

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 5/1/2023 Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin CCF #221902

Property 1823 N. PALMER ST. Brewers Hill

Owner/Applicant STEPHEN J BIALK Steve Bialk

ANGELA DUCKERT 1823 N. Palmer St 1823 N PALMER ST Milwaukee, WI 53212 MILWAUKEE WI 53212 Phone: (414) 640-6003

Proposal

Eliminate a non-original porch and enclose the area with a breezeway connecting to the two different major buildings on the property. This will create fully enclosed, continuous L-shaped building.

Staff comments

In 2020 we saw a much larger proposal that had a similar effect. After HPC's approval, it ran into serious zoning issues and was dropped by the owner. Staff declines to make any zoning analysis or recommendation because of the prior matter.

The Brewers Hill guidelines raise major issues with this new construction.

Siting: New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in Brewer's Hill. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings. New buildings should not obstruct the vistas from the street to the house.

The proposal eliminates the spacing of building on the property. What has allowed the complex to work reasonably well under this guideline so far is the separation of the buildings. While the Main house has been extended all the way to the alley line, it is mostly in line with the main house. The various extra buildings to the south have remained separate so far. An appearance of visually distinct sections will remain. Such construction is a known New England agricultural homesteading practice, but is uncommon in Wisconsin. Staff has doubts, but limited precedent exists.

Scale: Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.

The new proposal is in the same rustic style as prior approvals. The size is modest and it is discreetly located.

Form. The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.

One large L-shaped structure is unusual. Nonetheless, most of the pieces retain an individual character and show growth over time.

Materials: The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in Brewer's Hill.

The materials are in line with the prior approvals at the property. Vertical board and batten is combined with wood windows and asphalt or patterned metal roofs. There are no concerns here.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

Previous HPC action 200531: a larger scale version of this project was approved by HPC in 2020. It ran

into trouble with plan exam and was dropped.

Previous Council action