



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date	6/3/2024	CCF # 240077
Ald. Brostoff	Staff reviewer: Tim Askin	
Property	2633 N Lake Drive	North Point North HD
Owner/Applicant	Maddie & Murphy McFadden	Hundt Architecture

Proposal

Applicants propose to replace a poorly constructed rear enclosed porch and alter a non-original roofline on a rear sunroom wing. A side entrance stoop staircase will be replaced with a design inspired by the original architect's work. Windows throughout the house will be repaired in place. 42 windows will receive new wooden storm windows manufactured by Marvin.

Staff comments

The house is a fine storybook Tudor from 1927 designed by George Schley & Sons, most famous for Carlen's house and other Story Hill area homes. They primarily worked in stucco, as in this example.

The existing addition appears from both its manner of construction and city records to have been built without permits, probably sometime in the 1970s. The new design eliminates an awkward and poorly pitched shed roof. Five of the six standard demolition criteria are met and the demolition should therefore be approved. Almost no properties have ever met all six.

The old sunporch is to be replaced with a covered porch with heavy timber structure and a shallow gable with stucco and half-timbering in the gable end. The design suits the Tudor style of the house while invoking a shallow gable and simplified detailing that clarify its separate design identity. It generally satisfies the criteria for new construction. The siting is acceptable and has no perceptible impact on any neighboring properties. In scale, it feels heavy compared to the main house, but the arrangement of pieces and their size are generally suitable. A steeper gable may be of some use to balance the design. For form, it again suits the location, the gable height is dictated by the second floor window placement and it is a stylistically better choice than a flat roof. As to materials, all is cedar with a standing seam metal roof over the gable. Such roofing has been allowed on new construction and additions, as a nod to modernity.

The existing rear sunroom wing will have its roofline altered to eliminate the mansard roof and restore an accurate appearance. New cedar railings matching those of the new side stoop will be installed to create a functional balcony space.

Recommendation

Approve with standard conditions.

Conditions

All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or treated with an opaque stain upon completion. Note: when new, bare wood is left exposed to the exterior elements for a period of only a week or two, the life of the paint job subsequently applied to it will be decreased. The use of a decay-resistant wood for is required for porch areas. Using western white pine or Ponderosa pine is "at your own risk" because this wood has no natural decay resistance and can deteriorate in some exterior settings in just a few years.