

REPORT

LEGISLATIVE REFERENCE BUREAU

WWW.MILWAUKEE.GOV/LRB

26. DPW— Parking Fund, 2014

Proposed Plan and Executive Budget Review

26. DPW—Parking Fund

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.

Table 26.1. Statement of Changes in Operating Budget, 2013 to 2014.

<u>- I</u>	
2011 Actual Spending	\$50,007,378
2012 Actual Spending	\$48,722,995
2013 Adopted Budget *	\$46,951,107
2014 Changes	
Salaries & Fringes	
Tow-Lot	(\$22,840)
Enforcement	(\$79,267)
Administration	\$10,975
TL Salaries & Fringes	(\$91,132)
Operating Expenses	\$306,300
Equipment Purchases	\$49,200
Total Operating Exp.	\$264,368
Debt Service	\$50,000
PILOT Payment	\$19,000
Pension Contribution	(\$88,000)
TL Special Funds	(\$19,000)
TL Oper. Budget Change	\$245,368
Towns to Ossess I Freed	/ * /
Trans to General Fund	(\$1,300,000)
Pension Reserve Fund	\$0
Capital Improvements	\$274,000
TL 2014 Changes	(\$700,000)
TL 2014 Changes	(\$780,632)
2014 Proposed Budget *	\$46,170,475
	ψ+υ, 17υ,473

^{*} Net of \$5 million Contingent Borrowing Authority.

1. \$175,000, BMO-Harris Bradley Center. A \$175,000 fee for the Bradley Center either to make good on a promise by the Mayor, or to coordinate Center events so parking

revenues are increased at the City's 4th & Highland parking structure is included in Parking's 2014 Budget.

- 2. "Virtual" night parking permit replaces physical sticker. Parking checkers in 2014 will use recognition technology to "read" the license plates of parkers to determine if night parking fees have been paid and physical stickers will no longer be issued.
- 3. <u>License plate recognition technology installed.</u> New license plate recognition system allows parking checkers to confirm night parking permits, identify stolen vehicles and check on outstanding violations automatically while patrolling the street.
- 4. <u>Cash reserve drawdown continues.</u> The Parking Fund continues to transfer more monies to the City's General Fund than it "earns", effectively drawing down cash reserves. The Fund remains highly liquid with an estimated liquidity ratio of 4.2, well above an accepted standard of 2.0, and the department projects cash reserves will be \$17.3 million at 2012 YE.
- **4.** Parking meter rate study postponed. A \$25,000, parking meter rate study budgeted for 2013 has been postponed so Parking can use newly-installed license plate recognition technology to more efficiently gather the needed data.
- **5.** Capital funding for parking structure maintenance. The 2014 Proposed Budget provides \$1.72 million in capital funding to maintain parking structures and surface parking lots, an increase of \$274,000 (19.0%) from the 2013 Budget.

II. INITIATIVES AND PROGRAMS.

1. BMO Harris Bradley Center Payment.

According comments made during a recent Finance and Personnel Committee hearing by the Mayor's Chief of Staff, the Parking Fund is budgeted to pay \$175,000 to the BMO-Harris Bradley Center in 2014, and for the next 4 years, to fulfill a promise made by the Mayor to the Bradley Center to contribute non-tax levy funds to the Center's Maintenance and Facilities Fund. The original request by the Bradley Center was for \$350,000 annually.

The Budget Office had previously indicated that the \$175,000 fee was to be for services rendered by the Bradley Center in 2014 to coordinate Center events to maximize parking revenues at the City's 4th & Highland parking garage adjacent to the Center. The Budget Office estimates Bradley Center events currently generate \$300,000--\$500,000 in parking revenues for the 4th & Highland parking garage.

The City expects this to be a 5-year agreement, \$175,000 annually. An implication of this agreement could be that, with the Bradley Center's help, parking revenues at 4th & Highland can be increased 35 to 58%, at least to the \$475,000--\$675,000 annual revenue range, to justify the \$175,000 annual fee.

Construction of both the Bradley Center and the 4th & Highland parking structure was completed 25 years ago. The proposed agreement for coordination services will be the first such agreement entered into by the City.

2. Virtual Night Parking Permit.

Beginning on December 20, 2013, the issuance of physical night parking permits, which have been frequently lost or stolen, will be discontinued, and the department will "issue" virtual night parking permits.

Whether purchased on-line, at police station front desks or from Automatic Payment kiosks, residents will receive confirmation numbers, but no physical permits will be issued. Instead, parking checkers will use the department's newly-installed license plate recognition system (described below) to "read" vehicle license plates to determine whether night parking permits are in effect.

The convenience fee for purchasing these virtual permits online will be reduced to \$1 from the current \$2.25 to reflect the administrative savings from not issuing physical permits; however, the night parking permit fee is unchanged. The issuance of virtual night parking permits is also expected to improve parking checker efficiency and productivity.

3. License Plate Recognition.

Twenty-eight of Parking's 56-vehicle parking enforcement fleet have been equipped with license plate recognition systems. The technology allows parking checkers to confirm night parking permits, identify stolen vehicles and check on outstanding violations. The system further allows Parking to implement the virtual night parking permit program described above. The system will be used for both day and night parking enforcement.

Plans were initially to install license plate recognition on a total of 35 vehicles, but the department will now operate the 28 vehicles already equipped over the next year to determine if they will be adequate to meet the department's needs.

The Police Department, which also uses license plate recognition technology, makes requests for information gathered by Parking's license plate recognition system, and Parking believes adequate safeguards are currently in place to protect the privacy of data gathered by the system.

4. Parking Meter Rate Study.

A \$25,000 parking meter rate study to be conducted by an outside vendor included in the Parking Fund's 2013 budget has been postponed so Parking can use its newly-installed license plate recognition technology to more efficiently gather the data needed for the study. Rather than dispatching staff with the sole purpose of counting vehicles parked on the street for the rate study, Parking will pull the counts from the "passes" parking checkers do as they complete their routine tasks.

The main goal of the study is to evaluate how parking demand and supply might be used for "smart pricing" of Milwaukee's parking rates, i.e. how varying parking rates based on supply and demand might be used to maximize parking meter revenue and better serve parkers looking for a parking space.

5. Cash Reserves and Liquidity.

Table 26.2. Changes in Cash Reserves and Liquidity.

Year	Net Fund Increase	Transfers to General Fund	Cash Reserves at Yearend	Current Ratio
2008	\$17,235,349	\$17,000,000	\$21,991,000	5.7
2009	\$17,621,768	\$18,132,150	\$21,019,000	6.4
2010	\$21,439,108	\$22,287,000	\$21,004,000	5.9
2011	\$19,055,829	\$22,787,000	\$20,209,000	5.5
2012	\$17,872,175	\$20,410,157	\$17,125,000	3.7
2013	\$16,641,765*	\$18,550,000	\$15,216,765*	4.0*
2014	\$15,580,997*	\$17,250,000	\$13,547,762*	3.6*

^{*} LRB estimation.

The Parking Fund continues to draw down its cash reserves to a more modest level as it continues to transfer to the City's General Fund more monies than it "earns" through operations. Cash reserves at year-end 2012 were \$17.1 million, producing a current ratio of 3.7. LRB estimates 2013 year-end cash reserves will be \$15.2 and cash reserves for 2014 could be \$13.5 million with a likely current ratio of 3.6.

The department's annual operating earnings—its annual net funds increase—have averaged approximately \$18.1 million over the last 5 years, while its corresponding transfer of monies to the City's General Fund has averaged roughly \$20.2 million, gradually drawing down cash reserves and lowering the department's liquidity ratio.

Despite this drawdown, Parking's current ratio remains at or just below 4.0, ensuring a high level of liquidity for the Fund. A current ratio of 2.0 is considered standard. LRB estimates cash reserves of \$9 million, \$4.5 million less than projected for 2014, would still give the Fund a current ratio of 2.4.

See also ISSUES TO CONSIDER, Section VIII.

III. EXPENDITURES.

Table 26.3. Changes in Expenditure Amounts by Account.

Expenditure Account	2012 Actual	2013 Adopted Budget	% Change	2014 Proposed Budget	% Change
Salaries and Wages	\$4,346,179	\$4,725,858	8.74%	\$4,666,682	-1.25%
Fringe Benefits	\$2,608,036	\$2,551,963	-2.15%	\$2,520,008	-1.25%
Operating Expenditures	\$13,496,696	\$14,248,000	5.57%	\$14,869,300	4.36%
Equipment Purchases	\$291,735	\$253,000	-13.28%	\$279,200	10.36%
Special Funds	\$4,153,180	\$5,181,286	24.75%	\$5,162,286	-0.37%
Total Operating Budget	\$24,895,826	\$26,960,107	8.29%	\$27,497,476	1.99%
Transfer to General Fund	\$20,410,157	\$18,550,000	-9.11%	\$17,250,000	-7.01%
Pension Reserve Fund	\$2,000,000	\$0	NA	\$0	NA
Capital Improvements *	\$1,417,012	\$1,441,000	1.69%	\$1,715,000	19.01%
Total Non-Operating Budget	\$23,827,169	\$19,991,000	-16.10%	\$18,965,000	-5.13%
Total Budget *	\$48,722,995	\$46,951,107	-3.64%	\$46,462,476	-1.04%

^{*} Net of Contingent Borrowing Authority.

1. Budget Summary.

The Parking Fund's budget can be segmented into an Operating Budget which includes salaries and fringe benefits, operating expenditures, equipment purchases and operating costs paid through special funds including the department's pension contribution and debt service, and a Non-Operating Budget for the transfer of monies to the City's General Fund, contributions to the City's Pension Reserve Fund and capital improvement expenditures.

The Proposed 2014 Operating Budget of \$27,497,476 is up 2%, or \$537,369 from the 2013 Adopted Budget of \$26,960,107, while the Proposed 2014 Non-Operating Budget of \$18,965,000 is down \$1,026,000, or -5.13% from the 2013 Adopted Budget of \$19,951,000.

Table 26.4. Changes in Operating & Non-Operating Budgets, 2013 to 2014.

Operating Bud	get	Non-Operating Budget		Budget
Category	Change		Category Change	
Personnel Costs	(\$91,131)		Transfer to General Fund	(\$1,300,000)
Operating Expenditures	\$621,300		Capital Improvements	\$274,000
Equipment Purchases	\$26,200		Total	(\$1,026,000)
Special Funds	(\$19,000)			
Total	\$537,369			

2. Personnel Costs.

Table 26.5. Changes in the Proposed Payroll Budget, 2013 to 2014.

Category	Units	Change
Salary Changes		
Parking Enforcement Supervisor	4	\$32,865
Parking Checker	60	(\$68,554)
Communications Assistant III	8	(\$2,190)
Tow Lot Assistant IVs	2	\$3,000
Tow Lot Assistant IIIs	7	(\$17,129)
Tow Lot Attendants & Aux.	12	(\$3,507)
Accounting Assistant II	1	\$3,847
Graduate Intern	1	\$3,100
Miscellaneous	6	(\$32)
Total Changes	101	(\$48,600)
Payroll Adjustments		
Personnel Cost Adjustment		\$972
Overtime		\$0
Furlough		(\$11,547)
Total Payroll Adjustments		(\$10,575)
Total Salary Changes & Adjustment		(\$59,175)
Fringe Benefits		(\$31,955)
Total Changes		(\$91,130)

Salary and fringe benefit costs for 2014 of \$7,186,690 are projected to be down \$91,131 (-1.25%) from \$7,277,821 in the 2013 Adopted Budget.

The number of authorized positions remains unchanged, but changes in projected salaries as summarized in Table 26.5 account for \$48,600, or just over half of the decrease in salary and benefit costs projected for 2014. Slightly more than one-third comes from a \$31,955 decrease in projected fringe benefit costs resulting from the projected \$59,175 decrease in net salaries and wages, while the remaining \$10,575 decrease comes principally from increased furlough savings.

It should be noted that the multiplier used for projected fringe benefits for Parking is 54% for both 2013 and 2014, indicating the enterprise fund is not expected to participate in the healthcare savings many other departments are expected to enjoy in 2014. Also, Parking's increased furlough savings projected for 2014 stems primarily from the fact that the department projected the equivalent a 2.35-day furlough in 2013 and a full 3-day furlough in 2014.

3. Operating Expenditures.

Operating expenditures for 2014 of \$14,869,300 are projected to be up \$621,300, or 4.36%, from the \$14,248,000 in 2013's Adopted Budget. Table 26.6 details the changes by category, and descriptions of the changes.

Table 26.6. Changes in the Proposed 2014 Operating Expenditures Budget.

Category	Change	% Change
Reimburse Other Departments	\$235,000	18.58%
Other Operating Services	\$210,000	6.29%
Energy	\$62,300	8.05%
Property Services	\$50,000	6.45%
Professional Services	\$36,000	0.47%
Other Operating Supplies	\$35,000	41.18%
Other	(\$7,000)	0%
Total	\$621,300	4.36%

Reimburse Other Departments. More than half of this increase (\$150,000) is to reimburse the Unified Call Center for 2 employees who handle mostly parking-related calls. The remaining \$85,000 stems from increased costs for various DPW-Admin services and higher cost allocation rates, and increased costs for services provided by the City Attorney Citation Review Manager.

Other Operating Services. Roughly 35% is projected for increased maintenance and repair costs on 90 multi-space meters that have, or will soon, no longer be covered under warranty. Much of the remaining \$136,500 is for increased payments to vehicle-towing contractors.

Energy. Natural gas, electricity and steam increases (2.5%, 3% and 5.25%, respectively) account for much of the increase, along with continued gasoline cost increases. Roughly \$10,500 comes from changes in an electricity use cost-sharing agreement with the Police Department at the MacArthur Square parking structure.

Property Services. DPW used 2012 actual experience (\$831,522) rather than 2013 anticipated costs to develop the request of \$825,000 for 2014.

Professional Services. The \$175,000 payment to the Bradley Center discussed in Section II, Initiatives and Programs, is budgeted in this account. Although a new armored car service contract for cash transport let in 2013 nearly doubled armored car transport services, the overall budget allocation would have been down \$139,000 in this account if not for the \$175,000 payment to BMO-Harris.

Other Operating Supplies. Parking expects credit card banking fees (included in this account) to increase as a result of the installation of 35 additional multi-space (LUKE) meters capable of processing credit card payments. In addition, batteries for older single-space meters must now be replaced 4 times per year rather than the twice-a-year cycle when the machines were newer, so battery replacement costs are projected to increase.

4. Equipment Purchases.

Parking's 2014 proposed equipment purchases are summarized in Table 26.7 below.

Table 26.7. Changes in the Proposed 2014 Equipment Purchase Budget.

Category	Change
Budget Increases or Additions	
Tablet PCs	\$6,000
Overhead Mounted Projector	\$900
Laptop Computers – Rugged	\$6,300
Auto-Jeeps	\$13,000
Printers	\$2,000
Computers	\$3,000
Budget Deletions *	
Network Printers	(\$5,000)
Total	\$26,200

^{*} Equipment Budgeted in 2013 but not budgeted for 2014.

5. Special Funds.

The 2014 proposed aggregate Special Funds budget of \$5,162,286 is virtually unchanged—down only \$19,000 (0.37%) from the 2013 Adopted Budget of \$5,181,286, but the changes bear noting. Because of better than expected pension fund performance, Parking's Pension Contribution is down \$88,000, while its PILOT payment to the City increased \$19,000. Debt Service is also up \$50,000 signaling slightly greater debt.

6. Non-operating budget Items.

The net \$1,026,000 decrease in the Non-operating budget comes from a \$1,300,000 reduction in the amount transferred by Parking to the City's General Fund - \$18.5 million was budgeted for transfer in 2013 and \$17.25 million is budgeted for 2014. This savings is slightly reduced by an increase of \$274,000 in new borrowing for capital improvements.

IV. PERSONNEL.

1. Personnel Changes.

No change in FTEs is proposed for Parking for 2014 as summarized in Table 26.8 below.

Table 26.8. Changes in Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) and Authorized Positions.

Position Category	2012 Actual	2013 Adopted Budget	Change	2014 Proposed Budget	Change
O&M FTEs	111.23	117.75	5.9%	117.75	0%
Non-O&M FTEs	0	0		0	
Total Authorized Positions	111.23	117.75	5.9%	117.75	0%

V. SPECIAL PURPOSE ACCOUNTS (SPA).

None.

VI. REVENUES.

While overall revenues for 2014 of \$43,023,900 are projected to be down 2.4% from 2013 Adopted Budget of \$44,097,300, revenue projections are virtually unchanged from 2012 actual revenues of \$43,475,528, down only 0.01%.

Table 26.9. Changes in Revenue by Category.

Revenue Category	2012 Actual	2013 Adopted Budget	Change	2014 Proposed Budget	Change
Parking Citations	\$22,158,694	\$22,000,000	-0.7%	\$21,000,000	-4.5%
Parking Structures	\$6,503,786	\$7,467,300	14.8%	\$7,070,500	-5.3%
Parking Meters	\$4,972,236	\$4,946,000	-0.5%	\$4,974,400	0.6%
Parking Permits	\$3,887,663	\$3,888,000	0%	\$3,891,000	0.1%
Towing – Vehicles	\$3,766,134	\$3,500,000	-7.1%	\$3,900,000	11.4%
Towing - Disposal & Other	\$2,166,724	\$2,275,000	5.0%	\$2,165,000	-4.8%
Parking Lots	\$20,291	\$21,000	3.5%	\$23,000	9.5%
Total	\$43,475,528	\$44,097,300	1.4%	\$43,023,900	-2.4%

VII. CAPITAL PROJECTS.

The 2014 Proposed Budget includes \$1,715,000 in funding for 4 capital projects, an increase of \$274,000 (19.0%) from the 2013 Budget. Just over \$1 million of the funding is for the MacArthur Square parking structure. Capital projects for 2014 are summarized in Table 26.10 and the discussion that follows.

1. Currently-Funded Projects.

Parking Facilities Maintenance, \$200,000.

This is an on-going program that is used to provide necessary repairs of structural, mechanical and electrical deficiencies of a non-emergency nature. Funding is also used to correct unplanned deficiencies identified by violation reports issued by building code inspectors that are time-sensitive in nature. This program has \$495,000 in carryover borrowing authority. Typical funding is approximately \$200,000 each year. The actual expenditures in 2012 were \$164,000.

Repave Tow Lot and Surface Lots, \$55,000.

This is a new capital account for DPW—Parking. It will be used to repave the Tow Lot over 3 years. It will also be used to repave other surface parking lots that the City owns. The department is currently developing an ongoing program to maintain approximately 40 City-owned surface parking lots. The 6-year capital request for this program is \$150,000.

2nd & Plankinton Parking Structure Repairs, 450,000.

Funding in this program will be used to paint the interior of the structure which was last painted in 1999. Actual expenditures in 2012 were \$434,000. No funding was provided in the 2013 Budget.

In addition to the funding proposed for 2014, the department anticipates needing just over \$1 million over the next 6 years for various repairs and maintenance. Work is tentatively scheduled for 2015, 2017 and 2018.

MacArthur Square Parking Structure Repairs, \$1,010,000.

Funding in this program will be used to replace the expansion joint on the James Lovell level, make concrete repairs, re-apply membrane and pavement markings, and to evaluate the electrical system. The actual expenditures in 2012 were \$130,000. No funding was provided in the 2013 Budget.

In addition to the funding proposed for 2014, the department anticipates needing \$2,350,000 over the next 6 years for various repairs and maintenance. Work is tentatively scheduled for 2015, 2016, 2018 and 2019.

Table 26.10. Capital Program Summary, 2014.

Program	2014 Proposed Budget	2013 Actual Budget	Increase (decrease)	% Chng.	6-year Request
Parking Facilities Maintenance	\$200,000	\$0	\$200,000		\$1,100,000
Repave Tow Lot and Surface Lots	\$55,000	\$0	\$55,000		\$150,000
2 nd & Plankinton Parking Structure Repairs	\$450,000	\$	\$450,000		\$1,420,000
MacArthur Square	\$1,010,000	\$0	\$1,010,000		\$3,360,000
Parking Meter Wireless Installation	\$0	\$720,000	(\$720,000)	-100%	\$0
License Plate Recognition (LPR) System	\$0	\$721,000	(\$721,000)	-100%	\$0
Total	\$1,715,000	\$1,441,000	\$274,000	19.0%	\$6,030,000*

The total does not include out year requests for projects that were not funded in 2014. The 6-year total for all submitted requests is \$14,920,000.

2. Unfunded Capital Requests.

Joint Dispatch/Parking Enforcement Relocation, \$2,150,000.

No funding was proposed for this project in 2014.

This project would relocate the Parking Dispatch and Parking Enforcement staff from their current location at 123 North 25th Street where DPW leases space from MMSD. The 123 Building is a 2-story light industrial facility. It contains offices, the tire shop and storage space. The structure was developed in 1988 and renovated in 2001 to accommodate Parking operations. DPW is currently investigating the feasibility of purchasing the building.

3. Project Updates.

Parking Meter Wireless Installation

This project received \$720,000 in the 2013 Budget to install a wireless communications (WiFi) network for the City's multi-space meters to reduce cellular communication costs. There are approximately 250 meters downtown and in the 3rd Ward. The system will have a secure network with guaranteed priority bandwidth for processing parking meter transactions. The residual bandwidth will be made available to the public free of charge. The expected savings over the 7-year useful life of the hardware is \$288,000.

DPW has been working with the vendor of the LUKE meters to identify and approve a wireless modem that will ensure the security of credit card transactions. A modem was identified, but its manufacture was discontinued in January 2013. DPW anticipates that the vendor will provide several modems to the City by mid-October for field testing throughout the winter.

License Plate Recognition (LPR) System

This project received \$721,000 in the 2013 Budget to install license plate recognition (LPR) cameras on parking enforcement jeeps. As of September 2013, DPW intends to install the cameras on 28 jeeps. The technology can confirm the purchase of a night parking permit, identify vehicles that have been reported stolen and recognize vehicles with outstanding violations. The cameras will be used for both day and night parking enforcement. This project will eliminate the costs related to printing and selling parking permits. The estimated payback period for this project is between 5 and 6 years.

As of October 2013, all the cameras have been installed and the software is being programmed to reflect the City's parking regulations. Testing is taking place and DPW anticipates that the 2014 night parking permits will be virtual by the start of sales on December 20, 2013.

License plate data will be stored on a server maintained by the Department of Administration – ITMD for up to 7 years. Vehicle registration information will not be stored in the database. The data will be made available to the Police Department upon request.

4. Future Capital Requests.

4th & Highland Parking Structure Repairs.

The department anticipates needing \$925,000 over the next 6 years for various repairs and maintenance. Work is tentatively scheduled for 2015, 2016 and 2018.

1000 N. Water Street Parking Structure Repairs.

The department anticipates needing \$590,000 over the next 6 years for various repairs and maintenance. Work is tentatively scheduled for 2015, 2016 and 2017.

Milwaukee/Michigan Parking Structure Repairs.

The department anticipates needing \$1,250,000 over the next 6 years for various repairs and maintenance. Work is tentatively scheduled for each year from 2015 through 2019 with the exception of 2016.

Single Space Credit Card Meter Mechanisms.

The department anticipates needing \$1,325,000 for a 2-year project to install single space credit card parking meters in the downtown area and the Third Ward where there are less than 6 contiguous parking spaces and parking rates are at least \$1 per hour. The project is tentatively scheduled for 2015 and 2016.

Replace Multi-Space Meters.

The department anticipates needing \$1,100,000 for the scheduled replacement of the multispace meters that the City began installing in 2007. The meters have a 10-12 year useful life and will likely need to be replaced or need substantial maintenance by 2019.

VIII. ISSUES TO CONSIDER.

- **1.** The likelihood that the \$175,000 fee to the Bradley Center will increase 4th & Highland parking revenues 35-58%, and the possibility of recasting the proposed agreement as a commission-style fee based on actual incremental revenue increases need to be considered.
- **2.** Whether a fee to the Bradley Center invites other entertainment venues adjacent to other City parking structures to request similar arrangements needs to be considered.
- **3.** Address the amount of cash reserves needed to maintain adequate levels of liquidity without leaving excess cash unused in the Fund.
- **4.** The purchase of sophisticated license plate reader system, which are made up of high-speed cameras that capture photographs of each license plate combined with software that analyzes the photos to identify the license plate number, could have implications for privacy and First Amendment rights. Many systems are configured to store the photographs, the license plate numbers, as well as the dates, times and locations. Key concerns are unauthorized access to data, undefined data retention periods and widespread data sharing. The broader policy question of increased parking enforcement and issues of fairness should also be addressed.

Prepared by: Aaron Cadle, Legislative Research Analyst—Lead

Contributor: Kathy Brengosz, Fiscal Planning Specialist

Budget Hearing Date: October 15, 2013

Last Updated: October 11, 2013