



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 11/4/2019

Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114852 CCF #191001

Property 2903 W. MC KINLEY BL.

Owner/Applicant Ben Tomes Ben Tomes
2903 W. MC KINLEY BL.

Proposal This application is for a garage addition. The plans provided indicate a front gable design with minimal designed articulation. The estimates provided indicate that the garage will be clad in 4" vinyl siding, feature vinyl soffit and fascia, three vinyl window units, a single steel service door, and a steel overhead door. The elevations included with the application package indicate interest in a craftsman style garage. A collaged image indicates a garage in this style as well, but the applicant specified in their description that the image "does not reflect an exact color scheme or design."

Staff comments The application is incomplete.

The application does not specify an exact design or location. The location appears appropriate, but as a survey is required for a building permit for a garage, we have generally required it ourselves for new garages. However, attached garages have generally not been allowed in historic districts and the lot may be too small for a detached garage.

A structure in the general location of the garage is visible at the side of a 1984 photo. It is simple in design with a low-pitched roof. Its demolition date has not been researched. Scars on the building seem to indicate attachment, but with abutting rather than shared walls.

Three designs are included. One is presumed not to be the design intention. The other two, borrowed from HPC files would be acceptable with complete construction plans.

Materials proposed vinyl siding and vinyl windows. These materials have not been accepted by the Commission for any new construction because of their inherent dissimilarity to historic materials. Vinyl siding will also complicate fire separation between the buildings. Very few vinyl siding products are approved for used in 2 hour fire-rated assemblies. It is not known what can be used in a 3/4 hour assembly (<http://productspec.ul.com/document.php?id=BXUV.U301>). Windows of any material will not be feasible on any side of a proposed garage within 10' of another structure because of fire rating requirements (SPS 321.08).

Zoning

It will impossible to meet the 10' rear setback required for an attached garage. It will be difficult to meet the 18" setback for a detached garage.

HOLD for referral to Plan Examination and Board of Zoning Appeals for siting and fire-rating issues.
Or DENY based on materials.

Recommendation Hold

Conditions