## HISTORIC DESIGNATION STUDY REPORT

I. NAME

Historic: George Schuster House

Common Name: Redstone Apartments

II. LOCATION 3209 W. Wells Street

**Legal Description** - Tax Key No: 388-0406-000-3

Dousman's Subd in NE 1/4 SEC 25-7-21

That Part of Lot 7 Com Inter S Li W Wells St & W Li N 32<sup>nd</sup> St-Th W 104.02'-Th S 150'-Th E 104.02'-Th N 150' to Beg

III. CLASSIFICATION

Building

IV. OWNER

Arne and Eunice Vedum 3209 W. Wells Street Milwaukee, WI 53208

ALDERMAN

Ald. Robert Bauman, 4<sup>th</sup> Aldermanic District

**NOMINATOR** 

Arne Vedum

V. YEAR BUILT

1891 (Permit No. 126, September 30, 1981)

ARCHITECT: Crane & Barkhausen (Permit No. 126, September 30, 1891)

# VI. PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION

The George Schuster House is located at the southeast corner of W. Wells and North 32<sup>nd</sup> Streets approximately 2 ¼ miles from the Central Business District. The property measures 104 feet by 150 feet in dimension with the house being positioned at the northwest corner of its lot. It is set back about 40 feet from the 32<sup>nd</sup> Street corner and about 25 feet from the public sidewalk on Wells Street. A large carriage barn sits behind the house and is included in this nomination. The surrounding neighborhood is primarily residential in character with large substantial houses from the 1880s to the 1890s on the adjacent blocks south to Wisconsin Avenue and north on Kilbourn Avenue and Highland Boulevard. Somewhat smaller houses are interspersed within the adjacent Concordia Historic District that has both local and National Register historic status. Apartment houses began to replace some of the mansions by the 1920s. Conversion of mansions and larger dwellings into rooming houses and apartments happened as well. This trend accelerated in the 1960s with most of the large mansions and dwellings being demolished and replaced by apartment buildings with high-density occupancy.

Today there are only 12 houses/duplexes left on Wells Street between N. 27<sup>th</sup> and N. 35<sup>th</sup> Streets. Some are fairly modest, some have undergone insensitive alteration.

The George J. Schuster House is one of a handful of survivors along what was once a grand thoroughfare. It is a large, 2 ½ story, brick and sandstone, hip roofed house built in 1891. It is very eclectic in style showing elements of German Renaissance Revival, Colonial Revival and French Chateauesque. No two elevations are alike and the roofline is a picturesque collection of conical and helmet-shaped roofs, piercing chimneys and shaped gables. The color palette is unique in Milwaukee, a bright red as opposed to taupe/tan, but the overall monochromatic effect is very much in keeping with Germanic tradition. The Wells Street and N. 32 nd Street elevations are the most articulated and are quite distinctive from one another. The rear or south façade and the west façade are more utilitarian in character.

The Wells Street or front facade is the most imposing and uses a massing formula seen in German houses of the period on the continent where centered masonry porches are balanced by projecting towers and elaborate shaped gables. This form becomes a standard for the Milwaukee architectural firm of Crane and Barkhausen. At the Schuster house the entrance is centered on the facade and sheltered by an arcaded masonry porch, here with two large front arches, raised several feet above grade. A tower is located to the west, balanced by a projecting bay on the east that has a bartizan at its corner. The bay is topped with a shaped gable. A hip roof separates the tower from the bay and features an eyebrow dormer. As mentioned above, this tower-shaped gable-arcaded porch form was repeated in later commissions by Crane and Barkhausen but this example remains their most flamboyant and detailed. Attached to the west wall but visually part of the Wells Street elevation is a carriage porch, set back slightly from the main elevation. Originally one story with a large arched opening for carriages, the carriage porch was rebuilt completely, probably in 1924, when the house was converted into apartments. The round arched opening was rebuilt with a segmental opening and the space was enclosed to serve as a garage with a handsome door that features three panels toped with six-light windows. (Milwaukee Sentinel, Sunday September 27, 1891, Part II page 9) A second story was added to the carriage porch that covered over a large projecting window once located on the house's west elevation.

The materials and level of detail on the Wells Street façade are extraordinary and the architects pulled out all the stops on the design. There is literally a riot of shapes, textures and styles in evidence. The level of expertise on the part of the craftsmen who put the building together is phenomenal. Large rusticated sandstone blocks form the foundation of the house and continue at the base of the porch and form the knee walls of the porch. The first story is clad in alternating courses of smooth and rusticated red Portage sandstone cut into blocks smaller than those of the foundation. These wrap around and form the walls of the porch. The sandstone is of a bright red color not seen extensively in Milwaukee. More often the sandstone is of a purplish-red or brownish-red coloration, for example the Button Block, the Kern House and St. Paul's Episcopal Church. The second story of the Schuster House is clad in red brick veneer. Red terra cotta is used in an almost endless variety of shapes and designs on windows, belt courses and frieze panels.

The porch, as mentioned above, utilizes the small rusticated sandstone blocks of varying sizes and its front arches are supported by truncated, Romanesque style, squat posts with stop fluting. The upper balustrade likewise has terra cotta strap work framed by brick piers. The keystones of the arches are graced with lions' heads. Iron tie rods extend through the two front arches.

The round tower at the northwest corner of the façade had a conical roof with slate shingles and a sheet metal finial. On each of the three stories of the tower are located one over one sash windows, two at the attic level, three on the second and three on the first. All three stories are treated differently. The first story windows have lintels that feature a trefoil-like pattern, Gothic in inspiration. The second story, separated from the first by a broad terra cotta belt course, has

segmental window openings articulated by brickmoulds with round button-like forms. The attic story, separated from the second story by a beltcourse with modillions, features two terra cottaenframed windows with shaped gables. The manner in which the gables break into the plane of the roof resembles dormers on French chateaux. Behind the tower, a tall, slab-like chimney extends from the roof. Vertical channels articulate the structure and near the top of the chimney is a band of terra cotta ornament with foliated design.

The portion of the façade east or right of the porch is likewise complex. The first story has a canted corner and supports a bay that breaks forward from the plane of the house. This second story bay sprouts a round bartizan at its south corner and is capped with a shaped gable. The bartizan has rich terra cotta corbel mouldings at its base and a terra cotta balustrade with rectangular openings. The shaped gable at the top of the bay is the largest and most elaborate on the house. It is set off from the second story by a frieze band consisting of terra cotta blocks with embossed fleur-de-lis designs. The gable features two center windows enframed with elaborate pilasters. At the apex of the gable is a ribboned wreath that surrounds the letter "S" for Schuster. Some of the terra cotta scrolls on the gable are now missing and there were once rampant lions, one at each end of the base of the gable. The south one was still extant when H. Russell Zimmermann wrote an article about the house in 1969. (H. Russell Zimmermann, "Wells Street's Red 'Castle'") That one is now gone. Windows on this south bay are simple one-over-one sash. One large landscape sash with segmental top is located on the first floor. Its transom probably held a leaded glass/art glass window. The three windows in the bartizan are enframed with terra cotta pilasters and belt courses. It appears that the easternmost window is a replacement of the original. To the right or west of the bartizan, is a small rectangular window, framed in terra cotta.

The remainder of the front façade, between the conical tower and the shaped gable, is taken up by the porch on the first story as described above and three windows on the second story. Two of those windows match the detail found on the conical tower. The third window is tucked into the west wall of the projecting east bay.

The east elevation fronts 32<sup>nd</sup> Street and continues the red sandstone and red brick as found on the Wells Street façade. It is dominated by a projecting center bay with gabled roof that extends through the east slope of the main hip roof of the house. The bay transitions from a three-sided form to a rectangular box with flared base that overhangs the first story. The first story of the bay is clad in the same red sandstone as the remainder of the house. The upper two floors are clad with red shingles. The second story of the bay features a three-part window framed by pilasters and headed with a broken pediment. This treatment lends a Colonial Revival/Shingle Style element to the design. The third or attic story of the bay features paired windows with a shelf-like projecting curvilinear sill that is supported by a console bracket. To add more detail to this level, the gabled roof returns sit on a cornice supported by paired pilasters that themselves rest on console brackets. Small hip roofed dormers, sheathed in slate shingles, are located to either side of the massive central bay. Next to each of the dormers, tall slab-like chimneys rise up from the east plane of the roof and, instead of intricate corbelling, they feature vertical channeling as well as a band of terra cotta with foliated design near their tops. Another chimney, shorter and less ornamented, can be seen at the ridge of the roof. The architects utilized the southeast corner of the house to transition to another tower, but one quite different from the tower on the Wells Street façade. On the first story is a projecting solarium clad in red sandstone. The second story features red shingles like the large center bay while the third story breaks through the plane of the main roof with a helmet-like, Germanic style roof. This latter roof retains its original slate shingles and sheet metal finial. It features three oneover-one windows with shallow hoods supported by small brackets. The remaining windows on this façade are mostly one-over-one sash and are arranged to conform to the rooms within. Landscape sash are located in the center windows of the primary bay. The transom window on the second story still retains its original leaded glass. Lintels on the windows on the first story are cut in a shallow trefoil design reminiscent of Gothic design. The lintels of the second story windows are part of a terra cotta belt course that extends across the east elevation.

The rear or south elevation is more utilitarian in character but still utilizes the red sandstone and red brick of the other facades. Simple one-over-one sash are placed in response to interior room arrangement. A fire jump platform is located at the second story window at the east end of the elevation. A flat roofed, flared-bottom, shingled sleeping porch is located at the second story. It features pairs of windows with six-over-one sash. Photos taken at the time of the National Register nomination in 1985 show that this sleeping porch rested on a rectangular mudroom originally clad in asphalt siding that sheltered the rear first floor door. This mudroom had since been parged with stucco. The roofline is crowned with a German Renaissance Revival style gable that features scrolls, finials and copings of terra cotta. Tucked in to the roof east of this shaped gable is a small slate shingled dormer that matches those of the east elevation.

The west elevation is the most utilitarian in character and is in close proximity to the house next door addressed at 3217 W. Wells Street and built in 1906 as an investment property by Schuster. This elevation consists of the carriage porch and its flat roofed second story addition. The carriage porch continues the cladding treatment of the rest of the house. It features tourelles that frame the arched garage door openings. The tourelles terminate just above the terra cotta beltline. A one-over-one sash window is located to the left or east of the garage opening and a pair of windows is now positioned directly above the opening. The second story has a plain window located above the eastern one on the first story and there are French doors above the paired windows over the arched opening. In 1985 there were paired windows here matching those of the first floor. The current owners began the construction of an oriel where the French doors are located. The brick veneer has been removed from much of the front and the framing for the oriel is in place. There is one window opening on each level on the west wall of the carriage porch. Above the carriage porch is the third shaped gable that matches the one on the rear facade.

The carriage barn, located behind the dwelling, is also included in this designation. It is positioned at the southwest corner of the lot to make it easily accessible to the carriage porch. The carriage barn, like the primary dwelling, exhibits complexity. It is T-plan in configuration with the two-story north-south wing featuring a gambrel roof. The leg of the T, running eastwest, has a hip roof. There are two windows in the upper story of the gambrel section as well as a chimney at the roof crest. The hipped roof section features a dormer with gambrel roof and a pair of hayloft doors on its north elevation. At the east elevation is a shed roof dormer. Sidewall shingles show that sawtooth shingling alternated with plain shingles every three or so courses. Three pairs of swing out wood garage doors can be found at the hip roof wing and were probably added when the main house was converted into apartments. These doors are now accessed by a driveway that leads from 32<sup>nd</sup> Street. Three pairs of carriage style doors are likewise located at the first story of the gambrel roofed wing and face north where they were accessed through the carriage porch.

Alterations to the house have occurred primarily as a result of decades of deferred maintenance and as a result of the building's conversion into apartments. Many of the leaded glass windows have been removed over time. Problems with roof, gutter systems and flashing have led to water infiltration, defective terra cotta caps, and erosion of masonry joints. The biggest change to the building occurred when the mansion was converted into six apartments in 1924, although not much was done to the exterior. The slate shingles on the house's hip roof-with-flat-deck have been replaced with asphalt shingles. A number of the decorative scrolls and the rampant lions are now missing from the front shaped gable. The gable was dismantled and rebuilt in recent years due to destabilization. There is evidence from a blocked in door and a change in the foundation stone on the east elevation that there was once a porch or terrace on the east elevation. The rear mudroom enclosure, once clad in asphalt siding, has been parged over since 1985. The rear second story sleeping porch was added, probably in the 1920s. Alterations are very apparent in the carriage porch. In a study conducted by Isthmus Architects, they determined that the framing of the house occurred before the carriage porch framing was

added, almost as if it were an afterthought during the construction process. (Isthmus Architects, Schuster Mansion Feasibility Study, Milwaukee, WI, June 2002, p. 14) Design details as well as structural analysis indicate that the second story was added to the carriage porch, probably at the time of the 1924 conversion. The brick veneer does not match that on the rest of the house. A bathroom is located on each level of the carriage porch today. It was probably this same time that the garage doors were added to the north and south openings when use of the carriage porch was discontinued. The carriage barn roof has been replaced since 1985 and the brick sidewalls covered over with vinyl siding. The chimney at the carriage barn has been replaced with new brick. These latter two changes have occurred since 1985.

NOTE: The current owners of the house nominated the building because they are in the process of selling the house and want protections placed on it. They do not want to see their restoration efforts undone by a future owner.

## VII. SIGNIFICANCE

The George J. Schuster House is significant as one of the earliest and most flamboyant of the German Renaissance Revival style houses designed by the architectural firm of Crane and Barkhausen. The Schandein Mansion, built in the 1880s, and the Pabst Mansion, under construction between 1890 and 1892, made the style respectable in Milwaukee. Local German-Americans were drawn not only to the style's castle-like appearance and its associations of grandeur but also to a sense of heritage and accomplishment since Germany had become a powerful united political entity which led the world in enlightened scientific, literary and cultural achievements. Architects Crane and Barkhausen were the chief proponents of the style among local German-Americans and designed not only houses but such buildings as the German-English Academy at 1020 N. Broadway (1890) and the First German Methodist Church at 2024 W. Highland Avenue (1896) which display forms and details from work by contemporary German architects. Although many of Milwaukee's architectural firms at least dabbled in the German Renaissance Revival, Crane and Barkhausen were in the forefront of the movement and created the distinctive look that gave Milwaukee its Old World Character. Their Schuster House, the only known example to utilize a red color palette, has remained a visual landmark on Wells Street and the west side since its completion. In recognition of its architectural importance, the George J. Schuster House was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on January 16, 1986.

### VIII. HISTORY

George J. Schuster was born on January 14, 1850 at Spring Hill in Adams County, Ohio the son of German immigrant John J. Schuster and Magdalena Bruner Schuster. The senior Schuster's came to America in 1835 and by the early 1880s were living in Missouri. George Schuster came to Milwaukee in 1872 at the age of 22 and soon formed a partnership with Roberts C. Fitts and Luther Macneill as Schuster, Fitts & Macneill, agents for the Florence Sewing Machine Company. Their offices were at today's 219 E. Wisconsin Avenue, the building immediately east of the Iron Block. Macneill dropped out of the business by 1877 and the offices had moved to the 600 block of Milwaukee Street. The following year, 1878, the two partners joined H. D. Morton & Co. (Henry D. Morton), a business dealing in seed and leaf tobacco, in the 700 block of today's North Water Street and apparently bought out Morton. They soon formed Schuster & Fitts, a wholesale leaf tobacco company, and had offices in the 400 block of today's N. Plankinton Avenue. The business then moved to today's 329 N. Water Street and remained there from 1880 through 1891. (Flower 1881 History of Milwaukee, p. 1483; Milwaukee City Directory)

Schuster himself moved a number of times in his early years, living at today's 1012 N. Jefferson Street (1874-1875), the 600 block of N. Milwaukee Street (1877), the 400 block of N. 8<sup>th</sup> Street (1878), 815 W. Clybourn Street (1879-1882) and 854 N. 24<sup>th</sup> Street (1883-1886), the 1100 block of N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street (1887) and 939 N. 24<sup>th</sup> Street (1888-1891). Schuster married Nora L. Devendorf of Delevan, Wisconsin in February 14, 1878. They had four children: Helena K. (born January, 1879),

Donna Norine (born January, 1883), George J, (born 1886) and Daniel D. (born March 1889). (U.S. Census 1900; Flower, 1881 History of Milwaukee, p. 1483)

Schuster's fortunes were apparently riding high in 1891. Having lived on the west side where the preponderance of middle class, upper middle class and wealthy Germans resided, it was natural for him to have chosen a west side location for his permanent home. Wisconsin Avenue was already populated with numerous mansions going back to the city's earliest years. Most were built or remodeled by prominent Yankees or settlers from the east such as John Plankinton. "Newcomers" like Emil Schandein and Captain Frederick Pabst were also beginning to establish a German presence on the avenue. Wells Street in comparison was relatively new and just coming into its own in the late 1880s. Sherburn S. Merrill, John Tesch, Samuel Green, Stephen Harrison and John Plankinton founded the West Side Railway Company in 1874. It built a double track trolley on Wells Street from downtown to N. 34<sup>th</sup> Street and was able to electrify its Wells Street line. The city's first electric trolley was put into use on the West Side Railway line on April 4, 1890. West Side Railway was soon purchased by Henry Payne in 1891 as Payne began major acquisitions to consolidate transportation lines under one ownership. By 1894 the Wells Street line was extended to Wauwatosa over the Wauwatosa Motor Company viaduct, which had been built across the Menomonee Valley in 1893. By the mid-1890s other lines had been added to the west side. With the area serviced by some of the best mass transit in the city, the west side was fully developed as a middle class residential area in a massive building boom that lasted from about 1890 until just before World War I. (West Side Neighborhood Historic Resources Survey. Transportation chapter, pp. 11-12)

Wells Street, west of 27<sup>th</sup> Street had begun attracting prominent and well-to-do businessmen and professionals by the mid-1880s. A few photos remain showing large frame Queen Anne style houses in the 2700 and 2800 blocks, now gone. Northwestern Mutual Life Insurance official, Garland L. Gillette built a frame Queen Anne style house at 2942 W. Wells Street (1882-1883) designed by James Douglas (razed 1994). Coal merchant David D. Howie built a distinctive Queen Anne style house at 3026 W. Wells Street in 1886, designed by Carl F. Ringer. (NR listed January 16, 1986) Lynn Boyd Benton built a towered Queen Anne at 3034 W. Wells Street in 1890. The house was better known for its second owner Carl F. Miller who lived here from 1903 to 1918. Furniture manufacturer Joseph Bub built an exuberant towered eclectic Queen Anne style house at 3330 W. Wells Street in 1890, designed by F. W. Andree. This house still stands but a hospital addition has been constructed over the façade and the tower is gone. (City of Milwaukee Permit Records; Milwaukee County Historical Society photograph collection) The society blue book for 1891-1892 shows nineteen prominent individuals who lived west of 27<sup>th</sup> Street. These included the families of: F.S. Atkins, A.H. Atkins, H. L. Atkins, Lynn Boyd Benton, Jacob N. Barr, E. H. Bottum, A. C. Bridges, Sydney H. Cole, Otto Von Ernst (Captain Pabst's son-in-law), Sam M. Green, David C. Green, Garland L. Gillette, Joseph C. Griffin, Robert Luscombe, T. Lynas, C. F. Reed, Arthur H. Stevens, James Tombs, and George H. Wright. (Milwaukee Elite Directory: Society and Club lists, 1891-1892)

Schuster chose to move into a prominent neighborhood and one whose development was primarily east of 32<sup>nd</sup> Street. On August 21, 1891 he purchased a 54-foot by 150-foot parcel from the Sherburn S. Merrill estate for \$2,700. About a month later he purchased a second 54-foot by 150-foot parcel for \$4,750. This gave Schuster the entire southwest corner of N. 32<sup>nd</sup> and W. Wells Streets and is addressed today as 3209 W. Wells Street. At some point in time he also acquired a 45-foot by 150-foot parcel to the west of the current property, addressed today as 3217 W. Wells Street. The Merrill's had acquired a large number of parcels on the west side from what was originally Dousman's Subdivision, platted in 1848. Unlike typical subdivision lots measuring 50 feet by 150 feet, for example, these lots were multi-acre parcels and buyers could purchase whatever size piece of land they wanted within that large parcel. Properties are described in metes and bounds and there are literally 200 entries for property transactions on Lot 7, the big parcel within which Schuster bought his land, so researching each transaction has not been possible. Deed restrictions imposed by the Merrill's prohibited the manufacture, sale, or dispensing of intoxicating

substances and established a 65 foot setback from the centerline of Wells Street. (Deeds 217:301, 217:304)

Permits were taken out to construct the mansion on September 30, 1891. Milwaukee architects Crane and Barkhausen designed the striking house. The builder was Ernst Winter and not much is known about him at this time. The cost was listed at \$23,000 and would not have included the interior finishes and furnishings. The house must have raised a few eyebrows in its day. There was nothing else like it on Wells Street that we know of. The bright red sandstone, bright red brick and red terra cotta are striking and the eclectic styling was definitely a concession to European castles with references to Romanesque, Gothic, Chateauesque, German Renaissance Revival and some Colonial Revival all on one building. In keeping with the larger and more fashionable houses being built at the time, the house had a front tower and prominent masonry porch. It bested its rivals, however, by adding another tower at the southeast corner and a bartizan at the northeast corner. No two facades were alike. There is a veritable riot of patterns and forms and shapes on the facade from fleur-de-lis to trefoils to rondels to pilasters to lions' heads. Rather than dissolve in a mass of chaos, however, the use of a single color palette, the wrapping of the first story in sandstone blocks, the use of brick on the second story and the carrying through of shaped gables on three of the four elevations helps to unify the design. Credit has to be given to the builders and craftsmen who worked on the house as well. The complicated angles and transitions and layering of details took exceptional skill.

Schuster, or perhaps his architects, wanted to celebrate his German heritage. Many other Milwaukee German-Americans were beginning to do so, beginning with Emil Schandein and his "castle" on Wisconsin Avenue in the 1880s. This reflected the nationalism being expressed in Germany at the same time where the newly rich were building mansions based on historic Renaissance palaces or medieval castles that they thought best reflected Germanic heritage before the corruption of Classical Revival styles. One can contrast Schuster's house to the Pabst Mansion then under construction at 2000 W. Wisconsin Avenue. The Pabst mansion features shaped gables as well but all the rich terra cotta ornament is restrained, the color palette is a sedate tan and the facade is symmetrical. Pabst's architects, Ferry and Clas, were most likely influenced by their strong background in Classical Revival and Beaux Arts designs. The Schuster house is one of Crane and Barkhausen's earliest forays into the German Renaissance Revival, the predominant style of the house. We do not know of any later commission so complex and elaborate even though the architects repeated the general formula of the massing on a number of houses.

George J. Schuster was to experience some setbacks soon after his house was completed. His business located to 339-341 N. Water Street in 1892 and it is not clear if it escaped the Third Ward Fire the night of October 28<sup>th</sup> that fall. If his building escaped destruction, the contents may have suffered from smoke and water damage. City directories show the business continuing at this address through 1896. In 1896 Schuster's wife Nora sued him for divorce on the grounds of mental and emotional cruelty and indicated he had a vile temper. She was granted custody of the two daughters, Helena (17) and Donna (13). George had to pay child support, schooling and expenses until Helena was 21 and Donna turned 18. The daughters were placed in Kemper Hall in Kenosha for their education. Sons George J. (10) and Daniel (7) stayed with their father. Nora received \$12,000 in the settlement. Helena was interested in vocal music and there was discussion of sending her to Oak Park, Illinois where her vocal instructor moved to set up classes. Helena apparently also had health problems and later spent some time in Denver, Colorado. The daughters eventually resided back at the Wells Street home by 1900 per Census records. In 1897 Schuster's business moved to 232 N. Broadway and would remain at this location through 1907. The business occupied a 5-story building with basement and had 6 to 7 traveling salesmen and 150 employees. In 1898 George's brother moved into the red castle with the family. City directories alternately list this brother as Edward and John E. while the 1900 U.S. Census lists him as Edward J. Schuster. He was born in 1867 in Missouri. Brother John E., as he is mostly referred to in the directories, worked as a cashier and bookkeeper for George's company. He later joined the company as a partner in 1904 when the business was renamed Shuster Brothers. John E. Schuster moved out of the house in 1902 and thereafter lived at a variety of addresses.

The Schuster's' divorce records give us a glimpse into the private life of the family. There had originally been an agreement that both parents were at liberty to visit the children on Saturdays between 2PM and 6PM. In August 1897, Nora filed a complaint that she no longer wanted to visit the boys at the Wells Street house because their father had insulted her in front of the servants. She wanted the boys to come visit her. An 1898 addendum to the divorce records indicates that Nora filed for an increase in the daughters' allowances from \$91.66 to \$200 per month since they needed proper clothing and money to supply textbooks and pay for music and drawing classes. A 1910 addendum to the divorce records indicates that George J. Schuster also had a business in Denver, Colorado called Silver State Leaf Tobacco and that in 1899 there were profits between \$8,000 and \$9,000 and that the profits doubled in 1900. This same addendum indicated that the Wells Street house was valued at \$28,000, the lot was valued at \$10,000 and that George's assets totaled \$278,000. Schuster's net worth, minus \$62,000 in liabilities, totaled \$216,000. The addendum was initiated by ex-wife Nora to increase Donna's monthly allowance form \$75 per month to \$110 per month. (Divorce between Nora Schuster and George J. Schuster, Circuit Court Document 16351, filed December 23, 1896)

George Schuster later remarried, his new wife being Mary A. Bloodgood. They were married on May 28, 1901. (Index of Marriage Records, microfiche located at Milwaukee Central Library, Milwaukee Vol.33,p. 9999 Milwaukee County Vol. I seq 01313) Mary had been born in New Jersey around 1871. George and Mary were to have two children, Louise and John B. Perhaps to supplement his business income and provide for a growing family, Schuster built a 3-flat investment property next door to the west at 3217 W. Wells in 1906. He had Charles Crane design the new building. Crane was now in independent practice since Carl Barkhausen had left Milwaukee a few years earlier. Crane designed the new building is a sedate Colonial revival style, typical of his work after the partnership had dissolved.

Schuster Brothers moved to 340 N. Milwaukee Street in 1908 and remained there through 1912. From 1913 through 1929 the business was located at 410 N. Broadway then last at 206 N. Broadway from 1930 through 1932. George Schuster might have gone into semi-retirement in 1915 when he was 65 years old as city directories show him living at Mukwonago. Curent owner Arne Vedum indicates that the Schuster's Mukwonago house is now known as Heaven City restaurant. Schuster returned full time to his home on Wells Street in 1920 and died on September 15, 1922 while being treated for pernicious anemia at Columbia Hospital. He was 82 years and 8 months old. His brother John carried on the leaf tobacco business and took Frank Hornung as his vice-president and R. T. Jenkinson as his secretary-treasurer in 1924. T. M. Kearney replaced Hornung in 1925 and Anthony F. Theim replaced Kearney in 1929. John E. Schuster died on December 24, 1932 at the age of 65. The business ended with him and the other officers are shown without occupations the following year. (Milwaukee City Directories)

George Schuster's widow Mary drops out of the Milwaukee city directories following her husband's death. The 1930 Federal Census, however, lists her as living with her son John B. and his wife Thelma at a location on E. Juneau Avenue. Interestingly, none of the Schuster children appeared to have been interested in the family business. Son George J., referenced in the divorce settlement, does not appear in the 1900 or 1910 Census and apparently died in childhood. Son Daniel D. Schuster worked briefly at the company (1913-1914, 1916) but worked mostly as an insurance agent with Penn Mutual Life, and later served as secretary-treasurer then president of the Hopper Custom Shirt Company, and president of Schuster Custom Shirt Company (1927-1931). He eventually returned to insurance sales and lived with his wife Sarah in Wauwatosa. Son John B. Schuster drops out of the city directories after 1922. Helena married Charles L. Tuttle and lived in Ontario California and not much is known about her except that she had a son George S. and a daughter Leonora S. She died in Los Angeles on December 21, 1950. (Estate of Schuster 1955 http://online.ceb.com/CalCases/CA2/137CA2d125.html; California Death Index 1940-1997) Louise married a Mr. Greer and not much is known about her. Donna Norine Schuster studied at the Art Institute of Chicago under Tarbell and Benson and studied under William M. Chase during a painting tour of Belgium in 1912 and a summer class in Carmel, California. She moved permanently to California around that time. She built a home overlooking Griffith Park in the Los

Angeles hills in 1923 and became a celebrated painter. She was a member of various arts groups and won numerous awards. She died sometime after 1929 and before 1955 in a fire that destroyed her house. (www.redferngallery.com/bioDonnaSchuster.html; Estate of Schuster 1955)

The wonderfully exuberant house on Wells Street became obsolete as a single-family residence after George Schuster died. City directories show the house vacant in 1923. By February 14, 1924 the house had been sold and the new owner, Jean B. Olinger, took out a permit to convert the mansion into a six-unit apartment building. He and his wife Jennie lived on the premises and the directories show him associated with the American Theater then the American Hat and Shirt Company and the Olinger Department Store and even a realty company. The former mansion was re-christened as the Redstone Apartments. Tenants included many single women (who appeared to be widows) as well as men and occupations included professionals, nurses, dentists, salesmen and office workers. Later owners, based on permit records, include L. T. Zimmermann, Edwin Larson, CGT Corporation, Verdelle Leistikow/Hillpointer, Randall Crocker, Michael Elconis, Jack Powell, and Roy Nelson. The current owners Arne and Eunice Vedum have had the property since 2002.

As a result of an intensive survey conducted on Milwaukee's West Side in 1983-1984, sponsored by the Wisconsin Historical Society, a number of National Register eligible properties were identified and National Register nominations prepared. The George Schuster house was one of those properties. It was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on January 16, 1986.

## THE ARCHITECTS

#### Crane & Barkhausen

Charles D. Crane and Carl Barkhausen established a prominent architectural firm that helped to change the face of Milwaukee architecture in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. Charles D. Crane (1850-1928) was born on July 6, 1850 at Johnson's Creek in Niagara County, New York, the son of Moses L. Crane and Susan P. (Chase) Crane. His father Moses was the descendent of a long line of New England Putnams and Cranes who traced their arrival in America back to the 1600s. The Cranes relocated from New York to Spring Prairie, Wisconsin in 1853 then moved to Burlington, Wisconsin in 1863 where the senior Crane worked as a salesman. Young Charles was educated in the public primary and secondary school there then worked as a clerk. In 1871 Charles Crane found employment in Chicago then moved to Milwaukee on December 26, 1874 where he began work as a draftsman with the prominent Milwaukee architect Edward Townsend Mix. It was in the office of E.T. Mix that he met his future partner Carl Barkhausen. (Watrous, Memoirs of Milwaukee County, Vol. 2, pp. 316-317) The two formed a partnership in 1888 when E.T. Mix went to the Twin Cities to supervise the construction of a major, million-dollar project there.

Carl C. Barkhausen was born in Thiens ville, Ozaukee County, Wisconsin on November 6, 1860. His parents, August (1818-1900) and Mary (Huecker) Barkhausen, were natives of Cassel, Germany who had come to this country in 1848, settling on a farm in the vicinity of Thiens ville. The farm later became the site of Boders on the River restaurant. Carl was one of seven children. He was educated in the local public school then came to Milwaukee to study at the prestigious German-English Academy, known today as the University School. In 1876 at the age of 16, Barkhausen went to Germany to attend a technical school located in what was then known as the "Castle of the Kings." He later returned to Germany in 1881 at the age of 21 and took a finishing course in architecture in Berlin. When Barkhausen returned to Milwaukee in 1883 he secured a job with the firm of E. T. Mix & Company and met his future partner Charles Crane who was ten years his senior. The two, as mentioned above, went into partnership in 1888. (Gregory, History of Milwaukee, Wisconsin, Vol. IV, pp. 579-580)

The two men would have had an unsurpassed training in the Mix office. The firm handled most of the technically complicated projects in Milwaukee in the 1870s and 1880s. This background, no doubt, enabled Crane and Barkhausen to secure many commercial projects. These included

numerous industrial buildings in the city's Historic Third Ward as well as Milwaukee's earliest apartment building, the Martin, on East Wisconsin Avenue in 1889 for the J. B. Martin Estate. In addition to these commercial projects, however, the two men developed quite a clientele among the wealthy German-Americans of Milwaukee. Barkhausen's European architectural training and knowledge of contemporary German architecture served him well in this community and soon their firm came to specialize in designing unique one-of-a-kind mansions in a German Renaissance style which was popular with the affluent German-Americans of Milwaukee. Among the most notable Crane and Barkhausen residential projects are:

| (1891) The Fred Kraus House (razed)            | 1617 N. Prospect Avenue       |
|--|-------------------------------|
| (1891) The George J. Schuster House            | 3209 W. Wells Street          |
| (1892) The Ferdinand Schlesinger House (razed) | 1444 N. Prospect Avenue       |
| (1895) The Herman Luedke House (razed)         | 965 N.11 <sup>th</sup> Street |
| (1899) The John F. Kern House                  | 2569 N. Wahl Avenue           |
| (1897) The Joseph Breslauer Doublehouse        | 1425 W. Kilbourn Avenue       |
| (1897) The Conrad Trimborn Rowhouse            | 1422-32 W. Kilbourn Avenue    |
| (1899) The Abram Esbenshade house              | 3119 W. Wells Street          |

## Other projects included

(1890) The German-English Academy Building
(1896) The First German Methodist Church
(1892) The Button Block
1020 N. Broadway
2024 W. Highland Avenue
500 N. Water Street

The First German Methodist Church was patterned after a church in Germany. The partners also designed buildings in the prevailing styles of the day including Romanesque Revival, Queen Anne and Colonial Revival. The Historic Preservation staff was able to identify some 24 projects designed by the partners just on the West Side of Milwaukee. They maintained offices at 219-221 E. Wisconsin Avenue, the former 3-story, now 2-story building directly east of the Iron Block. In the publication, Milwaukee-A Half Century's Progress, published eight years into their partnership, their accomplishments were described as "brilliant and complete" and some 26 projects are cited both local and out of town. (Milwaukee-A Half Century's Progress, p. 177)

Crane and Barkhausen dissolved their partnership in 1900. Crane maintained the same office and briefly took Peter Brust as a partner in 1901. Barkhausen moved next door into the Iron Block and designed several more residences in the German Revival style including the Fred Weinhagen House at 2543 N. Wahl Avenue (1901), the William A. Starke House at 2929 W. Highland Boulevard (1901) and the Dr. James A. Bach House at 2623 N. Wahl Avenue (1903). A resumption of the Crane and Barkhausen practice appears in the 1903 city directory and probably represents some amicable arrangement whereby Crane oversaw the completion of Barkhausen's Milwaukee projects then under construction. Barkhausen then left Milwaukee in 1904 to work for the George A. Fullerton Construction Company in New York City, known for its work on large skyscrapers. Fullerton also employed former Milwaukee architect Otto Strack at the same time. (Milwaukee City Directory; Gregory)

Barkhausen returned to Milwaukee in 1912 and remained here for the rest of his career. After a brief resumption of his partnership with Crane in 1912, probably to facilitate establishing a client base once again, Barkhausen set up an office for himself at 329 E. Wisconsin Avenue (1913-1915) then 205 E. Wisconsin, the Iron Block (1916-1929) and lastly at 312 W. State Street (1930-1934). Barkhausen is known to have had one partner during the latter years of his career, Hugo Logemann, who worked with him in 1924 and 1925. During these years, Barkhausen primarily worked in period revival styles and designed houses for S. A. Meyer at 3004 N. Hackett Avenue (1914), Fred Oestereich at 2825 E. Newport (1916) as well as a large Tudor house for the Investment Company at 3417 N. Lake Drive (1921). In 1913, Barkhausen received the commission to design the Second Church of Christ, Scientist, at 2733 W. Highland Boulevard, more than likely as a result of his period revival work and the fact that he was himself a Christian

Scientist. Second Church much resembles Madison Square Presbyterian Church in New York City, designed by McKim, Mead & White and completed in 1906. Barkhausen was probably familiar with the work during his stay in that city. Barkhausen also designed the Annunciation Greek Orthodox Church at 1300 N. Broadway (1914, razed 1962) a Byzantine style structure. (Milwaukee City Directories)

Barkhausen was an active member of many fraternal associations including Wisconsin Lodge No. 13 F. & A. M.; Milwaukee Chapter R.A.M.; Henry L. Palmer Commandery, No. 14, K. T.; Wisconsin Consistory, A.A.S.R.; and the Tripoli Temple, A.A.O.N.M.S. Gregory's History of Milwaukee, Wisconsin stated "He is a man of high professional ideals, of sterling personal worth and kindly and courteous manner, and is deservedly held in high esteem by those who know him." On December 12, 1939 Barkhausen died of heart failure at his home, 215 W. Wright Street where he had been living since 1921. He was 74 years old and was survived by his wife Minnie Hinkel Barkhausen, his daughter Margaret, and his son Paul. Barkhausen's remains were cremated and interred at Valhalla Cemetery. (Gregory, p.580; Carl Barkhausen Death Certificate, No. 4798)

Charles D. Crane maintained the old offices at 219-221 E. Wisconsin Avenue for a number of years after dissolving his partnership with Barkhausen. He then moved to the University Building (razed) on Mason Street in 1908. Around 1914 Crane moved to W. Wisconsin Avenue and then his offices are not shown. He briefly partnered with Peter Brust in 1901 and then took his son Stanley P. Crane into the office in 1912. Crane continued designing large warehouse buildings. American Candy Company Building 193 N. Broadway (1902), A. George Schulz Company Building 133 W. Oregon (1904) and the Cohen Brothers Building at 233 E. Chicago (1910), as well as residences in period revival styles. One of his prominent commissions was the first building for Marquette University at 1131 W. Wisconsin Avenue (1906) designed in the Gothic Revival Style. When looking at Crane's work following the dissolution of his partnership with Barkhausen, it is clear that he never revisited the German Renaissance Style. We have to conclude that most of those commissions had been the work of Carl Barkhausen. City Directories show Crane as an appraiser with Fidelity Appraisal between 1920-1923. Crane was said to be "domestic in his tastes, being fond of his family and of his books." He was a member of several organizations, however, including the Merchants' and Manufacturers' club, the Sons of the American Revolution, and the Royal Arcanum. Charles Crane lived at some eighteen different residences or apartments during his career. He last lived at the Maryland Hotel and died at Milwaukee Hospital on April 8, 1928. He was buried at Forest Home Cemetery. (Charles D. Crane Death Certificate No. 1760: Milwaukee City Directory: Watrous p. 17)

The George J. Schuster House is one of the firm's earliest surviving commissions to explore the German Renaissance Revival and shows them to have been inventive and even daring in their handling of terra cotta and sandstone. This may have been one of their earliest explorations of the use of red sandstone and none of their later commissions had quite the same use of layered textures, shapes and forms and none, as far as we know, ever made use of the same bright red color palette. More typical of their later work is the Abram Esbenshade House just a block away and built eight years later. While some of the firm's signature massing formula remains the same, the sedate tan coloration is far more subdued that the Schuster House.

## **SOURCES**

Gregory, John G. <u>History of Milwaukee, Wisconsin</u>. Milwaukee: S. J. Clarke Publishing Company, 1931.

Barkhausen, Carl. Death Certificate No. 4798. City of Milwaukee Vital Statistics.

California Death Index 1940-1997

Crane, Charles D. Death Certificate No. 1760. City of Milwaukee Vital Statistics.

[Flower, Frank A.]. <u>History of Milwaukee, Wisconsin</u>. Chicago: The Western Historical Company, 1881.

Gregory, John B. History of Milwaukee, Wisconsin. Milwaukee: S. J. Clarke Publishing Co., 1931.

Isthmus Architects. Schuster Mansion Feasibility Study, Milwaukee, WI. June 2002.

Marriage Record Index.

Milwaukee-A Half-Century's Progress 1846-1896. Milwaukee: Consolidated Illustrating Company, 1896.

Milwaukee City Building Permits, 3209 W. Wells Street.

Milwaukee City Directories.

Milwaukee County Historical Society.

Milwaukee County Register of Deeds.

Milwaukee Elite Directory: Society and Club Lists, 1891-1892. Milwaukee, Wisconsin: G. H. Yenowine, [1890].

## Milwaukee Sentinel

Schuster, Donna Norine. Biographical Information. www.redferngallery.com/bioDonnaSchuster.html.

Schuster, Donna Norine. <u>Estate of Schuster</u> 1955.http://www.online.ceb.com/CalCases/CA2/137Ca2d125.html.

Schuster, George J. Death Certificate Vol. 279, p. 3616. City of Milwaukee Vital Statistics.

Schuster, Nora v. Schuster, George J. Divorce Settlement. Circuit Court Case Number 16351, December 23, 1896.

United States Census, 1900 and 1910. George J. Schuster.

Vollmert. Les; Wenger, Robin; and Hatala, Carlen. West Side Neighborhood Historic Resources Survey. City of Milwaukee: Department of City Development, 1984.

Watrous, Jerome A., ed. <u>Memoirs of Milwaukee County</u>. Madison: Western Historical Association, 1909.

Zimmerman, H. Russell. "Wells Street's Red 'Castle." Milwaukee Journal. March 16, 1969.

### IX. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the George J. Schuster House at 3209 W. Wells Street be given historic designation as a City of Milwaukee Historic Structure as a result of its fulfillment of criteria e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 308-81(2)(e) of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances.

e-5. Its embodiment of the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or specimen.

Rationale: The George J. Schuster House is a significant surviving example of the German Renaissance Revival style in Milwaukee. Although it has elements from a variety of historic periods, the combination of towers, bartizan and shaped gables and the monochromatic color palette all can be pulled together under the heading of Germanic. Buildings with such elements were almost exclusively commissioned by German-American residents and designed by local architectural firms who had designers that were trained or had some training in Germany. Historic photographs show that there were literally hundreds of such ethnically inspired buildings, commercial, residential and religious, throughout the city. Changes in taste, disinvestment and demolition have reduced examples to a mere handful. The style is represented by such other examples in Milwaukee as the Pabst Mansion and the Henry Harnischfeger House, but with the loss of such other examples like the David Benjamin House at 1570 N. Prospect Avenue (1891) and the Val Blatz Jr. House at 1700 N. Prospect Avenue (1903) both with boldly rusticated stone exteriors and crenellated towers, the Schuster House survives as Milwaukee's premier 19<sup>th</sup> century "castle."

e-6. Its identification as the work of an artist, architect, craftsperson or master builder whose individual works have influenced the development of the City of Milwaukee, State of Wisconsin, or of the United States.

Rationale: Crane and Barkhausen were considered one of the most fashionable of design firms in Milwaukee in the 1890s. In contrast to Ferry and Clas for example, who were known for Classical Revival and Beaux Arts designs, Crane and Barkhausen delved into the newer, then edgier, more trendy styles like the commercial Romanesque Revival style and the German Renaissance Revival style. Their experience in the office of E. T. Mix & Company imparted them with the expertise to design everything from large warehouse buildings in the Third Ward to churches, commercial buildings and also residences. Primarily through the talents of Carl Barkhausen, who had design training in Germany, the partners cultivated a clientele of wealthy German American businessmen who wanted to express their ethnicity through residences that looked as though they were imported from Germany. Crane and Barkhausen were in the forefront of this movement and their commissions created the distinctive look that gave Milwaukee its Old World character.

e-9. Its unique location as a singular physical characteristic, which represents an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community or the city of Milwaukee.

Rationale: The Schuster House has been a standout in its neighborhood since it was built. Its prominent corner site, flamboyant roofline and bright red color have made it a landmark on the west side since its completion in 1892.

## X. PRESERVATION GUIDELINES

The following preservation guidelines represent the principal concerns of the Historic Preservation Commission regarding this historic designation. However, the Commission reserves the right to make final decisions based upon particular design submissions. Nothing in these guidelines shall be construed to prevent ordinary maintenance or the restoration and/or replacement of documented original elements. Note: this designation also includes the carriage barn at the rear of the property. It is an important part of the property and must be retained.

## A. Roofs

Retain the roof shape. Skylights are discouraged but may be added to roof surfaces if they are not visible from the street or public right of way. No major changes can be made to the roof shape, which would alter the building height, roofline or pitch. Retain existing slate shingles on tower roofs and dormers. The main roof can be finished with asphalt or slate shingles. Locate mechanical systems and vents on portions of the roof not visible from the public right of way and paint them out to minimize impact. Retain existing original chimneys in their full height as they are an important design element of the house. They may not be removed. The hip roof dormers may not be removed. No rooftop construction is allowed, as this would interfere with the viewing of the towers and chimneys and shaped gables that are meant to be silhouetted against the skyline.

#### B. Materials

## Masonry

- a. Unpainted brick, terra cotta, or stone should not be painted or covered. Avoid painting or covering natural terra cotta or stone. This is historically incorrect and could cause irreversible damage if it was decided to remove the paint at a later date. Covering masonry with other materials (wood, sheet metal, etc.) is not allowed.
- b. Repoint defective mortar by duplicating the original in color, style, texture and strength. See the masonry chapters in the books, <u>As Good As New</u> or <u>Good For Business</u> for explanations on why the use of a proper mortar mix is crucial to making lasting repairs that will not contribute to new deterioration of the masonry. Replaced mortar joints should be tooled to match the style of the original. Avoid using mortar colors and pointing styles that were unavailable or were not used when the building was constructed. Consultation with historic preservation staff is required before starting any repointing.
- c. Clean masonry only when necessary to halt deterioration and with the gentlest method possible. Sandblasting or high pressure water blasting or the use of other abrasive materials (soda, nut shells, etc.) on limestone, terra cotta, or cream brick surfaces is prohibited. This method of cleaning erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Avoid the indiscriminate use of chemical products that could have an adverse reaction with the masonry materials, such as the use of acid on limestone. Work should be done by experienced individuals. Consultation with historic preservation staff is required before any cleaning would begin.

d. Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Avoid using new material that is inappropriate or was unavailable when the building was constructed. Removal of the vinyl siding from the brick walls of the carriage house is encouraged. The brick walls may then be repaired.

#### Wood/Metal

- a. Retain original material, whenever possible. Avoid removing architectural features that are essential to maintaining the building's character and appearance such as the sheet metal finials at the tower roofs.
- b. Retain or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Avoid covering architectural features with new materials that do not duplicate the appearance of the original materials. Covering wood or metal with aluminum or vinyl is not permitted. Any replacement of the shingling on the house or carriage house must replicate the pattern, dimension, and spacing of the original.

# C. Windows and Doors

- 1. Retain existing window and door openings. Retain the existing configuration of panes, sash, surrounds and sills, except as necessary to restore to the original condition. Avoid making additional openings or changes in existing fenestration by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door sizes. Avoid changing the size or configuration of windowpanes or sash. Use storm windows or protective glazing which have glazing configurations similar to the prime windows and which obscure the prime windows as little as possible.
- 2. Respect the building's stylistic period. If the replacement of doors or window sash is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design and material of the original window sash or door. Avoid using inappropriate sash and door replacements. Avoid the filling-in or covering of openings with inappropriate materials such as glass block or concrete block. Avoid using modern style window units, such as horizontal sliding sash or casements, in place of double-hung sash or the substitution of units with glazing configurations not appropriate to the style of the building. Any original windows should be retained and repaired if at all possible. Vinyl or metal clad prime window units are not permitted. Glass block basement windows are not permitted on elevations visible from the public right of way. Retain all existing art glass windows.
- 3. Steel bar security doors and window guards are generally not allowed. If permitted, the doors or grates shall be of the simplest design and installed so as to be as unobtrusive as possible.

## D. Trim and Ornamentation

There should be no changes to the existing historic trim or ornamentation except as necessary to restore the building to its original condition. Replacement features shall match the original member in scale, design, color and appearance. Existing historic trim in terra cotta and stone, used extensively throughout the house, shall not be removed unless it is for the purpose of repair. The shaped gables, towers and bartizan, as well as the porch, may not be removed, as they are important design features of the building.

### E. Additions

No additions will be permitted on the north (front) elevation or the east (32<sup>nd</sup> Street) elevation, as this would destroy the character defining features of the building. Any other addition requires the approval of the Commission. Ideally an addition should either compliment or have a neutral effect upon the historic character of the building. Approval shall be based upon the addition's design compatibility with the building in terms of window size and placement, building height, roof configuration, scale, design, color, and materials, and the degree to which it visually intrudes upon the principal elevations or is visible from the public right of way. Additions must be smaller than the building and not obscure the historic building. The 1924 second story addition to the carriage porch may be removed and the carriage porch restored or else the second story can be rebuilt in a manner commensurate with the materials, style and character of the historic house. The existing projecting bay now under construction must be removed.

# F. Signs/Exterior Lighting

The installation of any permanent exterior sign or light fixture shall require the approval of the Commission. Approval will be based on the compatibility of the proposed sign or light with the historic and architectural character of the building. Plastic internally illuminated box signs are not permitted.

## G. Site Features

New plant materials, paving, fencing, or accessory structures shall be compatible with the historic architectural character of the building if visible from the public right of way. Since the house and carriage house occupy most of the west half of the property, any landscape/parking treatment along the 32<sup>nd</sup> Street frontage will be reviewed. No front yard fencing will be allowed. Exceptions can be made for period appropriate iron fences no more than 30 inches in height. The driveway at the west edge of the property once lead to the carriage porch. If the carriage porch is not restored to original use then the driveway can/should be removed and appropriately landscaped. Parking is limited to the area behind the house only and must be paved and not exceed 1000 square feet in area (subject to the zoning code).

# H. Guidelines for New Construction

It is important that new construction be designed to be as sympathetic as possible with the character of the structure. No principal dwelling or structure or parking structure shall be constructed on the side yard along the 32<sup>nd</sup> Street frontage. This parcel was a part of the original property acquired for the construction of the house. The east elevation of the house, with its large bay and solarium and tower, was given a higher level of architectural treatment with the intent of being viewed from across the side yard. Small-scale accessory structures, like a gazebo or fountain, may be permitted depending on their size, scale and form and the property's ability to accommodate such a structure.

## 1. Siting

New construction must respect the historic siting of the building. It should be accomplished so as to maintain the appearance of the building from the street as a freestanding structure.

### 2. Scale

Overall building height and bulk, the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof, and individual building components, such as overhangs and fenestration that are in close proximity to a historic building must be compatible to and sympathetic with the design of the building. New construction is to be smaller in size and shorter in height than the historic building.

#### 3. Form

The massing of the new construction must be compatible with the goal of maintaining the integrity of the building as a freestanding structure. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and receded from the main block should express the same continuity established by the historic building if they are in close proximity to it.

#### Materials

The building materials which are visible from the public right-of-way and in close proximity to the historic building should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials used on the historic building. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained and materials not available when the house was constructed should be avoided.

### I. Guidelines for Demolition

Although demolition is not encouraged and is generally not permissible, there may be instances when demolition may be acceptable if approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. The following guidelines, with those found in subsection 9(h) of the ordinance, shall be taken into consideration by the Commission when reviewing demolition requests. The carriage house is considered contributing to the historic character of this property. Historic tax credits are available for its restoration or repair.

## 1. Condition

Demolition requests may be granted when it can be clearly demonstrated that the condition of a building or a portion thereof is such that it constitutes an immediate threat to health and safety and is beyond hope of repair.

## 2. Importance

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is of historical or architectural significance or displays a quality of material and craftsmanship that does not exist in other structures in the area.

# 3. Location

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building contributes to the neighborhood and the general street appearance and has a positive effect on other buildings in the area.

## 4. Potential for Restoration

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is beyond economically feasible repair.

## 5. Additions

Consideration will be given to whether or not the proposed demolition is a later addition that is not in keeping with the original design of the structure or does not contribute to its character. The carriage porch on the west elevation is an essential part of the house. The 1924 second story addition may be removed or rebuilt in a manner commensurate with the materials, character and style of the historic house. The projecting bay now under construction must be removed. The second floor rear-sleeping porch is a later addition that is constructed of different material from the rest of the house. It may be removed.

