

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

Staff comments

HPC meeting date: 6/1/2020 Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #114964 CCF #200047

Property 2720 E. BRADFORD AV. North Point North

Owner/Applicant MATTHEW J FLYNN & MARY HW Mary Flynn

2720 E BRADFORD AVE 2720 E Bradford Ave MILWAUKEE WI 53211 Milwaukee, WI 53211

Phone: (414) 964-8902

Proposal Change roofing material from cedar shingle to asphalt dimensional shingle.

This is an uncommon request. As a matter of general practice, only changes in the type of roofing material that are not substantiated by documentary evidence are brought before the Commission. The present cedar roof dates to 1991 and was installed by the current owners. Given that age, the roof is realistically at its lifespan. The owners have included a contractor's report showing damage and recommending replacement instead of repair.

The roofing history that could be established for the subject house is as follows: 1905: construction, plans exist, but are inaccessible at Central Library presently.

1910: cedar shingle was present 1951: asbestos tile was present 1991: cedar shingle installed

The one historic photo that could be readily accessed suggests that the asbestos roof lasted until 1991. The 1991 application lacks any photos or details on what the roof was at that time.

Generally the preference of the Commission is to keep historic roofing materials. The present roof is obviously not original, but matches the original roof. The applicant worked with staff to pick an asphalt product that would be automatically approved if it did not constitute a change in materials. The selected product of CertainTeed Landmark in the weathered wood color is such a material and is regularly used by homeowners in the historic districts and on city-owned homes.

That being said, because of the prior restoration to cedar shingle, staff leans slightly on the side of denying the application. Replacement in kind with new cedar shingles would be preferable.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Denial

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action