



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/1/2018
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114618 CCF #180811

Property	953 N. 33RD ST.	Concordia HD
Owner/Applicant	KATHRYN FINERTY 953 N 33RD ST MILWAUKEE WI 53208	Kathryn Finerty 953 N 33rd
Proposal	Repair/Replace all railings, balusters, and columns. Eliminate dropdown railing and increase railing height 6". Replace decorative molding in gable peak of center front gable. Assorted porch roof and front of second story repairs for damaged fascia and so on.	
Staff comments	<p>The original railing was an exceptionally elegant Colonial Revival design with fine design details including tight baluster spacing and dropdown rails. It was probably one of the finest surviving original porch railings in the Concordia district. The railing was intact until this project began. Staff has no doubt that there was some rot, but has not had the opportunity to inspect any of the removed materials. There is the possibility that epoxy repair could be viable if they survive. Google photos from 2015, as limited as they are, do not indicate irreversible deterioration. Applicant's pre-project photos also do not indicate irreversible deterioration.</p> <p>Spindles/Balusters If necessary, some of the spindles from the porch railing appear to be accurate replicas of the originals and these can be mass-produced by a skilled carpenter with a lathe. The narrow taper is a key detail that must be replicated to keep the porch in line with the original design.</p> <p>Top Rail The top rails are of a drop down design that requires skilled carpentry. An adequate match to the main profile can be found in catalogs. Top rails are less visible and less vital to the character than the balustrade. There does not appear to be any alternative to replicating the dropdown detail without hand carving.</p> <p>Columns Columns are a simple fluted design with simple plinths and capitals. They should be repairable other than some already replaced plinths. If necessary, they can be easily replicated by a good carpenter or from a catalog supplier given the correct measurements. Contractors should work with staff to address this issue. Replicas can be approved if they have wood exteriors.</p> <p>Upper Story Repairs Roof and gable peak repairs appear to be acceptable as proposed, but staff recommends holding over the gable end detail repair for further review upon completion, because no measurements or pieces are available for inspection at this time.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval	

Conditions

1. Deny contractor's proposed balusters and railings.
2. Require replica balusters or repaired balusters in wood
3. Require dropdown detail be replicated in handrails, although a stock profile may be acceptable for the body of the rail. Require match to existing railing height.
4. Hold over review of gable end trim details to close out at completion or upon the applicant supplying adequate information.
5. Standard wood requirements: clear grain, knot free, rot-resistant, and painted. No pressure-treated wood is permitted.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council action**