



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 3/5/2018

Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114465 CCF #171654

Property 2451-57 N. TERRACE AV. & 2727-29 E. BRADFORD North Point North HD

Owner/Applicant TWO RPM LLC Kevin Rave
817 VENTURE CT 4th Dimension Design
WAUKESHA WI 53187 817 Venture Court
Waukesha, WI 53189
Phone: (262) 896-6500

Proposal Rehabilitation of house exterior, including stucco repair, cedar siding replacement, repair and replacement (as needed) of wood fascia, corbels, rafter tails, window trim and other existing architectural wood features consistent with the original architectural design. Replace all cladding shingles with new cedar shingles. Repair, replace stucco as needed, including in places that feature secondary siding (e.g., Bradford Avenue bay window). Remove inappropriate Spanish Baroque light fixtures. Enclose rear porch with materials to match existing (stucco and cedar shingle), relocate existing windows to new exterior walls.

Replace all gutters & downspouts. Replace all "flat roof" areas using copper, EPDM and TPO materials. Replace all roof-to-wall flashing. Repair and replacement of asphalt roof shingles as needed. Replace all chimney flashings. (Existing roof is 2 years old, but needs some repair). Replace existing horizontal bubble skylight with flat vertical skylight with collapsible safety railing.

Remodel 2 courtyard sides of Coach House to match the architectural design of the house. Remaining 2 sides of coach house are located 6" from the property line, therefore no combustible materials will be used on these walls, existing brick to remain. Enclose with brick panels.

Replace driveway (Bradford Ave entrance) with new concrete pavement. Repair and replace concrete stoops and walkways as needed. Revise exterior soil grades to correct existing problems with site drainage, water coming in basement.

Add new concrete driveway (Terrace Ave entrance). Revise grade and add small retaining wall.

Remove existing wood porch structure on south elevation due to significant rot at base. Reuse the primary wood timbers to build a new (similar) covered porch, east elevation at south end.

Add wrought iron fence around a portion of yard, primarily along Terrace Ave.

Staff comments **Overview**

Subject property contains a two-piece structure and a coachhouse that all have alterations proposed. The architectural pedigree is impressive with each part by renowned architects (Elmer Grey for the first part in 1901 and William Schuchardt in 1906). The two-story garage was built in 1911 with no architect listed.

It is exciting to see this property in the hands of a responsible, resident owner after decades of neglect; every part of this proposal is well intentioned. It is overall commendable, but certain portions merit substantial debate.

Staff comments**Main House***Main House Cladding*

Stuccowork and cladding repairs and replacement is acceptable as proposed. Remove inappropriate Spanish light fixtures.

Rear elevations

Substantial reconfiguration of the rear is proposed. Doors and windows will be eliminated, relocated, and replaced and the rear porch will be enclosed. The new layout for fenestration is better than existing and an honest attempt to create a period-accurate appearance. Proposed Marvin Ultimate Double Hung wood windows, simulated divided lite, appear to be an adequate match to the historic windows. Replacements are only proposed on the rear elevations.

Rear Porch Enclosure

Although not typically allowed, this is on a secondary elevation that has been substantially altered over the years, including extending the second story on top of the original porch roof. Given these factors and the planned reuse of windows, this may be acceptable.

Side Porch Relocation and New Driveway

This is being done to make the entry to the unit more obvious and to allow a second driveway along this elevation. Porch will be rebuilt on the street-facing elevation with a shed rather than a gable roof. Materials will be reused to the maximum extent feasible. Staff takes no position on this relocation. The new driveway would property on line Terrace Avenue frontage and this will require a small retaining wall that would be exceptionally close to the neighboring house. No comment has been received from any neighbors as of this writing.

Fence

Proposed powder-coated aluminum fence in black is acceptable. Staff recommends disallowing the flat cap option for both posts and pickets.

Skylight

Staff cannot recommend the proposed skylight. The skylight was installed prior to 1976 and is therefore legal, but it is not in a location that could be approved under current guidelines. While the new proposal is slightly better than the existing, it will be exceptionally out of place in the district, particularly with the safety railing detail when open. A small dormer in this location would be a better solution or a skylight could be installed on the opposite side of the roof.

Garage

Reconfiguration of entrances the ground level of the coach house should be approved along with the enclosure of several windows with herringbone brick as shown, on the condition that the herringbone is set behind the framing brick by half an inch to maintain a sense of depth. Staff does not believe creating the false front and re-cladding the building is consistent with the guidelines. The garage was likely designed as it was to indicate an appearance of fireproof construction and this would be an exceptional departure from the original design intent.

(Existing skylights are assumed to be part of the 1980 remodel of the upper floor.)

Conclusion:

Most work should be approved, but the following should be debated

1. Enclosure of rear porch
2. Relocation of side porch and creation of second driveway on Terrace
3. Skylight replacement
4. Recladding and false front on garage

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Deny new skylight
2. Approve fence requiring decorative caps for posts and pickets
3. Provide grading plan for staff approval upon completion of the plan.
4. Deny limited other items per Commission's decision

Standard Roof conditions: No dormers, chimneys, moldings or other permanent features will be altered or removed. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and sealed where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.

Standard Masonry conditions: New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before tuckpointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

**Previous HPC
action****Previous Council
action**