



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 11/4/2024
Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

Ald. Jackson
CCF # 240923

Property 2857-2859 N. Sherman Blvd. Sherman Boulevard Historic District

Owner/Applicant Jesse L. Lee & Henrietta Lee
2857-2859 N. Sherman Blvd.
Milwaukee, WI 53210

Proposal

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing 1921 20'x20' garage (see [CCF #240922](#)) and is proposing to construct a new 22'x24' garage largely within in the existing footprint of the current garage. The garage will have a hipped roof with 1' overhang and Owen Corning Oakridge shingles. The garage will have 8' tall walls with an overall height of 13'2". The garage is proposed to be clad with engineered wood LP SmartSide textured siding with 4-7/8" exposure. Trim is also proposed to be LP trim. An insulated steel raised panel garage door is proposed, along with a fiberglass 6-panel personnel door on the rear facade. The garage is proposed to have a 3' apron.

Staff comments

There are four criteria for new construction in the Sherman Park Historic District:

1. **Siting** - New construction along Sherman Boulevard must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in the district. This includes setbacks, spacing between buildings, and the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures.

While slightly larger, the new garage will be sited in roughly the same footprint as the existing garage. This is consistent with the existing garages in the alley. Code requires the garage be at least 4' from the property line, while the applicant is proposing a 3' setback. The smaller setback is consistent with historic garages in the historic district. Setbacks in this block of the historic district have setbacks ranging from zero to four feet. The existing garage is approximately two feet from the property line. The applicant would prefer a smaller setback to not reduce the size of their back yard. Staff recommends the garage be set back the required 4' to accommodate the required turning radius into the garage. The applicant has also requested a variance from BOZA.

2. **Scale** - Overall building height and bulk, the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof, and individual building components, such as overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the design of the structure.

The garage design and scale is compatible with historic garages in the historic district.

3. **Form** - The massing of new construction in close proximity to historic structures must be compatible with the neighboring buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.

The garage will have a rectangular form and hipped roof with 1' overhangs, which is similar to other garages in the historic district.

4. **Materials** - The building materials that are adjacent to historic buildings and visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials used in the district. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.

The majority of garages on this block are constructed of brick to match their primary structures. However, there are examples clad with stucco, board-and-batten wood siding, and aluminum siding. The proposed textured LP SmartSide would not be an appropriate siding in the historic district. Staff recommends exterior siding and trim be untreated wood clapboard or smooth fiber cement siding with a 6" or less exposure.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

Maintain a 4' setback for the garage from the alley right of way.

Exterior siding will be untreated wood clapboard or smooth fiber cement lap siding with a 6" or less exposure.

All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or treated with an opaque stain upon completion. Note: when new, bare wood is left exposed to the exterior elements for a period of only a week or two, the life the of the paint Living with History job subsequently applied to it will be decreased. The use of a decay-resistant wood for is required for porch areas. Using western white pine or Ponderosa pine is "at your own risk" because this wood has no natural decay resistance and can deteriorate in some exterior settings in just a few years.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action