



# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 11/4/2024**  
**Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern**

**Ald. Jackson**  
**CCF # 240922**

**Property** 2857-2859 N. Sherman Blvd. Sherman Boulevard Historic District

**Owner/Applicant** Jesse L. Lee & Henrietta Lee  
2857-2859 N. Sherman Blvd.  
Milwaukee, WI 53210

## Proposal

The applicant wishes to demolish the 1921 two-car garage located on the alley at the rear of their property because of the age and condition of the garage.

## Staff comments

The Colonial Revival duplex and the garage were both constructed in 1921. The garage is a wood-framed 20'x20' garage clad with faux brick asbestos siding. The garage has a hipped roof with deteriorated 3-tab shingles. The garage is a modest design, similar in scale and design to other two-car garages found on both the Sherman Blvd. and N. 44<sup>th</sup> sides of the alley.

The garage shows overall signs of deterioration, including the siding, shingles, and fascia. The garage also shows signs of settling.

There are six criteria for demolition in the Sherman Park Historic District:

1. **Condition** - Demolition requests may be granted when it can be clearly demonstrated that the condition of a building or a portion thereof is such that it constitutes an immediate threat to health and safety.

While the garage is in poor condition, it does not constitute an immediate threat to health and safety.

2. **Importance** - Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is of historical or architectural significance or displays a quality of material and craftsmanship that does not exist in other structures in the area.

The garage design and materials are commonly found throughout Milwaukee. The garage is not distinctively designed and does not carry over any architectural features found on the primary structure.

3. **Location** - Consideration will be given to whether or not the building contributes to the neighborhood and the general street appearance and has a positive effect on other buildings in the district.

The garage is not visible from the right of way and does not contribute to the overall street appearance of Sherman Boulevard.

4. **Potential for Restoration** - Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is beyond economically feasible repair.

No estimates have been provided showing restoration cost vs. demolition and construction of a new garage however, the garage appears to have settled and may be difficult to restore without a significant cost.

5. **Additions** - Consideration will be given to whether or not the proposed demolition is a later addition that is not in keeping with the original design of the structure or does not contribute to its character.

The original permit for the garage is missing from the file but a note in the file indicates the garage permit was pulled on December 6, 1921, the same date as the house.

**6. Replacement** - Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is to be replaced by a compatible new building that would fulfill the same aesthetic function in the area as did the old structure (see New Construction Guidelines).

A replacement garage is proposed for the existing garage. The new garage will fulfill the same aesthetic function in the alley as the existing garage.

Three of the criteria for demolition are met. Staff recommends approving the demolition of the garage.

**Recommendation**                      Recommend HPC Approval

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC action**

**Previous Council action**