

Meeting Date: May 17, 2007

Attending: Sandra McSweeney, Pat Balon & Matt Jarosz: HPC Commissioners
Bob Greenstreet, Vanessa Koster, Paul Jakubovich & Greg Patin: DCD Staff
Scott Kindness: Workshop Architects

RE: HPC sub-committee meeting summary

Pat Balon had questions regarding the process and the decision for the use of this site. Bob explained the public zoning change process and confirmation that this site was always anticipated for development. He further discussed the RFP process and rejection of all 8 proposals because of financial infeasibility or not meeting RFP requirements. Scott confirmed that New Land's redevelopment strategy for the city lot was always contemplated for a building with first floor retail and structured parking.

Exterior design issues that were discussed:

1. ROOFTOP AND INTERNAL LIGHTING. Sandra raised concerns about the pole height and light spillage from the rooftop parking. Scott provided specifications of the fixture and a section drawing depicting light area. Greg noted that since the ballast was mounted within the fixture and believed that the bulb would not be visible. Paul suggested that a light pole be added to the roof of the Schwartz's building as a test. Benefits and drawbacks for sodium vapor and metal halide lamps for lighting the internal structure were discussed. Scott asked which was preferred since it wasn't selected yet. Scott also confirmed that the internal fixtures would conceal the lamps.
2. EAST ELEVATION. Matt asked if the wall height could be reduced since the majority of the ramping is at the middle of the elevation. He also asked if openings could be provided and/or having a solid metal knee-wall, which could also reduce the wall height. Scott showed a sketch that would provide a larger setback for the wall and Greg explained that abutting neighbors requested a solid wall to address concerns with headlights, noise, and emissions.
3. NORTH ELEVATION. Bob noted that Sandra raised concerns about the brick color at HPC. Scott explained that the proposed brick color was monochromatic and darker than the existing buildings. He also explained that an acid wash pre-cast concrete would be used on the base of the building. Matt asked if the height of the southerly stair tower could be reduced.

Scott will explore the following:

1. Reducing light pole height on rooftop
2. Providing lighter color brick (will provide material samples; including mortar color)
3. Determining cost difference between stamped and brick adhered pre-cast panels on east elevation. Scott will discuss with developer to determine if this is a feasible change.

4. Changing north end wall that is pre-cast to brick
5. Reducing the wall height on the east elevation and possibly increasing the setback of the upper wall, which may reduce the number of parking stalls. Scott noted that the number of parking stalls for the office and retail tenants could not be reduced, but if the City was willing to reduce the number of replacement parking stalls, the wall height reduction and setback may be achieved.
6. Removing stamped stone base and lowering brick on east elevation (this was agreed to by Scott)

Scott will provide DCD staff with findings and submit material samples (brick, cardboard mock up for metal grill and possibly metal grill) for sub-committee to review. Sandra followed up with an email request for an additional meeting. If the sub-committee reconvenes, it would be set after Matt Jarosz returns in late June.

Meeting Date: June 14, 2007

Attending: Sandra McSweeney and Pat Balon, HPC Commissioners
Bob Greenstreet, Vanessa Koster, Paul Jakubovich & Greg Patin: DCD Staff
Scott Kindness, Melissa Modjeska & Grant Reginato: Workshop Architects
Joel Lee and Boris Gokhman: DAPL LLC, Development Team

Absent: Matt Jarosz, HPC Commissioner

RE: HPC sub-committee meeting summary held at Workshop Architects

On May 14, 2007, the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) recommended conditional approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the proposed 4-story retail building and parking structure at 2974 North Downer Avenue. After recommending conditional approval of the COA, the HPC established a sub-committee to review and explore final details of the building design relative to the impact on the adjacent National historic district. The three items that were agreed to by HPC to further study were: the rooftop and internal lighting, the east building elevation, and the brick color on the north elevation. Those items, in addition to the following discussion items from the first sub-committee meeting on May 17, 2007, were summarized:

1. Reducing light pole height on rooftop
2. Providing lighter color brick (will provide material samples; including mortar color)
3. Determining cost difference between stamped and brick adhered pre-cast panels on east elevation. The architect will discuss with developer to determine if this is a feasible change.
4. Changing north end wall that is pre-cast concrete to brick.
5. Reducing the wall height on the east elevation and possibly increasing the setback of the upper wall, which may reduce the number of parking stalls. The architect noted that the number of parking stalls for the office and retail tenants could not be reduced, but if the City was willing to reduce the number of replacement parking stalls, the wall height reduction and setback may be achieved.
6. Removing stamped stone base and lowering brick on east elevation (this was agreed to by the architect).

After extensive discussion and review of sample materials, the sub-committee agreed at the final sub-committee meeting to the following items:

1. The exterior brick color will be changed from a darker brick to a lighter brick (Hebron, chocolate).
2. The mortar color of the exterior brick will match the pre-cast concrete stone.

3. A longer plate will be added to the backside of the two rooftop light poles to further reduce the possibility of light visibility to the east.
4. A mock-up light pole will be placed on the roof of the Schwartz's building to demonstrate the lighting levels during the night.
5. The stamped stone base on the east elevation will be eliminated to provide a consistent brick appearance to the east.
6. Vinyl awnings are not acceptable per historic guidelines; fabric awnings will be used instead. The chartreuse color was agreed to but is not available in fabric. The architect will look at other swatch colors to select a similar color.
7. The east wall will be reduced 3.5 feet but will have a straight wall at the cap of the building instead of stepping at the ramping area.

Other discussion items:

1. Workshop Architects determined the cost difference between stamped and brick adhered pre-cast panels on east elevation. Spancrete provided cost estimates and it would be more than \$250,000 additional for adhered brick. The developer determined this was not an economically feasible option, and the stamped pattern will give the appearance of brick.
2. The light manufacturer displayed the proposed top level light fixture with a 100-watt metal halide lamp. Workshop Architects also provided images of Downer Avenue with the building during the night, to demonstrate there would not be a significant impact of the two proposed light poles. If the pole height was lowered, additional light poles would be needed to provide enough lighting to meet lighting standards and provide safety. Concerns about light spillage and impact to the residents to the east based were raised, and the architects agreed to set up a light pole on the Schwartz's building to demonstrate it's impact.
3. A full scale cardboard mock up of the mesh screen on the north elevation was reviewed. Concerns were raised regarding headlights and it was suggested that the structure have more opaque walls similar to the Chicago/Jefferson parking structure in the Third Ward (this would not be allowed per building code due to ventilation requirements), or provide an additional layer of mesh, offset to create a baffle, to further shield headlights. It was expressed that there wouldn't be cars with headlights on at the same time, nor at any great length of time. It was also suggested that the public parking be dedicated to the center aisles during the night to minimize impact. Due to cost implications for the additional layer and the merchants having a desire to have some visibility of vehicles from Downer Avenue, the previously approved mesh will be used.

The architects will submit revised drawings based on the aforementioned agreements prior to issuance of the COA.

MINUTES OF THE HPC DOWNER PARKING RAMP SUB-COMMITTEE

JUNE 18, 2007

4:30 pm

PAT BALON, SANDRA MCSWEENEY, MATT JAROSZ, PAUL JAKUBOVICH

ALSO PRESENT CARLEN HATALA

The sub-committee was dissatisfied at the lack of progress being made in the sub-committee meetings. The sub-committee has observed that many of its recommendations have been quickly dismissed or ignored by the architect and management at City Development. The HPC sub-committee was formally empowered to act on behalf of the full commission to remedy design issues for the Downer Ramp since the design as submitted was not acceptable to the commission. The sub-committee wants to note that they have been working on the design only since May 14th and have met twice with meetings scheduled by DCD management.

Subcommittee recommendations include:

Get rid of the rooftop parking. There should be an enclosed roof. The 15-foot light poles at the rooftop are unacceptable. There will be too much light pollution. Check out the Historic Third Ward's ramp on Milwaukee Street late at night to see an example that is inappropriate for a residential area.

Joel Lee told us at the last subcommittee meeting that the Mayor has asked that the plan be revisited. The suggestion to reconfigure the footprint of the building and maintain the tree and green space around the tree is a credible suggestion. Joel Lee considered this doable. Scott Kindness said it would take only a half-day to draw up plans. We want to see this option worked on. It would create a buffer between the ramp and the house at 2623 E. Bellevue Place and preserve the tree. The sub-committee questioned the City's projection of a lengthy time period for approval of changes to the footprint of the building.

The grilles as shown at the last subcommittee are not acceptable. Matt Jarosz had earlier recommended a company that makes an assortment of grille designs. These have not been explored and should be. If not metal grilles then brick half walls. Matt Jarosz noted that mechanical ventilation is likely incorporated into the basement of the garage and could be extended to the upper decks. The committee is not satisfied with the design of the grilles, which are pivotal to the design of the structure.

We need to see more brick samples. The ones shown look too dark and are not of the quality of the buildings on Downer.

There are still design inconsistencies with the east wall and the other three elevations. We would like to see something other than stamped brick pattern, cast concrete on the east wall. The proposal for an irregular coping at the top of the east wall is not acceptable to the sub-committee. The preference is for a uniform, straight coping.

Where will the snow removal chute be located to clear the rooftop deck (if the rooftop deck remains)?

Where will the exterior mechanical systems be located? We need to see their placement. They should not be an afterthought.

Awnings should be not be of shiny vinyl but should be constructed of a matte finish, acrylic material.

The meeting ended at 5.30pm.

Meeting Date: June 27, 2007

Attending: Sandra McSweeney, Matt Jarosz and Pat Balon, HPC Commissioners
Bob Greenstreet, Vanessa Koster, Paul Jakubovich: DCD Staff

Absent: Scott Kindness, Workshop Architects

RE: HPC sub-committee meeting summary, DCD Commissioner's Conference Room

On May 14, 2007, the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) recommended conditional approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the proposed 4-story retail building and parking structure at 2974 North Downer Avenue. After recommending conditional approval of the COA, the HPC established a sub-committee to review and explore final details of the building design relative to the impact on the adjacent National historic district. The three items that were agreed to by HPC to further study were: the rooftop and internal lighting, the east building elevation, and the brick color on the west and north elevations.

Over the past month, there have been several sub-committee meetings where these items, in addition to other questions and concerns, have been discussed. The development team has explored and addressed each item and have made modifications to the building design. Following are the final discussion items and changes that have been agreed to by the sub-committee:

1. RETAIN TREE AND GREEN SPACE. The building footprint has been revised to keep the tree and some green space adjacent to the property on East Bellevue Ave.
2. EAST WALL LOCATION. The wall is now 11'6" further away from the property line at the northeast corner.
3. ROOFTOP LIGHT POLES. Both light poles will be removed.
4. NORTH VEHICULAR DRIVE ENTRANCE. The surface material at the garage entrance will be pervious. The return wall at the garage opening will have a surface wall treatment similar to the north elevation building materials.
5. BUILDING MATERIALS. Brick has been changed to scored and stained jade green concrete on the west, north and south elevations. Black granite will be used at the first floor bulk heads along the storefront windows.
6. EAST FACADE. While the committee suggested a continuous material at the rear façade, at this time, the east wall material of stained light red brick remains the same (along the portion of wall that is parallel to the property line), as the architect promised the neighbor. Staff will discuss the building material with the abutting property owner to determine if material change or color will be made to the rear wall.
7. GRILLES AT PARKING LEVELS. Grilles have been refined to custom, light blocking, ¼" thick aluminum panels with an additional top railing painted white.
8. PARAPET WALL. A parapet concrete wall has been added along all sides in lieu of a metal grille at the rooftop parking level.

9. DOWNER AVENUE PARKING ENTRANCE. The sub-committee suggested the addition of an awning over the entrance for continuity along the Downer Avenue façade.
10. WINDOWS. The sub-committee suggested that larger, wider window panes be used at the first floor retail areas. They also suggested exploring using a similar window mullion patterning on the northwest corner element, so there is a better relationship with the first floor and upper levels.
11. SNOW CHUTE. Architect to confirm location and that it is internal.
12. MECHANICALS. Architect to confirm location and that it is internal.

Upon receipt of a current set of drawings (site plan and building elevations), the COA will be issued based on the consensus of the sub-committee at this meeting. The architect will respond to Items 9 & 10 and confirm Items 11-13. After the issuance of the COA, the architect has agreed to continue to work with staff and the sub-committee. Material samples (Spancrete to provide about 18 different concrete samples with stains and metal grilles) will be provided for viewing. The sub-committee has also requested to see lighting and signage specifications. Sign permits will not be issued prior to staff review for conformance to zoning requirements.