



# Historic Water Tower Neighborhood

---

## 2019 OFFICERS

### President

Toby Reynolds

### President Elect

Open

### VP Communications

Joan Miller

### VP Special Events

Maria Camera

### VP Membership

Laurel Maney

### Treasurer

Bruce Thompson

### Secretary

Linda Cutler

### Past President

Gina Spang

## 2019 TRUSTEES

### Area 1

(LaFayette Pl. to North Ave.)

Linda Cutler

Laurel Maney

Joan Miller

Tiffany Tinsey

Stephanie Van Alyea Quirk

### Area 2

(North Ave. to Newberry Blvd.)

Jeff Bentoff

Andrew Brusky

Lloyd Dickinson

Lauren Falk

Regan Hindman

Angie Kvidera

Dawn McCarthy

Donna Neal

Sally Peltz

Toby Reynolds

Laura Shipley

### Area 3

(Newberry Blvd. to

Edgewood Ave.)

Derek Brewer

Christianne Camera

Maria Camera

Sandra McSweeney

Gina Spang

Sarah Streed

Bruce Thompson

September 9, 2019

Dear Historic Preservation Commission:

I am the president of the Historic Water Tower Neighborhood (“HWTN”), and I write this letter on behalf of the trustees of HWTN.

After review of updated information submitted by the applicant, HWTN is writing to renew our request that you deny a Certificate Of Appropriateness (COA) for proposed construction of a new house at 2381 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North Point North Historic District, File #190387.

We believe that, as with the original plans, recent modifications proposed by the developers for this project still do not meet the approved guidelines for new construction in the North Point North Historic District. Indeed, the revised design plans make no material changes to the original design plans that would bring the design into conformance with the guidelines.

We do not oppose a modern design for new construction at this location or within the district. A new home in the HWTN area at 2129 N. Terrace Ave. is an example of a modern home that fits into the neighborhood. The owner worked with HPC to win approval for the plans based on HPC guidelines. The result is a home that is modern and of its time, yet very complementary to the homes around it.

We appreciate the work of HPC staff and commissioners to guide the developers of the 2381 Terrace Ave. project toward meeting the guidelines. We hope that with further revisions or new plans, a home will be approved and built that is consistent with the guidelines for the neighborhood.

If the proposed Terrace house is allowed to be built outside of the guidelines, we believe it will be a detriment to the property owners who follow guidelines in this historic neighborhood and undermine HPC’s future efforts to appropriately oversee new construction in historic neighborhoods.

In our July 6 letter in opposition to the COA, we listed reasons the proposed design fails to meet the approved guidelines for new construction in the North Point North Historic District. We maintain those concerns and would like to add a few additional points as follows:

- **Scale:** Despite an increase in the size of the house in the recent modification, the home still remains significantly shorter than others in the area.
- **Form:** The massing and the profiles of roofs and building elements are still not compatible with any homes in the district.
- **Lighting:** The lights in the porte cochere and light from skylights would be inconsistent with the historic character of the neighborhood.
- The buildings within the district inform the design of the house not the hospital/parking ramp behind and outside the historic district.
- The new residential lots on Terrace Ave. were included in the historic district to be a buffer to the institutional construction of the hospital, not a transition. The buffer provided by residential lots on Terrace Avenue was always meant to enhance the district, listed on the National Register for Historic Places (NR), after the Columbia St. Mary’s development.

The July 8 HPC staff report identified numerous aspects of the plans that do not meet the guidelines for new construction. The developer’s recent modifications fail to address the HPC staff concerns and the lack of compliance. We urge you to deny a COA at this time. We urge you to work with the developer toward a project that meets the guidelines, which protect the integrity of this historic neighborhood.

Toby Reynolds

2019 HWTN President