



# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 1/8/2018  
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6  
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin  
PTS #114437 CCF #171371

<b>Property</b>	1851 N. 2ND ST.	Brewers Hill HD
<b>Owner/Applicant</b>	CITY OF MILW-DCD Real Estate 809 N BROADWAY MILWAUKEE WI 53202  On Behalf of Kyle and Lisa Safranek	Ms. Amanda Raabe Tredo 219 N Milwaukee St Milwaukee, WI 53202 Phone: (414) 531-3455
<b>Proposal</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Demolish out-of-period garage.</li><li>2. Repair and tuckpoint foundation and any other brick surfaces.</li><li>3. Repair and replace various windows.</li><li>4. Create two new windows on the rear elevation and one new window on rear of south elevation.</li><li>5. Various necessary exterior repairs including potential partial rebuild of entry doors</li></ol>	
<b>History</b>	<p>Subject property is an 1850s Italianate house in the Brewers Hill neighborhood. An addition and a garage were constructed at the rear in the 1920s. There are some indications that there was a never-legal second residential unit on part of the second floor.</p> <p>The home is a city-owned property and it is staff understands that the sale has not yet closed. Applicants are understandably seeking the Commission's approval of the rehabilitation before completing the sale. Several final design choices are not complete and they request that those decisions be delegated to staff.</p>	
<b>Garage Demolition</b>	<p>Garage Demo The garage was built in 1929 and remodeled to its current state in 1982.</p> <p><i>Relevant Demolition Criteria</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>2. Importance Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is of historical or architectural significance or displays a quality of material and craftsmanship that does not exist in other structures in the area. <i>The garage is demonstrably not part of the historic period and has been irrevocably altered from its own original design.</i></li><li>3. Location Consideration will be given to whether or not the building contributes to the neighborhood and the general street appearance and has a positive effect on other buildings in the area. <i>Given the 1982 remodel, the garage adds nothing to the character of the Brewers Hill district.</i></li></ol> <p>These are the most relevant demolition criteria and they are met. Demolition should be approved. Staff recommends addressing the garage demolition as an independent motion now before moving to the rest of the application.</p>	

## Rehabilitation

### *Tuckpointing*

Staff has no concerns about tuckpointing if applicant accepts the standard conditions applied to all masonry projects.

### *Fixtures*

Rejuvenation upright sconces in black. Plain flat-bar type handrail where required by code. Brass door hardware. All are acceptable as proposed.

### *Windows*

Replacement, repair, relocation, and additional windows are all proposed. Windows are of various ages, but many are clearly 19<sup>th</sup> century and, to staff's eyes, most are repairable.

For new and replacement windows applicant expects to use to Kolbe & Kolbe Heritage Double Hungs. They are currently bidding out various products that staff has suggested. They have no objection to using all-wood windows.

As bidding and shop drawings are not yet available, applicant requests that for any new and replacement windows, that final approval on the window product be granted to staff. Staff supports this approach and believes that the Kolbe product is likely to be satisfactory.

### *Proposed Replacement and New Windows*

All elevations: new wood storms as needed/desired. Those not proposed for replacement will be repaired and restored as needed. Double-hung 6/6 are proposed where not otherwise specified

#### East (front, 2<sup>nd</sup> Street):

- E1. Replace all three second-floor windows with two-over-four sash to imitate the one remaining historic window.
- E2. Replace "parson's door" with 6/6 window.

#### North (Reservoir Street):

- N1. Relocate existing second floor window in original portion of building approximately 2 feet west to accommodate modern code requirements and new bathroom on interior.
- N2. Replace ground floor kitchen-wing windows as 6/6. Present windows are pin-hung 1/1 sash. While old, they are in poor condition and an odd match to other windows in the area.

#### West (rear)

- W1. Install new window near existing stoop
- W2. New door, design is yet to be specified. Existing door is plywood hollowcore and severely damaged.

#### South

- S1. Replace kitchen-wing windows. Existing windows are 1960s era 1/1.
- S2. Create new second floor opening for 3-pane single sash fixed or hopper/awning window to match existing and add symmetry
- S3. Existing 2/2 pin-hung windows will be rehabbed and converted to double hung or some other operational method to enhance safety in this future children's bedroom

Staff is willing to grant replacement of all of the ground floor windows in the rear kitchen wing. While there are two pin windows back there, they are in poor condition and inconsistent with windows elsewhere on the house. The applicants have expressed willingness to retain pin windows on the second floor.

Staff recommends that the following replacement window be denied:  
N1. Northernmost window on upper level of primary façade. It is a unique window and clearly one of the oldest in the house with its two-over-four cottage sash and deep, thin muntins.

For the E2 replacement of a door with a window. Staff would prefer that it be repaired, re-glazed, and fixed in place to achieve a similar effect to installing a new window. However, the door's integrity is modest and it is not a major character-defining feature. Trim scars suggest that there was a window in this location at one time or that the bottom half of the door was sided over to make it appear as a window.

**Recommendation**

Recommend HPC Approval of garage demolition without conditions  
Recommend HPC Approval of house rehabilitation with conditions

**Conditions**

1. Retain original window on upper level of north end of front facade
2. Retain second floor south bedroom pin windows, but allow change of operation, with method of alteration to be reviewed by staff
3. Staff approval of final window shop drawings
4. Storms and screen to be wood, delegate to staff for approval
5. New rear door for staff approval
6. Standard masonry conditions: New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before tuckpointing.
7. Consider requiring retention of "parson's door"

**Previous HPC action**

Both porches were approved for reconstruction in 2014. This and other repairs were completed with city funds for \$99,000.

**Previous Council action**