



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 1/6/2019**

**Ald. K. Rainey District: 7**

**Staff reviewer: Tim Askin**

**PTS #114897 CCF #191414**

<b>Property</b>	3039 - 3041 N. SHERMAN BL.	
<b>Owner/Applicant</b>	MARTHA MONROE 3041 N SHERMAN BLVD MILWAUKEE WI 53210	MARTHA MONROE 3041 N SHERMAN BLVD MILWAUKEE WI 53210
<b>Proposal</b>	<p>Applicant intends to replace the existing roof and gutter system. The main roof will be replaced with Belmont Shingles. The shingle is composed of a base shingles with random tabs on the top that provide depth and dimension to mimic a slate shingle appearance. The shingles will be the Shenandoah coloration. The pent roof on the porch is proposed as a red DaVinci synthetic slate.</p>	
<b>Staff comments</b>	<p>Fire insurance maps suggest that the main roof on this property was always an asphalt composition roof. The proposed Belmont shingle is intended as a slate-substitute asphalt shingle. The Commission has precedent for denying slate substitutes where no slate has ever been known to exist. Further, the Belmont shingle violates the heavy shadow line rule used by both this Commission and the Wisconsin Historical Society.</p> <p>The pent roof on the front porch was, at some point, a non-flammable material, per the same fire insurance maps. On Sherman Boulevard, this was most likely to have been a true terra cotta tile, but no specific information could be found in photographs or permits. Historic slate is possible in this location, but to staff's knowledge, red slate was never used historically in Milwaukee.</p> <p>The Commission has rejected the use of the thermoplastic and the similar rubber-based synthetic slates in the past. The Commission has found them to be insufficient replicas and not sufficiently reliable as a product, which is known for upturning issues. When there has been a financial hardship and proof of prior slate, certain specific asphalt composition roof product lines have been required over the formed product.</p> <p>Gutters are proposed as a modern conventional aluminum K-Type. Unlike most of our reviews, this style does appear appropriate to this house. The sharply peaked hip roof would look awkward with half-round gutters, so the modern standard K-type gutters are a better choice.</p>	
<b>Recommendation</b>	Recommend HPC Denial of roofing materials. Approve K-type gutters.	
<b>Conditions</b>		
<b>Previous HPC action</b>	DaVinci Slate and the highly similar Enviro slate were denied in files 161811 & 130315.	
<b>Previous Council action</b>		