

INVITATION FOR BIDS TABULATION/ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

Contracting Agency: Housing Authority of the City of Milwaukee
Official Notice Number: 57797
Date and Time of Opening: Friday, July 14, 2:00 PM (CDST)
Type of Work, Services, or Material: Hazardous Materials Abatement, Building Demolition,
and Site Clearance (Phase 2) at Westlawn Gardens Phase 2
[Bid Package 5]
Housing Development and Number: Westlawn West, WI-70
Budget Amount/Cost Estimate: \$937,365.00
Budget/Account Number: WG2/Phase 2B Pre Development; 553-443034-xxxx

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>City, State</u>	<u>Amount</u>
<i>Dakota Intertek Corp.</i>	<i>New Berlin, WI</i>	<i>\$725,200.00</i>
D&H Demolition LLC	Milwaukee, WI	\$749,500.00
Rams Contracting Ltd.	Lannon, WI	\$938,000.00

PROCUREMENT REVIEW

PROCURING SECTION: Modernization & Development Services

Based on the recommendation of our consultants, Torti Gallas and Partners Inc. and Professional Service Industries Inc. (letters attached), the Modernization & Development Services section recommends award to Dakota Intertek Corp., the lowest responsive and responsible bidder.

Director of Development _____ Date _____

EMERGING BUSINESS ENTERPRISES

Target Contracting 20% MBE, WBE, or any combination thereof subcontract participation
Proposed Subcontracting 2 % MBE; 3% WBE
Proposed Contracting 100% MBE when counting Dakota's MBE designation and project participation at 68%

Dakota is a certified Minority Business Enterprise (MBE) through the State of Wisconsin's Department of Administration (DOA). Dakota is scheduled to self-perform 68% of the project, which will be notated at 100% EBE participation on this proposed contract. Dakota will exceed the minimum dollar threshold to trigger EBE goals with a bid of \$725,200.00 and has proposed to subcontract EFH Trucking at 3% (NTE \$20,000.00) and Stanley Harris Trucking at 2% (NTE \$15,000.00), exceeding the EBE participation goal of 20%. It has been recommended to proceed by the Section 3 Coordinator and agreed to by Dakota's Vice-President Don Callen that he will inform the Section 3 Coordinator of any upcoming subcontracting opportunities through Dakota (or any potential EBE and non-EBE subcontractors) that may be of interest to contractors who may meet the minimum MBE/WBE requirements per the DOA guidelines. Also, in the event that a decision is made on a need to subcontract under this proposed contract, Dakota and all potential subcontractors under umbrella of this proposed contract will inform the Section 3 Coordinator prior to the occurrence.

Section 3 Coordinator _____ Date _____

INVITATION FOR BIDS TABULATION/ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

Contracting Agency: Housing Authority of the City of Milwaukee
Official Notice Number: 57797
Date and Time of Opening: Friday, July 14, 2:00 PM (CDST)
Type of Work, Services, or Material: Hazardous Materials Abatement, Building Demolition,
and Site Clearance (Phase 2) at Westlawn Gardens Phase 2
[Bid Package 5]
Housing Development and Number: Westlawn West, WI-70
Budget Amount/Cost Estimate: \$937,365.00
Budget/Account Number: WG2/Phase 2B Pre Development; 553-443034-xxxx

SECTION 3

Target Employment 30% of new hires
Proposed Employment no need to hire reported to-date

Target Contracting 10%
Proposed Subcontracting 26%
Proposed Contracting 94% when counting Dakota's Section 3 designation and project participation at 68%

Dakota is a self-certified Section 3 Business Concern. Dakota indicated no need to hire but will subcontract in its proposal and will meet Section 3 business eligibility criteria as defined by subcontracting in excess of 25% to self-certified Section 3 Business Concerns, (EFH Trucking at 3%, Stanley Harris Trucking at 2%, and Braxton Environmental at 21%), which will also qualify Dakota as a Section 3 Business Concern on this proposed contract. It has been recommended to proceed by the Section 3 Coordinator and agreed to by Dakota's Vice President, Don Callen, that he will inform the Section 3 Coordinator of any upcoming employment opportunities through Dakota (or any potential Section 3 and non-Section 3 subcontractors) under this proposal that may be of interest to HACM residents/(lower tier) non-HACM residents who may meet the minimum employability requirements. Also, in the event that a decision is made based on a need to hire or subcontract under the proposed contract, Dakota and all potential subcontractors under the proposed contract will inform the Section 3 Coordinator prior to the occurrence.

Section 3 Coordinator _____ Date _____

FINANCE AND ACCOUNTING

Finance and Accounting concurs with the recommendation of the Procuring Section to award a contract to Dakota Intertek Corp. Charge the account number(s) as indicated above.

Grants Accountant/Budget Analyst _____ Date _____

RECOMMENDATION

RECOMMEND AWARD OF CONTRACT TO DAKOTA INTERTEK CORP., THE LOWEST RESPONSIVE AND RESPONSIBLE BIDDER.

APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

Chief Financial Officer _____ Date _____

Asst Secretary-Mod Coordinator _____ Date _____

APPROVED

Secretary-Executive Director _____ Date _____

HA-195 (11/2015)



July 24th, 2017

Warren Jones
M&D Services Manager
Housing Authority of the City of Milwaukee
5125 West Lisbon Avenue
Milwaukee, WI 53210

PRINCIPALS

John Francis Torti, FALA
Thomas M. Gallas, CPA
Lawrence V. Antoine, AIA, AICP
Robert S. Wallach, AIA
Cheryl A. O'Neill, AICP
Charles G. Coleman, III, RA
Daniel Ashcraft, AIA
Bruce D. Kennett, AIA
Shirley E. Eifer, AIA
Robert S. Goodill, AIA
Neal L. Peyton, FALA
Erik J. Aulestia, AICP
Troy E. McGhee, AICP
Brian E. O'Looney, AIA
Sarah Alexander, AIA
Scott A. Welch, AIA
Robert E. Jaskol, RA

EMERITUS

Tunca Iskir
Sylvia S. Munero

Re: Project: Westlawn, Westlawn Abatement and Demo, Bid Package 5
Project Location: Westlawn Gardens
Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Dear Warren:

As you know, Dakota Intertek, Inc. was the low bidder for Westlawn Abatement and Demo, Bid Package 5. The following is a summary of our review of their bid form, references, HACM's experience, and the bid amount.

Summary of Reference Follow up

Based on previous reference inquiries and more recent direct project experience, obtained through the recently complete Westlawn Phase 1 Demolition and Browning Elementary projects we find that the low bidder Dakota InterTech (DI) has

1. The relevant project experience,
2. A clear understanding of project goals and deliverables (based on their successful completion of Phase 1)
3. Qualified expertise to provide necessary oversight to successfully complete the Westlawn Phase 2 demolition project.

The following is summary of past owner and reference inquiries that support their qualifications:

1. LinkedIn indicates Don Callen has been with Dakota InterTech for 20 years.

Architects of a better world.

TortiGallas.com

1300 Spring Street, Suite 400 | Silver Spring, Maryland 20910 | t 301.588.4800
SILVER SPRING LOS ANGELES WASHINGTON DC TAMPA ISTANBUL

2. DI has worked within City of Milwaukee and familiar with coordination required with City and Utility providers.
3. DI has done many residential demolition projects for the City of Milwaukee.
4. DI bids consistently lower than there competition. Based on a conversation with Zafar Yousef (DPW), it seems cost difference has been significant on projects. He commented as to not sure how they can be so competitive.
5. City has not incurred significant change orders and project is delivered in complete manner.
6. Only opportunity/shortcoming (Zafar) communicated...timely communication of project progress and issues and utility disconnects (which is not a significant component of the Phase 2 demolition scope of work).

Summary of HACM Prior Experience

Dakota Intertek is currently working on the Westlawn Site (Phase 2 (BP1) and on the Browning Elementary School SWM installation) and, per Michael Stancl, they have been performing "satisfactorily to date".

Comparison of Cost Estimate vs Bid

The bid is two hundred and twelve thousand one hundred and sixty-five dollars (\$212,165) below the design team's cost estimate. We can only attribute this difference to a more competitive bidding pool, and Dakota Intertek's familiarity with the site.

Recommendation

Based on the our review of the bid form, information received in our review of their references, and HACM's current experience with Dakota Intertek, Torti Gallas would endorse and support the Housing Authority's decision to award this contract to Dakota Intertek, Inc.

Please call me if you have any further questions.

William Fears.

William Fears

Digitally signed by William Fears
DN: cn=William Fears, o=Torti Gallas and Partners, Inc.,
c=US, email=wfears@tortigallas.com,
date=2017.07.24 15:07:27-0400

Senior Associate
Torti Gallas and Partners, Inc.

cc: Lawrence Antoine / Torti Gallas

July 20, 2017

Mr. David Flores
Housing Authority of the City of Milwaukee
5125 W. Lisbon
Milwaukee, WI 53210

Re: Hazardous Materials Abatement, Building Demolition and Site Clearance (Phase 2) at Westlawn Gardens Phase 2 [Bid Package 5]
Official Notice Number 57797

Dear Mr. Flores,

As you requested, PSI has reviewed the asbestos abatement portion of the bids for the above referenced project. Dakota Intertek Corp. (Dakota) submitted the lowest responsive bid of \$725,200.00, of which, \$150,000.00 was allotted to Braxton Environmental (Braxton) for abatement. This amount was in line with PSI's estimate of \$180-200,00.00. Following is our recommendation for awarding the contract to Dakota, along with additional reasoning for making that recommendation.


PSI spoke with Mr. Bill Cook of Braxton, Dakota's asbestos abatement subcontractor, on July 19, 2017 to ascertain their understanding of the scope of work involved and their ability to perform the work for the quoted price and within the allotted time. Mr. Cook assured PSI that he had a thorough understanding of the work as detailed in the specifications and was confident in their ability to perform the work at the price bid.

In addition to the above, PSI reviewed the National and Wisconsin / Better Business Bureau (BBB) web-site for any complaints filed against Braxton. No Information was found for Braxton Environmental.

In conclusion, PSI recommends that Dakota Intertek Corp. be awarded the work. Please contact PSI at (262) 521-2125 with any questions or comments.

Respectfully submitted,
PROFESSIONAL SERVICE INDUSTRIES, INC.


Jim Updike
Project Manager


Larry Raether, P.E.
Department Manager