Committee on Finance and Personnel Workforce Planning Initiative Department of **Employee Relations**

July 7, 2017

Workforce Staffing Challenges

- Significant increase in the number of resignations and retirements
- Knowledge and experience drain
- A growing economy means job applicants have options
- Generations matter
- Difficulty recruiting for and filling key positions
- Public sector hiring challenges and opportunities

Workforce Planning Initiative Goals

- Goal #1: Identify and better anticipate departmental staffing needs
- Goal #2: Streamline recruitment, examination, and placement processes to expedite the filling of vacancies
- Goal #3: Identify difficult to recruit for positions and work with departments to develop and implement targeted recruitment, retention, and succession plans

Increase in General City Separations

(excludes MPD AND MFD)

- The JS reported last week that 1 in 7 workers leave state employment for a number of reasons including stagnant wages, market competition, and cuts to take home pay.
- In 2016, 1 of 11 general city employees left their position through resignation or retirement
- THIS IS A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE from 2012
- In 2012, 1 in 23 general city employees left their position through resignation or retirement.

Possible Reasons

- Impact of Act 10
- Changes in the labor market
- Economic growth and development in the Milwaukee metro area
- Perception of better promotional or career opportunities in the private sector
- New City employees enhance their skills and abilities on the job and become very marketable
- Better paying jobs
- Incentives to leave signing bonuses + other benefits
- Change in demographics- applicants are looking for different things from an employer

General City Resignations

2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
37	57	70	83	116	137	149
	Average	2011- 20 ²	13 = 70	Average	2014 - 20	016= 134

- In 2016 there were 149 resignations 9% increase over 2015
- Over the last three year period (2014-2016), the average number of resignations in the city service is 134.
- The average number of resignations over the previous three year period (2011 – 2013) was 70.
- The rate at which general City employees are resigning their position has doubled in the last six years.

Resignations by Department 2010-2016

Resignations by Department	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
ASSESSOR'S OFFICE				1	2	1	1
BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS				1			2
CITY ATTORNEY	1	3		2	1	3	1
CITY TREASURER			2				1
COMMON COUNCIL - CITY CLERK	1	2	2	5	3	1	7
COMPTROLLER				1	2		2
DCD	2	2	1	3		4	2
DEFERRED COMPENSATION PLAN							1
DEPT OF NEIGHBORHOOD SRVCS	2		5	6	8	<mark>18</mark>	<mark>7</mark>
DER				1	2	2	1
DOA	2	1	1	1	2	4	5
DOA-ITMD			2	3	1	2	5
DPW-ADMIN	1		1	1			1
DPW-INFRA	5	9	6	6	8	<mark>15</mark>	<mark>15</mark>
DPW-OPS	2	6	10	11	<mark>26</mark>	<mark>33</mark>	<mark>38</mark>
DPW-PARKING	3	1	10	6	5	<mark>13</mark>	4
DPW-SEWER	1	1	4	3	3	2	2
DPW-WATER	1	5	5	3	<mark>12</mark>	<mark>10</mark>	<mark>11</mark>
ELECTION COMMISSION							1
EMPLOYE'S RETIREMENT SYSTEM		1		1			1
FIRE AND POLICE COMMISSION		1		1		1	1
HEALTH DEPARTMENT	14	19	15	15	21	<mark>15</mark>	<mark>26</mark>
Library	1	6	5	11	15	13	9
MUNICIPAL COURT	1				4		3
PORT OF MILWAUKEE			1	2	1		2

Resignation Analysis by Department

- DNS with 18 resignations in 2015 6 of those resignations were from the Building Construction Inspectors, 5 were from Commercial and Residential Inspectors, and 2 were from Elevator Inspectors.
- **DPW Infrastructure** with a significant increase in resignations in 2015 and 2016 the classifications with the highest number of resignations during that two year period include: City Laborers (8), Drafting Techs/Engineering Techs (6), Electrical Mechanics (3), Civil Engineers (3), and Public Works Inspectors (3).
- **DPW Operations** with a significant increase in resignations in 2015 and 2016 the classifications with the highest number of resignations during that two year period include: Operations Driver Workers (30), Urban Forestry Specialists (10), City Laborers (6).
- DPW- Parking with a significant number of resignations in 2015 10 Parking Enforcement Officers.
- MHD with a significant number of resignations in 2016 (26) 10 of the resignations were from Public Health Nurses and 3 were from Clinic Assistants.

Resignations Analysis by Generation 2010 – 2016

GC Resignations by Age Range	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	4 Year Avg	% of City Work- force
Age Range 18-35/Millennials	18	26	28	36	<mark>56</mark>	<mark>45</mark>	<mark>58</mark>	49	<mark>18%</mark>
% of total	49%	46%	40%	43%	48%	33%	39%	40%	
Age Range 36-50/Generation X	15	21	32	41	<mark>41</mark>	<mark>69</mark>	<mark>65</mark>	54	<mark>45%</mark>
% of total	41%	37%	46%	49%	35%	50%	44%	44%	
Age Range 51-70/Baby Boomers	4	10	10	7	19	23	25	19	35%
% of total	11%	18%	14%	8%	16%	17%	17%	15%	
Age Range 71+/Traditionalists							1	2	1%
Grand Total	37	57	70	84	116	137	149	122	

58 or 40% of the resignations in 2016 were millennials even though they only represent 18% of the City's workforce.

Resignations by Length of Service 2010 - 2016

GC Resignation of Serv	•	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	4 Year Avg
0-5 Years		32	46	63	69	93	115	121	100
	% of total	86%	81%	90%	82%	80%	84%	81%	82%
6-10 Years		4	10	4	10	14	17	15	14
	% of total	11%	18%	6%	12%	12%	12%	10%	12%
11-15 Years				2	4	7	4	11	7
	% of total	0%	0%	3%	5%	6%	3%	7%	5%
16-20 Years		1		1	1	1		2	1
	% of total	3%	0%	1%	1%	1%	0%	1%	1%
20+ Years			1			1	1		1
Grand Total		37	57	70	84	116	137	149	122

On average, 82% of the employees who separate leave within the first 5 years of employment, most within the first 4

Generations Matter

Data about Millennials from a Gallup poll used in Harvard business review - May of 2016 6/10 are open to new opportunities 93% left their employer for another job 71% are either not engaged or actively disengaged at work They will shop around to find the job that best aligns with their needs and life goals.

Millennials Look For Opportunity to learn and grow

A great manager and being part of a great culture

A job well suited to their skills and interests

Wages that they can live on – high amounts of student debt

Work Life balance

Flexible schedules

Non Stop Feedback

Service Retirements 2010-2016

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	4 year Average
Grand Total	292	146	77	107	117	122	144	123
				39%	9%	4%	18%	% Change

The number of general city service retirements in 2016 was 144. This represents an increase of 18% when compared to the number of retirements in 2015.

Retirements by Department 2010-2016

GC Retirements	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	4 yr average
ASSESSOR'S OFFICE	6	3	1	2	2	4	3	3
CITY ATTORNEY	5		1	2	2	5	3	3
CITY TREASURER	3	4		1		1		1
COMMON COUNCIL - CITY CLERK	3	1	2		1	6	3	3
COMPTROLLER	2	6	2	1	2	5	2	3
DCD	23	4	3	8	8	11	5	8
DEPT OF NEIGHBORHOOD SRVCS	16	8	5	5	6	3	10	6
DER	6	4	2		2	2	3	2
DOA	1	3	2	2	2		3	2
DOA-ITMD	3	3	2	3	2	4	1	3
DPW-ADMIN	4	5	2	2		1	2	2
DPW-INFRA	60	26	14	35	16	24	29	26
DPW-OPS	47	30	12	13	33	14	30	23
DPW-PARKING	12	3	4	3	3	2	4	3
DPW-SEWER	10	3	2	3	3	3		3
DPW-WATER	31	18	9	8	20	16	12	14
ELECTION COMMISSION						1		1
EMPLOYE'S RETIREMENT SYSTEM	3	2			1	2	2	2
FIRE AND POLICE COMMISSION					1			1
HEALTH DEPARTMENT	16	8	3	11	6	7	13	9
Library	31	11	7	8	6	9	14	9
MAYOR		2						0
MUNICIPAL COURT	8		3			1	4	3
PORT OF MILWAUKEE	2	2	1		1	1	1	1

Service Retirement Eligibility by Department 2017 and 2020

		As % of		2020 as % of
SR by Department	Elig 2017	Current FTE	Elig 2020	Current FTE
ASSESSOR'S OFFICE	14	29%	15	31%
CCCC	21	22%	31	33%
CITY ATTORNEY	14	23%	20	33%
CITY TREASURER	4	14%	6	21%
COMPTROLLER	18	31%	24	41%
DCD	24	23%	36	35%
DEFERRED COMP	0	0%	1	50%
DER	10	21%	13	27%
DNS	51	19%	72	27%
DOA	8	12%	14	21%
DOA - INFO & TECH MGT DIV	10	13%	13	16%
DPW-ADMIN	11	24%	17	37%
DPW-INFRA	120	20%	190	31%
DPW-OPS	105	14%	188	26%
DPW-PARKING	15	13%	32	27%
DPW-SEWER	12	10%	18	16%
DPW-WATER	51	14%	96	26%
ELECTION COMMISSION	3	38%	10	125%
ERS	10	23%	14	33%
FIRE AND POLICE COMM	3	21%	3	21%
MAYOR	2	15%	3	23%
MHD	37	15%	59	24%
MPL	43	14%	63	21%
MUNICIPAL COURT	5	15%	6	18%
PORT OF MILWAUKEE	3	15%	6	30%
Grand Total	594		950	

Service Retirement Projections

- 594 general city employees are eligible for service retirement this year - approximately 18% of the workforce.
- In 2020, an additional 356 employees will become eligible for service retirement, representing approximately 29% of the workforce.
- In some departments, such as Comptroller, Assessor and certain divisions of the Department of Public Works, this percentage is even higher.
- Accordingly, many of our valued, experienced employees with substantial institutional knowledge may leave the organization within the next few years; adjusting to this loss of expertise is going to require substantial planning and allocation of resources.

Recruitment Challenges and Opportunities

In addition to analyzing separations in the City Service, DER has been reviewing examination data to determine the areas where we have experienced challenges recruiting qualified candidates and where a limited number of qualified applicants have been identified and certified for vacancies.

- The analysis included a review of outside recruitments (i.e. open and competitive) performed from 2012 to the present for Group A (non-management, administrative support and the trades) Group B (professional and managerial) and Career Ladder (nursing, inspection, property appraiser) positions.
- The recruitment data chart for each group lists titles for which the DER has either performed multiple recruitments within the past five years and/or the eligible lists from those recruitments have yielded seven or fewer qualified candidates.
- The positions that are considered "high risk" are those for which there have been three or more outside recruitments performed during the past five years and at least one of those recruitments yielded seven or fewer qualified candidates.

High Risk Positions

TITLE	# OF SELECTION PROCESSES 2012-2017	YEAR(S) OF RECRUITMENTS THAT YIELDED 7 OR FEWER CANDIDATES	JOB GROUP
PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE	14	2012, 2015,2016, 2017	CAREER LADDER
ENGINEERING DRAFTING TECHNICIAN I	7	2015, 2016, 2017	GROUP A
ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN I	6	2015, 2016, 2017	GROUP A
MUNICIPAL SERVICES ELECTRICIAN	6	2016, 2017	GROUP A
CIVIL ENGINEER I/II	6	2013	GROUP B
VEHICLE SERVICES TECHNICIAN I	5	2015	GROUP A
ELEVATOR INSPECTOR	5	2015, 2016, 2017	CAREER LADDER
WATER REPAIR WORKER	5	2016	GROUP A
ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN IV	4	2015, 2016	GROUP A
MAINTENANCE TECHNICIAN II	4	2014, 2015, 2016, 2017	GROUP A
HEALTH PROJECT ASSISTANT	4	2016	GROUP A
URBAN FORESTRY MANAGER	4	2014, 2016	GROUP B
IT SUPPORT SPECIALIST – SR.	4	2016	GROUP B
PROPERTY APPRAISER	4	2012	CAREER LADDER

Analysis of all Recruitment Data 2012 to Present

- Most of the positions for which eligible lists yield seven or fewer candidates are in Group B and are in the STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Math) areas. The broad job classifications in these areas include accounting, engineering, information technology and public health. Recruiting individuals in the trades, particularly Municipal Electricians, is a current challenge, given the boom in construction in the metropolitan area.
- The number of selection processes that yielded seven or fewer candidates increased significantly from 2102–2016: of significance, this number increased from 0 to 9 for Group A and from 4 to 24 for Group B.
- This represents a new paradigm for the Staffing Division, as our recruitments traditionally yielded a large number of qualified candidates, thus requiring fewer recruitments per title as the eligible lists were utilized multiple times.
- The number of "at risk" positions overall (i.e. three or more recruitments since 2012 and at least one of those recruitments yielded seven or fewer candidates) is 24; there are 10 in Group A, 11 in Group B and four amongst the career ladder positions.
- In 2016, the Staffing Division performed 84 open and competitive examinations; 97 are in process or have been completed to date in 2017.
- The frequency with which examinations are being held for certain titles (e.g. Municipal Electrician, Auditor, Public Health Nurse, Vehicle Services Technician, entry-level professional and paraprofessional engineering positions) has increased, representative of the fact that there are more separations, more employees who are retirement eligible and fewer candidates on each eligible list.

Strategies to Support Goals

Goal #1: Identify and better anticipate Departmental staffing needs

Continuous Recruitment and Testing - Post positions for which there are recurring vacancies on a continuous basis and test periodically throughout the year to ensure an eligible list is available at all times. Examples of titles include:

> Civil Engineer I and II **Library Branch Manager City Laborer**

Engineering Technician I and II Engineering Drafting Technician I and II **Public Health Nurse Municipal Electrician**

- Align the recruitment schedule with the job selection timeframe for college seniors- ensures that the City is competitive with other employers for top graduates in areas such as nursing, engineering and accounting.
- Promote the use of the Auxiliary Resource Program- to encourage departments to anticipate vacancies and to overlap a new incumbent with a separating employee to facilitate the transfer of knowledge and expertise.

Strategies to Support Goals

Goal #2: Streamline recruitment, examination, and placement processes to expedite the filling of vacancies

- Timely and User-friendly Selection Processes Enlist hiring managers to serve on Civil Service structured interview panels, as appropriate, to create efficiencies between the Civil Service process and departmental interviewing.
- Post actual exam dates on the job announcement bulletin to maintain the selection process timeline and to enable candidates to plan their schedules for the testing.
- Engage community-based organizations such as the Milwaukee Urban League and establish partnerships to ensure that Milwaukee residents view the City of Milwaukee as a potential employer and are prepared to apply for City jobs when they are posted.

Strategies to Support Goals

Goal #3: Identify difficult to recruit for classifications and work with departments to develop and implement targeted recruitment, retention, and succession plans.

- Develop connections with Milwaukee high schools for job shadowing opportunities and to develop a recruitment presence, particularly for the engineering technician series.
- Develop and maintain a consistent presence at Milwaukee's technical colleges and universities for the purpose of recruiting candidates and educating staff and students regarding careers with the City of Milwaukee.
- Establish meaningful high school and graduate internships as well as trainee or underfill opportunities in departments (ex: Code Enforcement Intern (DNS), the Management Trainee program, Electrical Mechanic Apprentice (Infrastructure – Electrical Services) and the Trainee program in the Forestry Division.
- Identify difficult to fill and stand alone positions to ensure current employees are prepared to compete for them when there is a vacancy.
- Encourage stay interviews to identify goals and training opportunities for current employees as well as to identify a potential career path.

Workforce Planning Initiative

- Within the spirit and under the direction of the City Service Commission in accordance with state statutes
 - Merit-based
 - Open and competitive
 - Transparent
 - Testing based on job analysis
 - Job-related selection processes
- Data and department driven
- Retention, Succession Planning and Recruitment

Workforce Planning Initiative THE DATA

 Sample template and data for DPW Infrastructure and Admin

Workforce Planning

- Part I: Strategic and Operational Challenges (e.g. budget, legislation, changes in needed KSAs)
- Part II: Identify Workforce Planning Targets (e.g. difficult to fill positions, reasons incumbents are leaving and/or recruitment challenges, positions that require succession planning)
- Part III: Mitigation Strategies
- Part IV: Action Plan: Examples include: training and development of existing staff, connections with community organizations and academic institutions for recruitment, succession planning for specific positions.

Workforce Planning What's next?

- The DER staff is already working with customer departments, such as DPW-Infrastructure, on tailored Workforce Planning Initiatives. Examples of proactive steps the DER is taking with departments as part of workforce planning include:
 - Encouraging the use of the Auxiliary Resource Program for knowledge transfer between a current and new incumbent;
 - Developing succession plans for difficult to fill and critical positions;
 - Identifying the gaps between current skills within the workforce and those that will be needed in the future and identifying a plan to address them;
 - Evaluating and promoting reasonable opportunities for alternative work arrangements, such as flexible schedules and job-sharing, to enable employees to balance work and personal responsibilities.
- July 2017: Staffing Division will schedule meetings with personnel officers and departmental managers in order to obtain feedback on this and other staffing -related processes. Workforce Planning meetings with the individual departments will be held throughout the summer.
- Goal: Implementation of the plan action steps in late 2017 and early 2018.

Alternative Work Arrangements

- Relationship to Separations and Workforce Planning Initiative
- A survey of State and Local Governments conducted by the Center for State and Local Government Excellence published in June of this year identifies recruitment and retention as one of the highest priorities of employers (91% of responders).
 - 56% of the jurisdictions indicated that flexible schedules (such as 4 days, 10 hours) were offered by their organization and 45% of the jurisdictions reported offering flexible work hours (earlier or later start and quitting times).
- These findings are consistent with the Common Council's action earlier this year to create legislation allowing employees to request and department heads to consider alternative work arrangements (AWAs) that better enable employees to balance their work responsibilities with their personal needs and obligations. DER has completed an assessment of the availability and use of AWAs by departments.

AWAs in the City - Findings

- AWAs are permitted and encouraged to allow employees to address health issues, education commitments/interests, child care or other family needs, and transportation issues.
- Some departments require employees to be in good standing and off probation for employees to be able to participate in AWAs;
- AWAs are used to assist in recruitment and retention efforts, to improve morale, expand services to hours when clients and customers are available;
- Decisions regarding requests to participate in AWAs are delegated to section managers and supervisors;
- Department heads have final decision making authority on telecommuting options;
- Factors influencing the availability and use of AWAs in specific departments relate to the compatibility of the service provided and the availability of the client, the type of technology necessary to perform the work, the size of the department, the nature of the services provided, staffing levels, and the degree of oversight or supervision needed to ensure the quality and timeliness of the work product, whether the work is performed by a person or by a team.
- Telecommuting options are used on a limited basis primarily in response to a personal need, in conjunction with an accommodation, or to help transition an employee back to work after an extended leave.

AWA's in the City - Recommendations

- Departments should document AWA options in an employment handbook or work rules or have a standing policy documenting options and protocols for approval.
- DER should prepare and issue guidelines for departments to use in determining the feasibility and viability of AWAs and implementation considerations.
- Departments should implement an annual review of AWAs to ensure the justification for use and participation is consistent with department's mission and the delivery of critical services.
- Departmental policies should ensure that security, productivity, accountability, availability requirements are established and complied with when approving an employee's participation in an AWA.
- The City should consider creating positions at less than 1 FTE but more than .5FTE to achieve savings in salary and benefits while providing opportunities for greater work life balance.
- DER should highlight availability and use of AWAS in recruitment efforts.

Exit Interviews

- DER has developed an Exit Interview Policy and Questionnaire that will facilitate the centralized collection of important data regarding resignation trends.
- Exit interviews are an excellent tool to gather important information about the work environment, day-to-day job concerns of the employees, communication issues, supervisory issues, and employee job satisfaction.
- Exit interviews can be used to gather information which can then play a part in preventing
 future employees from leaving the City and improving our ability to design and implement
 programs and strategies to stem the high rate of separations.
- DER hopes to identify why turnover is higher in certain positions and departments, whether there are management issues in certain areas, and whether the City's compensation and benefit programs are appropriate in attracting, retaining and engaging employees.
- It is our intent to send exit questionnaires to all general city employees who have voluntarily separated effective January of 2017 in order to start collecting relevant data. DER will also offer the opportunity to conduct exit interviews in person when employees give notice of intent to separate, effective in August of this year.