



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 08/07/2023

**District: 15, Ald. Stamper
Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern
CC File # 230459**

Property 2536 N. Grant Blvd. Grant Boulevard Historic District

Owner/Applicant Stephan Thomas JM Remodeling
2536 N. Grant Blvd. 7701 N. Teutonia Ave.
Milwaukee, WI 53210 Milwaukee, WI 53209

Proposal During a recently approved roof replacement project, the asbestos abatement sub-contractor mistakenly removed the asbestos siding on the second story gables. The applicants are proposing replacing the missing siding with either a fiber cement shake shingle or vinyl shake single.

Staff comments The Edward W. Haymaker House was designed by Alexander C. Eschweiler and constructed in 1921. Eschweiler's original plans for the house specify a stucco finish for the gables on the house, though there is no photographic evidence stucco was applied when the house was constructed. A permit pulled in 1935 to replace the gable shingles with asbestos siding indicates that the house may have been constructed with wood shingles in the gables rather than stucco. Additionally, the contractor removing the asbestos siding found imprints of shingles in the underlayment behind the asbestos siding.

The Grant Boulevard guidelines recommend avoiding "new materials that are inappropriate or were unavailable when the building was constructed." The vinyl and fiber cement shingles are not appropriate replacement siding materials within the historic district. Staff recommends the siding in the second story gables is replaced with either genuine stucco (no panels or EIFS) per the original Eschweiler plans or with painted/stained cedar shingles per the pre-1935 appearance.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Denial. Commission can elect to allow staff approval of the true stucco or cedar shingles under a new application.

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action