**GRANT F. LANGLEY**City Attorney

MIRIAM R. HORWITZ ADAM B. STEPHENS MARY L. SCHANNING JAN A. SMOKOWICZ Deputy City Attorneys



Milwaukee City Hall Suite 800 • 200 East Wells Street • Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-3551 Telephone: 414.286.2601 • TDD: 414.286.2025 • Fax: 414.286.8550

September 24, 2018

To the Honorable Common Council of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

Re:

Communication from Alicia D. Bean

C.I. File No. 1068-2018-1662

Dear Council Members:

Enclosed please find a proposed resolution. We ask that it be introduced and referred to the Committee on Judiciary & Legislation, with the following recommendation.

On May 4, 2018 Alicia Bean's 2015 Chevy Impala, legally parked, was crushed by a large Silver Maple tree branch. She alleges that no weather conditions were present at the time that would have caused a tree branch to fall in this manner. She further alleges that a resident in the same area had previously complained to the City about this same tree. Ms. Bean claims damages of \$27,125.00 for property damages.

Forestry section investigated this matter. On the date of the incident, the City experienced wind gusts reaching 45 mph. The tree and branch were alive, but the branch did have signs of internal decay. On the day of the incident, Forestry responded to multiple requests regarding broken branches down from City trees.

The Forestry section, in review of their call records, received one previous service request about the tree in question, for the six years preceding this incident. Forestry Section investigation concluded that no reasonable or prudent action on its part could have foreseen or prevented the tree branch from falling onto Ms. Bean's automobile.

SUSAN E. LAPPEN PATRICIA A. FRICKER **HEIDI WICK SPOERL GREGG C. HAGOPIAN ELLEN H. TANGEN** JAY A. UNORA KATHRYN Z. BLOCK **KEVIN P. SULLIVAN** THOMAS D. MILLER ROBIN A. PEDERSON JEREMY R. MCKENZIE PETER J. BLOCK JOANNA FRACZEK JENNY YUAN KAIL J. DECKER **ALLISON N. FLANAGAN** PATRICK J. LEIGL **HEATHER H. HOUGH** ANDREA J. FOWLER PATRICK J. MCCLAIN **NAOMI E. GEHLING CALVIN V. FERMIN** BENJAMIN J. ROOVERS **ELLENY B. CHRISTOPOULOS** RACHEL S. KENNEDY TYRONE M. ST. JUNIOR HANNAH R. JAHN SAVEON D. GRENELL **ROSE SIMON-SILVA** JULIE P. WILSON **GREGORY P. KRUSE** Assistant City Attorneys



Honorable Common Council September 24, 2018 Page 2

In that there is no evidence that the City was negligent in this matter, the City would not be liable for damages the occurred to Ms. Bean's automobile on May 4, 2018. Therefore, we recommend that this claim be denied.

Very truly yours,

GRANT F. LANGLEY

City-Attorney

PATRICIA A. FRICKER Assistant City Attorney

PAF:mal Enclosure

1068-2018-1662:252734