

# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/1/2018 Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3 Staff reviewer: Tim Askin PTS #114621 CCF #180806

Property 2205 N. LAKE DR. North Point South HD

Owner/Applicant ERIC WAGNER Mr. Kelly Denk

2205 N LAKE DR Vetter Denk Architects, Inc.
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 161 S. 1st St., Suite 400
Milwaukee, WI 53204

## **Proposal**

- 1. Reclad a sided area on the north elevation with new clear cedar or Smartside
- 2. Replace three windows at the west end of the south elevation with taller windows to match heights of other windows on the same floor.
- Replace two kitchen windows with smaller windows in similar design to existing.
   Replace aluminum storms with new wood storms. Model to be determined.

### Staff comments

# Siding

Staff cannot recommend residing of the portion of the north elevation with Smartside based on Commission precedent. The applicants have proposed an alternate of clear cedar for this location, which is acceptable.

#### Window sizes

Both window proposals are straightforward, but one is unusual. The north windows are in a clapboard wall in a hidden portion of the building. The proposal to alter their size to something slightly smaller (89x53 to 89x45) is acceptable, as it is a clapboard wall that is readily modified and on a secondary, well-hidden elevation.

The south window request is unusual and is presented to the Commission with a neutral recommendation. The request makes aesthetic sense, but deviates from most standard preservation practices.

The North Point South guidelines say the following:

A.3.a. Retain existing window and door openings that are visible from the public right-of-way. Retain the original configurations of panes, sash, lintels, keystones, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods, doors, shutters, and hardware. Avoid making additional openings or changes in the principal elevations by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door panes or sash.

## Window design

The windows are proposed to be done by Acker or by JeldWen. Staff has not seen final designs for either window, but does not believe the JeldWen can be manufactured to match original windows adequately. However, the JeldWen product could be acceptable for the two kitchen windows that face north as they are already from a different period and not installed within brickwork like those in the rest of the house. As has been the standard for JeldWen approvals, the optional 3.5" bottom rail is required for double hung replacement windows. Guideline A.3.b. "If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash."

Storm window design is not final. The architects have been presented with a list of requirements. As the applicants already desire a wood storm, the details can be referred to staff.

## Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

## **Conditions**

- 1. Deny Smartside and require wood option.
- 2. If south elevation window enlargement is approved, require reconstruction of brick headers using salvaged brick.
- 3. Defer window specifications other than size and wood material to staff approval.
- 4. Standard masonry conditions:

New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. See the city's books As Good As New or Good for Business, Masonry Chapters, for more information. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before repointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action