



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 5/7/2018  
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6  
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin  
PTS #114482 CCF # 171821

|                        |  |  |
|------------------------|--|--|
| <b>Property</b>        | 1919 - 1921 N. 2ND ST. .   | Brewers Hill Historic District   |
| <b>Owner/Applicant</b> | FORWARD INVESTMENT GROUP, LL<br>1111 E COURTLAND PL<br>WHITEFISH BAY WI 53211  | Mr. Dave Koscielniak<br>Koz-i-tec-ture<br>12310 W Waterford Av<br>Greenfield, WI 53228-1892<br>Phone: (414) 303-8489 |
| <b>Proposal</b>        | Construct new two-car garage at alley, at over 100' from the front lot line. The wide lot will allow some visibility of the east and south elevations of the garage.   |  |
| <b>Staff comments</b>  | <p>The house on this property is currently under condemnation orders by DNS. All work on the house approved under a Certificate of Appropriateness is required to be completed by May 16, 2018. Construction has been ongoing at this site for several years.</p> <p>The proposal is a new construction two-car garage at the rear of the lot, facing the alley. The proposal is a very simple rectangular design with a front gable (8/12 pitch) over the overhead garage doors and a service door on the side. It will measure 24' x 20', narrow side facing the alley with a setback of 4' from the alley. The garage has many of our required features such as corner boards and a water table that have been required of new construction garages. Garage doors will be embossed steel, creating a paneled effect. A similar door type was approved by this commission in Brewers Hill in December 2016; the garage doors are acceptable as proposed.</p> <p>Pedestrian door is fiberglass with a four-panel design. . This door should be wood or have a wood veneer, but the design is acceptable. Side walls are just over 9' in height, which is lower than the 10' standard commonly adopted by the commission, 10' should be encouraged, but staff will not recommend requiring it. Some sort of fenestration should be encouraged.</p> <p><b>Materials</b></p> <p>Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal. It is an engineered wood product of chips, glues, and resins first introduced in 1990 and reformulated under the current name in 1997 after a class action lawsuit regarding longevity of the product. The product is maintenance heavy and difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the wood material is rated for environmental exposure. All nail holes and cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot. Staff strongly opposes the use of this material.</p> <p>The proposals for the garages at 1919 and 1923 are identical, excepting door choice and side setbacks.</p> |  |
| <b>Recommendation</b>  | Recommend HPC Approval with conditions   |  |

**Conditions**

1. Require trim to be rot-resistant, clear-grain wood. This has been required in similar circumstances when cement-fiber siding was used for a garage.
2. Pedestrian door should be wood or wood veneer.
3. Commission should consider requiring a window on the house-facing elevation.
4. Commission should consider requiring use of cement fiber siding or natural wood for the siding.
5. If the SmartSide is approved, it must be smooth finish and not have an artificial wood grain.

**Previous HPC action****Previous Council action**