



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 5/7/2018
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114483 CCF #171822

Property	1923 N. 2ND ST.	Brewers Hill Historic District
Owner/Applicant	MIDWEST COMMERCIAL FUNDING LLC 1521 WAUKESHA RD CALEDONIA WI 53108	Mr. David J Koscielniak Koz-i-tec-ture 12310 W. Waterford Ave. Greenfield, WI 53228 Phone: (414) 303-8489
Proposal	Applicant proposes to construct a new two-car garage at the alley behind the existing house. It will be over 100' from the front lot line and due to the narrow lot; public visibility will be negligible.	
Staff comments	<p>The house on this lot has multiple pending violations with the Department of Neighborhood Services. Construction has been ongoing at this site for several years.</p> <p>The construction date of the existing masonry house at this address has not been researched at this point. At one time, there were two sheds and a substantial barn on the premises as well. We do know it predates 1890. Its current appearance as a bungalow is due to the full-length porch that was added by the time of the 1910 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. The rear frame additions were added after 1920 and are currently being reconstructed due to structural conditions discovered during a previously approved whole house renovation. The rear of the lot has been used as surface parking with no garage since at least the 1960s.</p> <p>The proposal is a new construction two-car garage at the rear of the lot, facing the alley. The proposal is a very simple rectangular design with a front gable (8/12 pitch) over the overhead garage doors and a service door on the side. It will measure 24' x 20', narrow side facing the alley with a setback of 4' from the alley. The garage has many of our required features such as corner boards and a water table that have been required of new construction garages. Garage doors will be embossed steel, creating a paneled effect. A similar door type was approved by this commission in Brewers Hill in December 2016; the garage doors are acceptable as proposed</p> <p>The pedestrian door is fiberglass with a three-panel design. This door should be wood or have a wood veneer. A different design would be preferred and should be worked out with staff.</p> <p>Side walls are just over 9' in height, which is lower than the 10' standard commonly adopted by the commission, 10' should be encouraged, but staff will not recommend requiring it. Additionally, some sort of fenestration should be encouraged.</p> <p>The proposals for the garages at 1919 and 1923 are identical, excepting door choice and side setbacks.</p>	

Materials Comments

Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal. Staff is not willing to recommend the LP Smartside product. Its method of manufacture suggests that it may not live up to its promises. Nonetheless, for a garage on an alley, it may be no worse a choice than fiber-cement products that have been previously approved in these situations. It has the highly similar flaws to fiber cement in that joints have to be sealed and painted. It is highly difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the fibrous material is rated for environmental exposure. All non-flush nail holes and all cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot. The material has been previously denied.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Require trim to be rot-resistant, clear-grain wood. This has been required in similar circumstances when cement-fiber siding was used for a garage.
2. Pedestrian door should be wood or wood veneer with a different paneled design.
3. Commission should consider requiring a window on the house-facing elevation.
4. Commission should consider requiring use of cement fiber siding or natural wood for the siding.
5. If the SmartSide is approved, it must be smooth finish and not have an artificial wood grain.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council action**