

MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT



| | | | |
|----------|-------------------|-----------|----------------|
| Date | 7/7/2025 | Ald. | Brower |
| CCF | 250361 | Reviewer | Tim Askin |
| Address | 2429 E Wyoming | Owner | Jeff Koenig |
| District | North Point South | Applicant | KCB Architects |

PROPOSAL

An architecturally underwhelming garage presently exists on the site. Applicants propose a new attached garage of noticeably larger size.

The garage footprint is roughly 51x26 with a footprint of 1317sf. Roof height is just under 17 feet with a parapeted flat roof. It will sit approximately 10' forward of the neighbor's proposed new garage.

STAFF COMMENTS

The house is a 1903 design by A.C Eschweiler in the Jacobethan Revival style. It sits on a prominent lot with a view of the North Point Water Tower.

This is a simultaneous and joint project with the adjoining neighbor. The property line has been adjusted to accommodate this project and to correct for prior encroachments. Setback variances are required for both garages and are expected to be approved. This garage also requires a height variance. First stories of garages have a maximum height of 10 feet in the zoning code. The cornice molding begins at 16'7". The garage is well designed for the number of cars it is intended to store, but there is an issue of scale.

Analysis of guidelines

Additions and Streetscapes.

- The height and depth of the garage a visual intrusion upon the primary façade. The garage is taller than the first story of the house and is only slightly recessed from the front wall.

Porches, Trim and Ornamentation

- The west arcade constitutes a porch which is visible and will be hidden by the garage.

Siting.

- The garage is situated in the only possible location. All other street frontage is occupied by the house and there is no yard to the south. The footprint impacts the siting, but the only option is to reduce the depth. The width is within normal range for a 2-1/2 car garage, which, while large for the North Point districts, is not without precedent.

Scale.

- The vehicle doors reach the height of the house's beltcourse and the side wall covers corbeling and an arcade on the west elevation. The 1317sf footprint is larger than most houses in the city (a 1.5-2 story typical 3BR house has a footprint of roughly 750sf. As a nominally one-story structure, it is larger 2BR ranch house. (A two-bedroom Lustron is 1100-1200sf).¹

Form.

- The garage is flat roofed with a parapet, which is appropriate as a concept. The garage has a clear base, middle, and top, although the middle is disproportionate to the other two. This criterion also addresses projection. The garage projects nearly to the front wall of the house, and several feet forward of the neighboring garage. Neither is compatible with the continuity of the surrounding structures.

Materials.

- The architect has stated an intent to find matching brick. Overhead and service doors will be modern materials with a wood appearance and of character appropriate to a carriage house.

e. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.

- Several architectural details including an arcade and decorative corbeling will be hidden by the garage.

g-1. Whether the proposed work would destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done or adversely affect the external appearance of other improvements on the site or within the district.

- Several architectural features of the west elevation will be obscured.

RECOMMENDATION

Deny. Resubmit in reduced size. The overall aesthetic concept is appropriate, but not the scale.

1. If approving, there is roughly 5 feet that can be removed from the depth of the garage. This would remove an interior work area but will lessen the disparity with the neighboring structure.

PRIOR ACTION

N/A

¹ https://www.kansashistory.gov/publicat/heritage/2003winter_davis.pdf

GUIDELINES

ADDITIONS

Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

STREETSCAPES

The streetscapes in North Point South are visually cohesive because of the intact building stock and the retention of period street and landscaping features. There are few non-contributing buildings or visually prominent inappropriate additions to historic structures. The traditional landscape treatment of the building lots and the period streetlights contribute to the maintenance of the district's traditional residential character.

1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.

PORCHES, TRIM AND ORNAMENTATION

Retain porches and steps visible from the public right-of-way that are historically and architecturally appropriate to the building. Avoid altering porches and steps by enclosing open porches.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

[Few] buildings have been constructed since 1940... It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.

1. Siting. New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in North Point South. This includes setbacks, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings.
2. Scale. Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.
3. Form. The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.
4. Materials. The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of traditionally used in North Point South. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.