



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 9/1/2020**  
**Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6**  
**Staff reviewer: Tim Askin**  
**PTS #115003 CCF #200531**

<b>Property</b>	1823 N. PALMER ST.	Brewers Hill
<b>Owner/Applicant</b>	STEPHEN J BIALK ANGELA DUCKERT 1823 N PALMER ST MILWAUKEE WI 53212	Steve Bialk 1823 N. Palmer St Milwaukee, WI 53212 Phone: (414) 640-6003

### Proposal

Connect all buildings on the property by inserting two new connector structures along the alley. One building is a very simple one story true connector that will feature plumbing and an open roof deck. It is will be 8'6" by 17'6". The second structure is 2-1/2 stories with a large open balcony at the front of the second floor.

### Staff comments

Staff believes this proposal has reached the point of "too much" on this site, in addition to specific concerns stemming from the Brewers Hill new construction guidelines.

The Brewers Hill guidelines raise major issues with this new construction.

**Siting:** *New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in Brewer's Hill. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings. New buildings should not obstruct the vistas from the street to the house.*

The proposal eliminates the spacing of building on the property. What has allowed the complex to work reasonably well under this guideline so far is the separation of the buildings. While the Main house has been extended all the way to the alley line, it is mostly in line with the main house. The various extra buildings to the south have remained separate so far and need to continue to do so. With this addition the reasonably traditional siting will cease to exist.

**Scale:** *Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.*

The new proposals are in the same rustic style as prior approvals but overwhelm their surroundings in their height and proportions. Ganged windows are spaced too closely and individual windows have odd spacing. Windows in Brewers Hill and on this Italianate style of house have a very consistent spacing and rhythm.

**Form.** *The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.*

Connecting everything discards the continuity of multiple pieces because the neighborhood is known for its tight spacing of both grand and modest homes. The proposal creates an enormous L-shaped building that lacks precedent in form.

**Materials:** *The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in Brewer's Hill.*

The materials are in line with the prior approvals at the property. Vertical board and batten is combined with wood windows and asphalt or patterned metal roofs. There are no concerns here.

**Recommendation** Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions** If approved, 6" mullions shall be required between any bands of windows.

**Previous HPC  
action**

**Previous Council  
action**