



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/9/2018
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114558 CCF #180430

Property 833 W. WISCONSIN AV. St. James Episcopal Church

Owner/Applicant 833 JAMES LLC Mark R Ernst
225 E MICHIGAN ST STE 110 Engberg Anderson
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 320 E. Buffalo St.
Suite 500
Milwaukee, WI 53202

Proposal Eliminate exterior stair tower on east elevation. In its place, build a two-story deck of wood and steel construction into an existing surface parking lot. It will be approximately 30'x48' exclusive of a new staircase.

Replace organ chamber area with elevator. Remodel parish house interior removing most of 1960s era work. Perform exterior repairs as needed on roof, windows, and stone. Replace most doors with historically appropriate styles.

Staff comments This proposal with a new financing approach is a significant improvement over the previous proposal. Significant demolition is excluded from the proposal and both buildings will survive. Demolition of the stair tower is inconsequential. It is not likely original to the parish hall, and if it is, it is a clear architectural afterthought with highly noticeable alterations. Apart from the addition of a deck attached to the parish house and some accessibility features, both buildings will essentially be restored to their 1899 appearance on the exterior.

There appear to be no bathrooms being inserted into the narthex in this revised project. Accessory functions not part of the sanctuary will all be primarily be placed into the parish hall that has negligible historic integrity.

Few, if any, original exterior doors remain and most existing doors do not meet fire code for the new uses. Door schedule indicates wood doors for all but the parish house basement and one door on the second floor

Staff would object to use of door types A & B (sheet A900) on the exterior. Staff would be willing to accept them for access to the trash area only and for access to the interior light well. The Commission has denied these types of doors as historically inappropriate and aesthetically unsatisfactory before, even when used in modern addition.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Submit final door schedule to staff for approval
2. Photograph any windows requiring glass replacement and send these photos to staff for the record. New storm windows, if any, shall have wood frames.
3. Submit final fence/gate design for staff approval.
4. Submit pergola design for staff approval
5. Submit railing details for deck and accessibility ramps.
6. No use of door types A & B except for trash enclosure and light well.

**Additional
Standard
Project
Conditions**

Wood

All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or stained upon completion.

Masonry

New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. See the city's books As Good As New or Good for Business, Masonry Chapters, for more information. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before tuckpointing.

New brick or stone must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick/stone and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

HVAC

Sidewall vent pipes for heating equipment must be located through the raised foundation on the rear elevation or as far back as possible on a side elevation that does not face the street. All sidewall vent pipes must be painted out to blend with the color of the surrounding building material.

Windows

Replacement windows will be all wood both inside and out. No vinyl, vinyl-clad, aluminum, aluminum-clad or fiberglass windows are permitted. New glass size must match the original glass size.

Fences

Fences and railings shall be wood or metal and no white metal shall be exposed. All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or stained with an opaque stain upon completion. Metal fences and railings shall have a paint or paint-like finish. Vinyl film coatings are not acceptable.

Roofs

No dormers, chimneys, moldings or other permanent features will be altered or removed. No box vents, if used, will be visible from the street. If they are installed, they must be on a rear slope not visible from the street and they must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing material. A continuous ridge vent can be installed in place of box vents, but the vent must extend across the entire ridge and not stop short. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and sealed where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.

**Previous HPC
action**

**Previous Council
action**