



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 8/1/2022
District: 3
Staff reviewer: Carlen Hatala
PTS #115296
CC File # 220454

Property	1307 E. BRADY ST.	Brady Street Historic District
Owner/Applicant	JC CAPITAL 1301 BRADY LLC 7451 N BEACH CT FOX POINT WI 53217	Kahler Slater Inc. Joe Sinnett 790 N. Water St. Suite 1700 Milwaukee, WI 53202 Phone: (414) 290-3796

Proposal The applicant proposes to add another deck and stairs to his property, Dorsia restaurant. This will be on the east side of Dorsia and plans show the deck extending from Dorsia to Jo-Cat's Pub, which the Cataldo family also owns. In 2021, the HPC approved a deck and stairs along the backside or south side of Dorsia.

Staff comments

Applicant owns Dorsia Restaurant that consists of two, two-story 1882 buildings joined in the middle by a one story structure built between 1895 and 1910. The interiors have been joined into one space on the first story and are currently used as a restaurant. Patricia Cataldo Income Trust owns Jo Cat's (1311-1313 E. Brady Street), a building that also figures into this Staff Report.

At the time Brady Street became a local historic district (1990) and a National Register Historic District (1990) the buildings referenced above retained their individual character as separate structures.

In 2017 Mr. Cataldo/ Patricia Cataldo added a second story deck to Jo-Cat's with recessed lower story to the east side of the building. The design made it look as if it joined Jo Cat's to the building to the south, Rochambo, although the deck is setback minimally from Rochambo. There are still orders on this deck since the details were never completed at the windows and posts.

In 2021, Mr. Cataldo received a COA for a rear deck on Dorsia, along the south wall of 1301 E. Brady. This COA did not include the deck on the east side of Dorsia.

The current proposal is to add a second deck with stairs to Dorsia, this time on the east side of the building. Drawings show the deck runs up to the sidewall of Jo-Cat's. And the new deck is being attached to the side wall of Jo-Cat's.

By the addition of this second, second-story deck between buildings the historic relationship between the buildings is obscured and visually begins to read as one long building of questionable historic character. The four buildings have become one. Historic preservation practice discourages the construction of additions that obscure the original "reading" of the historic property. It is also not the character of Brady Street to have second story additions with a void at the first story.

The upper level east wall of Dorsia is almost eliminated with a slider entry door and two large windows that will serve as a pass-through from the restaurant/bar inside.

To complicate matters construction was already in progress as observed on July 15, 2022. No permit was issued for this work and the review of the COA for this deck is scheduled for the August 1, 2022 HPC meeting. There was a permit issued for the rear deck at Dorsia.

Recommendation

Deny

The height (at the second story) and scale and relationship to the street are visually incompatible with the original buildings. This is inconsistent with the preservation guidelines for the streetscape. The prior side deck at Jo-Cat's was something of an experiment, considered a one-time project, that turned out not be a successful project visually and it remains unfinished.

Conditions

Should the HPC find the side deck appropriate in this instance, the second proposal submitted would be preferable. The second proposal does away with the full front wall and simply adds a balustrade. The balustrade needs to be beefier than the one over the one-story portion of Dorsia.

This poses a question. At the side deck on Jo-Cat's the front wall was requested as it was thought that inebriated customers would more easily fall off the deck if there were just a balustrade. It also screened the customers from the street. Why is this not a concern now?

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action