



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 12-13-2021

Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6

Staff reviewer: Carlen Hatala

PTS #115226

CCF # 211139

Property

116 W. VINE ST. Brewers Hill Historic District

Owner/Applicant

Michael Warecki
418 North 3rd Street Unit 180
MILWAUKEE WI 53203

Michael Warecki

Proposal

The applicant proposes to construct a new house at 116 West Vine Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District. This is the third submission, showing changes made to the house design since June 2021.

Staff comments

It has been determined at prior HPC Meetings (06-14-2021 and 11-4-2019) that the basic HPC guidelines of the Brewers Hill Historic District and the Brewers Hill/Harambee overlay guidelines have been met.

The HPC will be reviewing design details that have been changed since the last HPC review.

FRONT ELEVATION

- The front elevation entry porch now has a hip roof instead of flat roof with deck. Applicant is having the design revised for Monday's HPC meeting.
- The porch steps were shown with brick pavers in June. Now they are of stone. Porch deck material not clear.
- The front bay now is clad in stone instead of clapboards with panels.
- The foundation is clad with the same stone as the bay.
- Gable/attic windows now show two French doors flanked by single windows. In the prior design there was only one window flanked by wider four-over-four windows.

EAST ELEVATION

- The dormer now extends down to the base of the building and is clad with the same cut stone as the bay at the front.
- Slider windows will be replaced with French doors and will be shown by applicant at Monday's meeting.

NORTH ELEVATION

- No changes shown.

WEST ELEVATION

- The two skylights at the roof toward the front of the house have been removed per HPC recommendation.
- The garage door is contemporary in design. More appropriate designs can be found and staff can assist with selection.

Recommendation

- The use of stone on the bays is not a feature found in Brewers Hill. It is a feature found in contemporary houses and not appropriate here. Prior design in June showed the bays clad in clapboards with recessed panels below the groupings of windows. This is appropriate. Applicant may present a new design of the bays at Monday's HPC.
- The type of stone and its placement at the foundation has a contemporary look in contrast to stone foundations of the later 19th and early 20th centuries that were installed in even courses. Alternate materials can include brick, brick veneer over concrete, brick-stamped concrete, rusticated concrete block.
- Decking material will have to be decided upon.
- Garage dormer on east elevation has been altered into a bay and is clad in stone. For the reasons cited above cladding is not appropriate. Applicant may present different cladding at Monday's meeting.
- Garage door is too contemporary in contrast to the house. Staff can assist with more appropriate options.
- HPC requested more differentiation or separation of the garage from the house so that it will not appear as one long house. Applicant has retained the design and footprint from the June submission with a recessed hyphen 8 feet deep and 4 feet wide.
- HPC did not call out the vertical siding at the front bay. Staff finds this inappropriate.

Conditions

Changes made in accordance with prior HPC review:

- French Doors in place of sliders
- Removal of skylights on west slope of roof

Features needing HPC decision as staff feel the features/materials are inappropriate.

NOTE: applicant might change before Monday's meeting:

- Vertical gable siding is not traditionally done. Staff recommends horizontal clapboards or square butt cedar shingles.
- Front porch design with beefier posts
- Front porch decking

Agreed upon materials:

- Windows must be all wood as required of all prior submittals
- Siding must be clear cedar siding or eastern white pine as required of past submittals.
- Doors to be solid wood or wood veneer.
- Skylights are to be flat. Bubble, pyramidal, or dome skylights are not permitted.

Staff Conclusion
Previous HPC action

Approve some of the submitted changes. Deny inappropriate ones.
Meetings June 14, 2021 and November 4, 2019

Previous Council action

