

LIVING WITH HISTORY

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

HPC meeting date: 3/4/2019 Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #114686 CCF #181640		
Property	2912 E. BELLEVIEW PL.	North Point North HD
Owner/Applicant	SAMUEL J RADCLIFFE MARY JO RADCLIFFE 2912 E BELLEVIEW PL MILWAUKEE WI 53211	Mary Jo Radcliffe 2912 E Belleview Pl Milwaukee, WI 53211 Phone: (414) 964-8325
Proposal	1) Replace rotted steel lintels over two window bays, one on the north elevation and one on the south elevation; requisite tuck pointing to match existing (see attached).	
	 2) Replace non-original aluminum storm/screen combinations with new Marvin Ultimate wood storm/screen combinations; a total of 26 storm/screen combinations, 7 on the first floor and 19 on the second floor. Existing original wood storms and screens will not be replaced (see attached). 	
	3) Replace non-original Pella casement windows with new Marvin casement windows on 2nd floor elevation. New units consist of two 3-wide units and two single windows with leaded tape applied to match original windows (see attached).	
	4) New storm/screen combinations and new windows and all exterior trim and gutters/downspouts (except main entry door and garage doors) will be prepared, primed, and painted. Existing beige color will be changed to a taupe color (see attached).	
Staff comments	Mr. Jakubovich approved identical Marvin windows with zinc/leaded tape for other windows on this house without taking the review to the Commission. Given the precedent set for this particular property and the fact that the windows proposed for replacement are demonstrably non-original, staff has no objection to the window proposal.	
	The scope of work for painting includes a non-paint product, Sherwin Williams Sherlastic. It is an elastomeric coating loosely related to Rhinoshield. Several state historic preservation offices, including our own, have determined that elastomeric coatings cannot meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for rehabilitation.	
	These coatings are designed for modern construction with insulation and vapor barriers that historic buildings do not have. It is likely that this will worsen deterioration of the stucco in a historic wall. Product literature indicates that it would certainly serve its purpose of "Reduc[ing] water damage on interior surfaces by protecting exterior concrete and masonry surfaces against wind-driven rain." There is no indication that it is permeable from the inside. Historic homes exhaust moisture through their walls and when they cannot, it causes mold and severe damage to the wall structure.	
	Recommend approval of everything exce	ept the elastomeric coating.
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval	

Conditions

1. No elastomeric coatings to be used, this includes, but is not limited to, the proposed Sherlastic product line.

2. Standard masonry conditions

New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. See the city's books As Good As New or Good for Business, Masonry Chapters, for more information. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before repointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES SHALL UNPAINTED MASONRY BE PAINTED, BE GIVEN A WATERPROOFING TREATMENT, OR CLEANED BY ABRASIVE MEANS.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action