

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/8/2019 Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #114778 CCF #190388

Property 2249 N. HUMBOLDT AV. Schlitz Tavern / Humboldt Gardens

Owner/Applicant CITY OF MILW Todd Hutchison

809 N BROADWAY MILWAUKEE WI 53202

Proposal

Applicants will rehab the building such that the top two stories are converted into two condominiums, and the first story is converted to a commercial space with the option to become a third condominium if a suitable tenant is not secured. This is a conceptual proposal includes the following conditions/contemplations: the construction of a new 6 car garage at the west side of the site, the construction of a new private patio to the south at the previous location of the 1 story structure, the addition of 2 new balconies on the southern facade of the building, one on each of the top two floors servicing the condominiums, a new large window and door with access to the third floor balcony, three additional windows and a door with access to the second floor balcony, the rehab and replacement of the three large openings exposed after the demolition of the 1 story structure, the construction of a new elevator tower on the west facade, repair and tuckpointing to the exterior brick (however any historic elements removed from the building in the past will not be replaced or replicated), the replacement of the roof with a new rubber roof (the historical conical roof turret, which was removed many years ago, will not be replaced), the exterior facades will be scraped, pressure washed and repainted after the repairs and tuckpointing is complete, and, finally, the replacement of the historical windows with double hung wood windows with no divided lights to match the style of the original windows.

Staff comments

Alterations to the south and west are significant, but are justifiable and within reason. The elevator and additional windows will add value and utility to the building, especially for modern residential uses proposed.

Fenestration

New windows are proposed throughout. No more than three windows have any chance of being original. The condition of the existing windows is unclear, they are generally inappropriate in form. Some stained glass windows exist at the top of the turret (3 or 4). They are of different patterns, so they may not be original, but they should be retained. They should be used on the exterior of the building, but not necessarily in their current locations. They add character to the building, but do obstruct a location with prime views. Most windows appear to retain original exterior trim and some possibly original transoms. Only Apart from these few stained glass windows, new windows are appropriate and welcomed.

The large single pane windows on the third floor of the elevation should be replaced with something more compatible with the building design. Matching the current state with is inappropriate. They constitute a very odd intrusion that does not meld with the building's character. They look even odder with the new double-hungs proposed to accompany them on this elevation.

South and West Elevations

Windows here are appropriately placed. The balcony sizes and locations are acceptable. Staff prefers the wood design to the metal and glass design. Both can be considered when more formal drawings are prepared.

The elevator tower is logical, practical, and functionally necessary. Design will need to be carefully considered, but the location and proportions are generally acceptable.

Garage

The garage is large for the site and larger than a typical secondary structure. Attached garages have generally not been allowed, except in rare cases of pure new construction. A six-car garage is possible with careful design that disguises its massing and scale to comport to the character of the subject building.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Conceptual Approval with Conditions

Conditions

- 1. Consider retaining and reused stained glass windows on the exterior. They do not need to be used in their current locations, as they may not be original.
- 2. The large single pane windows on the third floor of the elevation should be replaced with something more compatible with the building design.
- 3. Once current paint is removed, evaluate condition of masonry before repainting. Any terra cotta should not be repainted. Painting of south and west elevations may be appropriate regardless of underlying conditions; it is assumed brickwork here was originally substandard.
- 4. New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. See the city's books As Good As New or Good for Business, Masonry Chapters, for more information. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before repointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick. A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.