GRANT F. LANGLEY

City Attorney

RUDOLPH M. KONRAD LINDA ULISS BURKE VINCENT D. MOSCHELLA Deputy City Attorneys



November 18, 2010

To the Honorable Common Council Of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

Re: Resolution Relating to the Claim of CLEMON R. THAMES

C.I. File No. 10-L-130

Dear Council Members:

We return the enclosed document which has been filed with the City Clerk and ask that it be introduced and referred to the Committee on Judiciary & Legislation with the following recommendation.

Claimant, Clemon R. Thames, 2725 North 38th Street, Milwaukee, WI 53210, alleges that on August 20, 2010 he sustained damages when a City tree branch broke off and fell onto his vehicle which was parked at 2729 North 38th Street. He claims damages in the amount of \$6,400.00.

Our investigation reveals that the Forestry Section records indicate that on August 20, 2010, they received and responded to a call of a tree which was down on a car and blocking the street at 2729 North 38th Street. Upon arrival, their crew found that a 16-inch diameter by 35-foot-long branch from a Green Ash tree located in the City right-of-way had fallen. The tree and branch were alive. The branch showed some evidence of internal decay, which was not visible from the outside. As a result of this incident, the tree lost a significant amount of its crown and is now in the process of being removed by the Section. They also note that at the time of the loss, the City was experiencing windy conditions with a peak wind speed of 43 mph. In addition, in keeping with the cyclical pruning of all trees in this area, the tree was last pruned in 2007 and no outward signs of decay were evident. Finally, the Section also reviewed their records for the previous 5 years and found no other complaints or service requests for this tree. There is no

THOMAS O. GARTNER SUSAN D. BICKERT STUART S. MUKAMAL THOMAS J. BEAMISH MAURITA F. HOUREN JOHN J. HEINEN DAVID J. STANOSZ **SUSAN E. LAPPEN** JAN A. SMOKOWICZ **PATRICIA A. FRICKER HEIDI WICK SPOERL KURT A. BEHLING GREGG C. HAGOPIAN ELLEN H. TANGEN** MELANIE R. SWANK JAY A. UNORA **DONALD L. SCHRIEFER EDWARD M. EHRLICH LEONARD A. TOKUS** MIRIAM R. HORWITZ **MARYNELL REGAN** G. O'SULLIVAN-CROWLEY KATHRYN Z. BLOCK **MEGAN T. CRUMP ELOISA DE LEÓN ADAM B. STEPHENS KEVIN P. SULLIVAN BETH CONRADSON CLEARY** THOMAS D. MILLER **JARELY M. RUIZ ROBIN A. PEDERSON DANIELLE M. BERGNER CHRISTINE M. QUINN** Assistant City Attorneys

To the Honorable Common Council Of the City of Milwaukee November 18, 2010 Page 2

evidence that the City was negligent in this matter. As such, the City would not be liable. Therefore, we recommend denial of this claim.

Very truly yours,

GRANT F. LANGLEY City Attorney

JAN A. SMOKOWICZ Assistant City Attorney

JAS:ms Enclosure 1068-2010-2936:163560