

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

Mr. Dave J Koz

Koz-i-tec-ture

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 3/2/2020 Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #114912 CCF #191654

Property 217 W. RESERVOIR AV. Brewers Hill

Owner/Applicant

SUZANNE GREINERT JAMISON KLINKNER 217 W RESERVOIR AV

217 W RESERVOIR AV 12310 W Waterford Ave MILWAUKEE WI 53212 Greenfield, WI 53228

Proposal

- A. Add second floor to 1970s addition and create a corresponding cross-gable that matches the height of the primary gable.
- B. Create partial cross-gable to allow for staircase to second floor on alley side. Add shed dormer along east side. Extend primary axis rearward with full height addition with living space over an attached garage with an additional cross-gable.
- C. Similar to A, but with increased roof pitch and height on the cross-gable with the new cross-gable being taller than the original structure.

Staff comments

The house dates to the early 1890s and has a highly visible 1972 wing to the east. Overall, it is a typical Brewers Hill Queen Anne cottage.

Adding additional living space to this house is a challenge. At first thought, one would think that making the prior addition more compatible would be the way to go, but after serious consideration staff has concluded that it is likely better to extend out the back. The architect has made a quality effort at making the east wing more compatible. Our guidelines and principles are based on minimizing the effect on the streetscape. Keeping the existing addition at one story maintains the status quo with some window alterations that will minimize its appearance.

After long consideration, both staff agreed that option B with the two-story extension to the rear and the setback shed dormer on the east side are the preferable solution for having the least effect on the streetscape.

Garage

Allowing an attached garage is uncharacteristic of the Commission, but each circumstance is unique. This family's case for an attached garage is relatively convincing for the following reasons: proximity to King Drive commercial properties, alley access, extremely tight lot, and deep setback from the street. A detached garage is not a realistic possibility on this parcel because of building and zoning code requirements. It is a difficult decision to make.

All the designs are carefully thought through, but staff leans strongly towards option B. If an attached garage is to be allowed, allowing a rooftop deck is a step too far. Rooftop decks have not even been allowed on detached garages in this historic district.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval on continuing design work on option B.

If Commission directs applicant to pursue options A or C instead, the attached garage must not be allowed, but a concrete parking pad in the same location would be welcome.

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Brewers Hill Guidelines, relevant sections

A. 1. a. Roofs

Retain the original roof shape. Dormers, skylights and solar collector panels may be added to roof surfaces if they do not visually intrude upon those elevations visible from the public right of-way. Avoid making changes to the roof shape that would alter the building height, roofline, pitch or gable orientation

B.1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.