggests there may be higher education issue facing Milwaukee
 - Net loss of 262 18-19-year-olds to Minnesota
- Of all age groups, Milwaukee metro area would see a net outflow of people if not for the immigration population; rising Hispanic birth rate helps keep overall population afloat

National study

- In 2017, 20.4% more highly educated people left than stayed in Wisconsin, ranking the 4th highest state in the nation
- In 2017, 10.7% more highly educated people left than entered Wisconsin, ranking the 8th highest state in the nation

Wisconsin Policy Forum: State Losing Highly Educated Workers

O Wisconsin's wages trail national median in many occupations, such as engineering

City of Milwaukee Department of Employee Relations (DER) 2020 Budget materials

- There were 161 general City employee resignations in 2018, up from 146 in 2017
- 28% of City employees reside outside of city
- City workforce demographics: Millennials 31% (2019); projected 50% (2024)
- By 2024, 30% of City government workforce will be eligible to retire
- DER launched social media campaign in 2019 Facebook page
- DER predicts 35,000 job openings in Milwaukee metro area may go unfilled in next 3 years

Emily Keeley DER presentation:

- Millennials represent 53% of new City hires, 30% of the overall workforce, 48% of separations, and have on average less than 2 years of service
 - o Retention seems to be the key issue, whereas attraction has been easier
 - o DER has engaged in retention measures, such as stay interviews to find out what employees want
 - o DER developing exit interviews on why they leave (could be compensation, values, culture)
 - Emily believes reasons for separation include: lesser compensation compared to suburbs, bad workplace culture, no sense of community, lack of a formal mentorship program, no core City value or mission

- Millennials have become more diverse over past 5 years; make-up is as follows:
 - 56% Caucasian, 30% African American, 11% Hispanic, 3% Asian, less than 1% American Indian, and 0% Pacific Islander
- Gen Z represents 12% to 14% of City workforce, but little other data exists for this age group

Millennial Trends and Preferences

2019 Brookings Institute report: demographic trends

2018 Illinois Municipal Policy Journal study

- Millennials have propensity to rent rather than buy homes, have strong preference for short commutes, walkable neighborhoods, and transportation access
- Prefer experiences over products when spending time and money; want amenity-rich environments
- Among homebuying Millennials, strongest influences on location choice were neighborhood quality, convenience to jobs, and affordability

2016 Abodo survey

For people born between 1982 and 1998, top 5 priorities in a city are: thriving job market, affordable rent, affordable home prices, parks or hiking trails, and local restaurants

2014 Transportation for America Millennial survey

- 66% of Millennials said quality transportation is in their top 3 criteria for choosing where to live
- 54% of Millennials surveyed said they would consider moving to another city if it had more and better transportation options

City of Milwaukee Programs and Policies

*Note: Many of the below items are not necessarily geared to Millennials in particular but are listed to provide an overview of programs that young people may benefit from.

Workforce and Economic Development

- **Direct Connect MKE** recent presentation
 - o Smart platform targeting underserved Millennials on job placement and training opportunities
 - O Provides information on supportive services and access to 130 career mentors who work in 40 workforce development organizations
 - o City's Office of Workforce Development has raised nearly \$2 million in private funding

• Milwaukee Promise Zones

- Created in <u>2017</u> to create jobs, increase economic activity, improve educational opportunities, leverage private investment and reduce violent crime in select areas
- o Initiative targets 4 designated zones and one satellite zone: Greater Old North, Near South Side, North/Division Harambee, Washington Park, and the Woodlands
- o In 2018, led to nearly 450 people finding employment; childhood education initiative established

• Equitable development

- 2019 Council legislation and Dept. of City Development recommendations on equitably distributing benefits accruing downtown: seek state authorization for raising money in order to spur investments; establish mentor relationships for businesses; improve access of workers to downtown jobs; encourage downtown residents to invest in near-downtown neighborhoods
- o Council established in 2019 an <u>Anti-Displacement Advisory Committee</u> and <u>Anti-Displacement</u> Preference Policy
- o Council established Disparity Study Independent Review Committee in 2018 2019 update
- Milwaukee's Business Toolbox Department of City Development

- Milwaukee Economic Development Corporation offers businesses "gap" financing at below market interest rates
- o <u>Residents Preference Program (RPP)</u> Contractors on City projects typically need at least 40% of workers to be City residents
- CDBG funding (targeted to low income families): City allocated \$22.6 million for 2020 from federal government

Apprenticeship-type programs

• Fire Cadet Program

- o Apprentice-style program for 17-19 year olds
- o 2020 City budget includes funding for 52 cadets
- o Paid program where they get trained; complete Associates degree simultaneously, which is subject to Tuition Reimbursement program
- o In 2017, an MOU was established between Milwaukee Fire Department and Milwaukee Public Schools to prepare high school students for entering the MFD Fire Cadet Program

• Summer Youth Internship Program

- o Placed 130 teens in City government departments in 2018
- o Funded primarily by federal Community Development Block Grant (CDBG)
- According to DER, the City hired 32 new interns and apprentices in 2019:
 - o 9 construction laborer interns
 - o 4 engineering inspection assistants
 - o 1 engineering intern
 - o 3 librarian associates
 - o 4 management trainees
 - o 3 traffic operations assistants
 - o 8 urban forestry arborist apprentices
- State of Wisconsin requires 65% of apprenticeships to lead to post-apprenticeship opportunity
 - O City's Employ Milwaukee program notes that there was a 69% average training completion rate for all programs in 2018

Incentivizing Employees and Disincentivizing them from Leaving City Government

- In 2019 the Council approved a 3% salary increase for employees who reside within the city
- City offers generous benefits package: pension, retirement, healthy rewards program, tuition reimbursement, etc.
- Council passed resolution in 2018 directing DER to disincentivize employees from leaving City after receiving significant investment in training - Common Council File 181296
 - Council has also previously discussed possibility of requiring employees sign a contract keeping
 them with the City for a set amount of time if they receive significant training. However, this idea
 is more common in private sector and is unlikely to be legally feasible

Other - Miscellaneous Information

- Health Department's <u>Office of Violence Prevention</u> takes public health approach to preventing violence – <u>Blueprint for Peace</u>
 - Resolution passed in 2020 directing every City dept. to report activities and strategies used to implement the recommendations of the Blueprint for Peace
- Project Clean and Green DPW picks up items for free for set time period
- 10,000 Homes Initiative to improve housing stock City allocated \$1 million to this in 2020 budget
- <u>Birthing Moms Pilot</u> to distribute water filters and education kits for mothers in areas where lead lateral are common City allocated \$240,000 to this in 2020
- Information related to Milwaukee's educational systems

- 2018-19 report card notes that over 20.2% of Milwaukee Public Schools exceed or significantly exceed expectations, demonstrating strength of some schools; in Milwaukee County 88.7% of people have high school diploma or higher
- o But <u>racial disparities</u> persist: 40.5% of white people in the county have bachelor's degree or higher, compared to just <u>13.1%</u> of black people
- o Marquette U: ranks 84th in nation by US News; MSOE ranks 8th in regional universities Midwest

State of Wisconsin

State of Wisconsin Ad Campaign

- State bought ads in Jan 2018 on Chicago CTA transit lines with tagline: "Wisconsin: it's more you"
- Created through Milwaukee ad agency Nelson Schmidt cost \$6.8 million
- Focus on commute times and affordable cost of living, and targeted veterans with state benefits
- <u>Wisconsin Policy Forum</u> notes critics argued ad campaign was ineffective; Gov. Evers did not include funding for it in his budget

Debt Relief

- In 2018 Gov. Walker <u>proposed</u> annual tax breaks of \$1,000 for 5 years for graduates who earn at least associate's degree and stay in Wisconsin
 - o State's average student loan debt is over \$30,000
- Andy Gronik, who ran for Governor, <u>proposed</u> applying the amount that recent graduates owed in state income taxes to their student debt until their debt was fully repaid

Peer City/State Models

Atlanta, Georgia Curriculum Guide

• Aids high schoolers and parents in planning career-themed pathways

Learn to Earn Dayton

- Non-profit organization with \$900,000 annual budget receives a significant portion of funding from Dayton Foundation
- Gained important initial funding through 0.25% City of Dayton income tax increase in 2016
- Seeks to ensure 60 percent of workforce has a marketable post-secondary degree by 2025
- Many education-related goals for K-12 students

Pennsylvania Commonwealth Public Service Internship program

- 6-month paid internship program for college students interested in state government
- Students are guaranteed a full-time position upon graduating with a bachelor's degree and completing the internship program

Apprenticeships in K-12 and higher education

- Many apprenticeship programs funded and administered at state level
- Last few years have seen uptick in funding and new programs
- Wisconsin has <u>Youth Apprenticeship</u> and <u>pre-apprenticeship</u> programs for high school juniors and seniors

Maine intern-mentor program

- Partners with local universities and community colleges to identify potential hires and pair them with veteran workers
- Since the program started in 2013, 70% of the interns have become full-time employees

Growth of Pittsburgh tech industry

- Driven by AI and machine learning tech at Carnegie Mellon
- Mayor seeking inclusive approach, including \$10 million affordable housing fund
- 4 members appointed to Economic Growth team

Generation Iowa Commission

- Study found that most important factors in determining if person would stay or leave are wage-related
- Commission formed in 2008, disbanded in 2011; difficult to get legislature to adopt recommendations
- Biggest successes were spotlighting problem of brain drain and passage of state law calling for more young Iowans on state boards and commissions
- Report also recommended expanding "Iowa Internship Program" that links top college students with internships in small and medium sized businesses, and expanding the Education Award to Iowa's AmeriCorps volunteers to attract service-minded, educated young professionals

Inclusive growth led by Economic Development Organizations

- <u>Brookings Institute project</u> highlights role EDOs (defined as regional, public private economic entities such as chambers of commerce) can play in inclusive growth
- Indy, Nashville, San Diego pilot programs developed strategies to frame inclusive growth as economic imperative

Governing article: America's Declining Cities Try to Attract Millennials

- Columbus, OH: Experience Columbus campaign
 - o Launched by city's tourism division works collaboratively with downtown organizations
- Detroit, MI: Write a House campaign
 - o Selects writers to receive free house as incentive to move to city
 - Supported by philanthropic grants but initiative is winding down due to lack of funding
- Philadelphia, PA: Campus Philly
 - o Began with City government encouraging students to explore the city; morphed into nonprofit
 - o Now links students to internships and exposes them to arts and volunteering
 - Discussion on diversity within workforce

Notes

- If the Task Force is interested in making legislative request to the State then the Council could pass a Resolution requesting the State to take action. This would be communicated through the City's Intergovernmental Relations division, which does lobbying in Madison
- Any large funding ideas for programs would go through the 2021 City budget process in fall of 2020

Prepared by: Alex Highley, City of Milwaukee Legislative Reference Bureau