



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 1/9/2017 CCF # 161181
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Dean Doerrfeld
PTS #114183

Property 3011 W. STATE ST.

Owner/Applicant	ANDREW LARSEN	Jason Tetzlaff
	JASON TETZLAFF	3011 W State St
	3011 W STATE ST	Milwaukee, WI 53208
	MILWAUKEE WI 53208	Phone: (414) 640-8250

Proposal Applicants propose to replace the main roof with a synthetic slate product called EnviroSlate. They request the option to perform simultaneously the same work on the roof of the tower.

Staff comments This property was built c. 1850 by Robert Faries, an early dentist in the city and an amateur astronomer. He had the property through February 1854. Later owners included Sydney L. Rood (1854-1863) and Philetus Yale (1863-1905). The house stood on a multi-acre site that was later subdivided. It stands as the oldest house in the Concordia Historic District and is believed to be the oldest house in city limits in single-family use.

A roof inspection conducted by Hansiak Inspection Service, Inc. that was filed with a withdrawn application in summer 2016 summarizes that the current slate roof is in satisfactory condition, some flashing needs attention, gutters and downspouts need maintenance, and no leaks were apparent but there was evidence of past leaks and that the chimney needed maintenance.

There does not appear to be sufficient evidence that the roof is in danger of imminent failure, although there have been obvious leaks in the past. Owners have also not supplied evidence of financial necessity, which, it should be noted, is outside the purview of this committee under the ordinance. This home is simply too iconic and highly visible to permit replacement of the roof with artificial slate at this time. The slate roof is a key character-defining feature on this property, given the mansarded tower and flat-top hipped main roof that are highly visible. Although the commission approved the replacement of a slate roof in November in this same district, that house was minimally visible, and the owners provided proof of failure of the roof and of financial necessity.

Furthermore, the Commission has not yet ever approved a synthetic slate roof. Most have had issues with longevity and uplift. While this product has an extensive warranty, neither the product nor the company has been in existence anywhere near as long as the warranty. Wisconsin Historical Society Staff have indicated general disapproval of this company's products, although they declined comment on this specific product. This nonetheless casts doubts on the project's viability for historic tax credits.

Finally, the proposal does not meet the preservation guidelines for roofs that require retention of original materials whenever possible (1.b.) and that replacement materials match in "size, shape, color, and texture," (1.c.). The proposed product does not appear capable of a color or texture match.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Denial

Conditions	If the Commission prefers to approve a new roof, staff would request that the Commission have the applicant return with stronger evidence of need and roof alternatives including standard asphalt, standard slate, and present material samples of any proposed products in comparison to existing slate on the roof.
Previous HPC action	Submitted for review for asphalt replacement in mid-2016, but the application was withdrawn after sale.
Previous Council action	N/A