



# City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street  
Milwaukee, Wisconsin  
53202

## Meeting Minutes HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**ALLYSON NEMEC, CHAIR**

**Matt Jarosz, Vice-Chair**

**Patricia Balon, Randy Bryant, Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann**

**Pieper Eisenbrown and Blair Williams**

**Staff Assistant, Chris Lee, 286-2232, Fax: 286-3456,**

**clee@milwaukee.gov**

**HPC Planners: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722, chatal@milwaukee.gov;**

**Paul Jakubovich, 286-5712, pjakub@milwaukee.gov**

---

Tuesday, May 8, 2012

3:00 PM

Room 301-B, City Hall

---

Meeting convened at 3:02 p.m.

### 1. Roll Call.

**Present:** 5 - Nemec, Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Bryant

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, Williams

**Individuals also present:**

**Carlen Hatala, Historic Preservation Commission Planner**

**Paul Jakubovich, Historic Preservation Commission Planner**

### 2. Review and Approval of the Previous Minutes of April 10, 2012.

*Ms. Balon moved approval, seconded by Mr. Bryant, of the minutes of April 10, 2012. There were no objections.*

### 3. [120036](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at St. Anthony's Roman Catholic Church, 1711 S. 9th Street, for the parish represented by Bernard Fenelon.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the proposal to build a new one story, flat roofed, limestone addition on the Mitchell Street side of St. Anthony's Roman Catholic Church. It will be approximately 18 feet by 7 feet 4 inches. It will be placed at the second bay in the front between two pilasters, clad in the same type of stone with same type of finish to match the church, and trimmed with stone moldings. The addition is being constructed to house an elevator for accessibility to the main level of the church with exit stairs. It will feature two, symmetrically placed, Gothic style windows, each trimmed at the top with a traditional label stop molding.*

*Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended approval based upon the staff report.*

*Appearing in support and representing the applicant:  
Kelly Thompson, Kon Text Architects, LLC*

*Ms. Nemec questioned why the preferred option, without the additional door and steps coming around, was chosen instead of another option?*

*Mr. Thompson said that cost and concern for families were the reasons. He added that there is the desire to put a larger lift to accommodate and provide the opportunity for other family members to enter the church when one family member was mobility impaired. A small lift mechanism was not accommodating to all and presence of stairs and landing would compete with accessibility.*

*Ms. Balon, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, moved approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at St. Anthony's Roman Catholic Church at 1711 S. 9th Street for the parish, represented by Bernard Fenelon, based upon staff recommendation. There were no objections.*

**A motion was made by Patricia Balon, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

**4.**      [120039](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new gateway trellis at the urban garden in Kilbourn/Reservoir Park Historic District, 701 E. Garfield Avenue, for Milwaukee Urban Gardens.

**Sponsors:**      THE CHAIR

*Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the proposal for construction of a small gateway trellis structure in the northwest corner of the urban garden in Kilbourn /Reservoir Park. Currently, there are raised garden beds that are part of the community garden. There is a five year lease for the community garden with the Water Department, which will end in 2015. The gateway structure will lead to the garden bends. It will be 4 feet by 8 feet and have a height of 8 or 9 feet. The structure will be made of peeled cider poles and branches, and it will reflect garden structures of the late 19th Century.*

*Mr. Jakubovich said there are concerns that the structure will deteriorate over time due to the wood material and that the park may be too small to allow for the structure to be open with the garden beds.*

*Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended acceptance of the structure with the conditions that the structure be maintained and reconsidered by the committee again when the lease has ended.*

*Ms. Balon asked if other materials were considered?*

*Mr. Jakubovich replied that the desire is for cider, sap wood from younger, smaller trees to show a weathered look. He added that the water department has permitted the*

*gateway structure to be built.*

*Mr. Bryant, seconded by Ms. Balon, moved approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new gateway trellis at the urban garden in Kilbourn/Reservoir Park Historic District at 701 E. Garfield Avenue for Milwaukee Urban Gardens based upon staff recommendation and conditions, as stated. There were no objections.*

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

5. [120064](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new south addition at 1101 E. Brady Street in the East Brady Street Historic District for Giuseppe Vella.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the proposal to build a new two story, masonry addition on the south elevation of the existing bakery. Two residential properties immediately south of the bakery were bought by the baker owner. The middle property will be demolished for the addition while the other one will be stored for family members. The middle house is not considered part of the historic district, and its demolition is not reviewable by committee. However, the addition to the bakery will make the middle property part of the historic district and is reviewable by the committee. The addition will look like a separate building next to bakery. It will be attached with one wall against the other, have a flat roof, and have two stories in front and one in the back. The second story is composed of a projecting bay window on one half of the elevation and a recessed, open air porch on the other half. The partial story will be living quarters for business family, and the lower unit will be a garage under the living quarters. The back end will be a bakery production facility.*

*Mr. Jakubovich said that staff would prefer for the garage doors to be recessed 4 feet from the façade in the front, as required by the zoning code, and that there would be the possibility for the owner to get a variance for a flushed front.*

*Mr. Jakubovich said that staff preferred to have the windows in the second story projecting bay a bit longer to better reflect the proportions of the original building. Their size was limited by the fact that kitchen cabinets are located beneath them on the interior. The architect did agree to make the ceilings taller on the second floor which did allow for some additional height to these windows. The windows should be made of wood.*

*Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended to accept the proposal as is with conditions as noted in the staff report.*

*Appearing in support and representing the applicant:*

*Giuseppe Vella, owner*

*Jeff Clausen, Ar'Ke Tek Cher, Inc.*

*Mr. Clausen said that the idea of being flush is possible as it would yield more space*

and be more acceptable. The bay window was created to give space and match other properties in the neighborhood. Reducing its size is an issue due to a kitchen cabinet and sink there. He added that there is a desire to proceed with the first floor project with the Board of Zoning Appeals (BOZA) process.

Mr. Jakubovich said that the new building will have red brick with tinting in mortar. There is no attempt to match the cream brick bakery building. Staff is happy with that concept, but would like to see narrower joints.

Mr. Bryant, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, moved approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new south addition at 1101 E. Brady Street in the East Brady Street Historic District for Giuseppe Vella based upon staff recommendation. There were no objections.

Mr. Bryant, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, moved that the brick joint size be reduced by half or be butter joints. There were no objections.

Ald. Bauman, seconded by Mr. Bryant, moved for staff to draft a letter of support relating to the change of footprint to pull the garage doors towards the street and for any detailing changes to be worked out with staff or come before the commission for review if necessary. There were no objections.

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

6. [120062](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new front porch at 2685 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Dennis Bloom.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave an overview on the proposal to construct a new, hip roofed front porch in the footprint of the original porch. The existing, non original front porch stoop and pediment from around the front door will be removed. The porch will feature a built in rain gutter, be made of wood, and have similar brackets as those of the roof on the main house. Railings have not been finalized. Staff will accept thick, square balusters that are spaced closely together and be 2 to 2 ½ inches square with a nicely built up handrail. The porch is tongue and grooved.

Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, recommended approval with the condition that drawings for the construction of the porch eave and built in gutters be submitted, reviewed, and approved by staff.

Paul Giesen, The Garrett Studio  
Dennis Bloom, owner

Mr. Bloom said cost was the reason for choosing square balusters instead of round ones.

*Ald. Bauman said he had experienced doing inexpensive pine balusters 2 inches square.*

*Mr. Bryant questioned the spacing of the balusters.*

*Mr. Giesen replied that the spindles will be keep tightly spaced, be oversized, be either turn or square balusters at least 2 ¼ or 2 ½ or 3 inches square in size, and keep the oversized theme of the house.*

*Mr. Bryant inquired about the size of the handrail and inclusion of a gripper.*

*Mr. Giesen said that the guard rail on the porch will be 2 x 6 equivalent top rail that will have a chattered top. A 5 or 7 piece top rail and bottom rail will be adequately sized and built. A hand rail going down the stairs will be installed to match code.*

*Mr. Bryant asked the reason for the base and pedestal being bumped out as opposed to going flat and straight across.*

*Mr. Giesen responded that due to the size of columns, the purposes are to hold the deck at the front edge just beyond the railing and prevent the columns from overhanging. The handrails can be centered on the square columns, which are 10 inch square. The columns are square to match the square pilasters at the corner of house.*

*Mr. Jakubovich said that staff prefers round columns, but they are more expensive.*

*Ms. Balon, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, moved approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new front porch at 2685 N. Lake Drive in the North Point North Historic District for Dennis Bloom with final detailing of the spindles, size and spacing, and columns, square or round, to be reviewed by staff.*

**A motion was made by Patricia Balon, seconded by Allyson Nemec, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

7. [120063](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a new bay window on the rear elevation at 2121 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point South Historic District for James Rappe.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

8. [120067](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new windows in buildings 20 and 21 at 1203-1215 N. 10th Street in the Pabst Brewery Historic District for Ted Matkow, agent for Brewery House LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

*Ms. Nemeec recused herself. There were no objections.*

*Mr. Jakubovich gave a summary on the proposal to install new metal windows at 1215 N. 10th St and two wood window replacements on either side of the main entry doors on N. 10th St. The building is at the heart of the brewery and is being renovated to become an extended stay hotel. The commission previously approved exterior renovations but no final decision was made on the type of replacement windows. Currently, the proposal is for metal windows with profiles to match the original windows. Flat aluminum infill panels are proposed to fill in the round tops of the windows.*

*Mr. Jakubovich, on behalf of staff, said the proposal cannot be approved at the staff level. Staff recommendations are to not fill in the round top windows with metal panels and to use wood windows for both street facing elevations. Wood windows will better retain the original character of the buildings and maintain the guideline of not using materials on the exterior that were unavailable when the building was constructed. The state and federal process will gladly accept wood for wood replacements, which should not cause any delay for the applicant.*

*Ald. Bauman was in opposition to the infilling of the upper level round windows with flat aluminum panels. He said the original design with arched window openings should remain.*

*Individuals appearing in support and representing the applicant:  
Ben Marshall, Goman & Company  
Allyson Nemeec, Quorum Architects, Inc.*

*Mr. Marshall said that he has worked with staff, the State Historic Preservation Office, and the National Park Service. This is a tax credit program. Aluminum window products and profiles have been processed. Aluminum tops will replace current wood tops, glazed tops will replace current glazed tops, and panels will replace current panels. Custom pieces will match the profiles of the old ones exactly. The Secretary of Interior Standards Preservation has approved the window packages. Other buildings on the campus have aluminum windows. The standards for the Brewery District references replacements to duplicate the design and appearance of the old as closely as possible and does not reference wood for wood material. Cost of potentially using wood is not an issue currently, but long term maintenance is a concern with using wood materials. There is a timeline to follow regarding the replacement and infilling of the windows with aluminum.*

*Ms. Nemeec said that the standards of the Brewery District are unclear and do not reference use of wood for wood. She added that the National Park Service has allowed for the use of metal.*

*Ms. Balon said she did not approve of the aluminum material as it would take away the original material of the arched windows. The issue of metal windows should have been addressed prior to ordering pieces.*

*Mr. Bryant said all projects within the Pabst campus are wood with the exception of*

*one. He added that the Commission needs to stay consistent and look at the whole campus rather than an individual building.*

*Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown said that there exists some assurance that the new profiles will be accurate to the originals with the National Park Service's approval.*

*Ald. Bauman moved approval, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown, of a Certificate of Appropriateness for new wood windows on the first three stories on the street facing elevations and aluminum windows on the upper two stories with no infilling in the round, arched windows. Mr. Bryant and Ms. Balon objected. (Failed 2-2)*

*Ms. Balon said that the matter should be held to allow other commissioners to participate.*

*Ald. Bauman moved to hold in committee. (Prevailed 4-0-1)*

**A motion was made by ALD. BAUMAN that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Balon, Bryant, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

**Abstain:** 1 - Nemec

## 9. Announcements and Updates.

*Mr. Jakubovich announced that a dedication ribbon cutting event was held for the completed renovated of home in Garden Homes District and was well attended. He added that photos would be provided at the next meeting.*

*Ms. Hatala announced that there will be a Vernacular Architecture Forum (VAF) Conference in Madison from June 6 – 10, 2012. Email information is [vaf@union.wisc.edu](mailto:vaf@union.wisc.edu).*

*Ms. Nemec announced that there will be a Historic Milwaukee Inc. Tour in the Historic Concordia Neighborhood on May 19, 2012. A reception honoring the preservationist of the year, Ald. Bauman, will be held.*

*Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown inquired on the commission's participation in the preservation of the Eschweiler buildings on Milwaukee County Grounds in Wauwatosa.*

*Ms. Hatala suggested for the commission to draft a letter on the matter.*

*Ald. Bauman responded that the commission should not draft a letter since it is a City of Wauwatosa matter.*

## 10. The Following Files Represent Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

*Mr. Bryant moved approval, seconded by Ms. Balon, of the Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness. There were no objections.*

- a. [120002](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for raising the foundation at the northeast corner of the house at 2217 N. Sherman Blvd. for the City of Milwaukee.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- b. [120003](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a fence and deck and work on the front porch at 808 E. Brady Street for Matthew Anchor.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- c. [120019](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for work on the front porch at 3402 W. St.. Paul Avenue for the City of Milwaukee.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- d. [120020](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to rebuild the chimney at 3209 W. Wells Street for Rick and Laura Sue Mosier.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- e. [120021](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior repairs at 1813-1815 N. 1st Street for Wesley and Amy Miles.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- f. [120038](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing of window signage at 225 E. Michigan Street for David Paris.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- g. [120052](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new garage doors at 2635 N. Terrace Avenue for Dewey Caton and Patrick Schmidt.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- h. [120054](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new roof at 2565 N. Grant Blvd. for Mrs. Barnett.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

- i. [120065](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new store fronts at 2632, 2634 and 2636 N. Downer Avenue in the Downer Avenue Historic District for Downer Delaware, LLC.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Randy Bryant, seconded by Patricia Balon, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Balon, Bryant, Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Williams

**Meeting adjourned at 4:55 p.m.**

**Chris Lee, Staff Assistant**

**This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.**